

Public Personnel Review

OCTOBER, 1961

What the Personnel Man Should Know About Organization

Putting Perspective into Suggestion Systems

Democracy and Revolution in Puerto Rico

Public Service and Understanding

The Challenge of a Career in the Public Service

Public Personnel Literature: The Last Decade

A Basic Bibliography in Public Personnel Administration

Making the Most of Campus Recruiting

Labour Relations in Canadian Municipalities

Administrative Adjudication in New York State

What Is a Desirable Policy on the Interchange of Personnel?

Personnel Literature . . . The Bookshelf

Around the Personnel World . . . Annual Index

Journal of the Public Personnel Association

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

The Journal of the Public Personnel Association

1313 E. 60th Street

Chicago 37, Ill nois

EDITORIAL STAFF

KENNETH O. WARNER, *Editor*
J. J. DONOVAN, *Managing Editor*
SADIE J. DOYLE, *Editorial Assistant*

EDITORIAL BOARD

CHARLES A. MEYER, *Assistant Secretary and Chief Examiner, Detroit, Michigan, Civil Service Commission*
GESSNER A. BROWN, *Personnel Director, City of Toledo, Ohio*
CARL H. BUTLER, JR., *Personnel Officer, Mississippi Employment Security Commission*
JOSEPH A. CONNOR, *Regional Director, Seventh U. S. Civil Service Region, Chicago*
JOHN D. FOSTER, *Personnel Director, Port of New York Authority*
J. STANLEY FRAZER, *Director of Personnel, State of Alabama*
WAYNE L. HIGBEE, *Personnel Director, Santa Monica, California, Personnel Department*
WILLIAM E. MCCARTHY, *Deputy Personnel Director, Port of New York Authority*
B. H. PETERSON, *Personnel Director, City of Vancouver, B. C.*
HARRY F. SMITH, *Director of Personnel, New York State Department of Labor, Division of Employment*
WILLIAM B. WEBSTER, *Senior Personnel Analyst, Trustee of the California State College*

EDITORIAL CONSULTANTS

JAMES M. MITCHELL, *Director, Conference Program on Public Affairs, The Brookings Institution*
ROLLIN B. POSEY, *Managing Director, College Department, Row, Peterson & Company*
DON K. PRICE, *Dean, Graduate School of Public Administration, Harvard University*
FOSTER B. ROSER, *Personnel Director, Philadelphia Personnel Department*
ED SHELLEY, *Personnel Director, Tennessee Valley Authority*
O. GLENN STAHL, *Director, Programs & Standards Bureau, U.S. Civil Service Commission*
PAUL VAN RIPER, *Professor of Administration, Cornell University*

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October, by the Public Personnel Association, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois. U. S. and Canada subscription rates, \$6.50 per year; foreign \$7.50 per year; single copies, \$2.00, in advance. Second class postage paid at Chicago, Illinois, and at additional mailing offices.

POSTMASTER: Send Form 3579 to Public Personnel Review, 1313 East 60th St., Chicago 37, Ill

CONTENTS

| | PAGE |
|---|------|
| What the Personnel Man Should Know About Organization John J. Corson | 209 |
| Putting Perspective into Suggestion Systems James R. Bell | 214 |
| Democracy and Revolution in Puerto Rico Luis Muñoz-Marín | 218 |
| Public Service and Understanding John W. Macy, Jr. | 221 |
| The Challenge of a Career in the Public Service Brian MacBride | 224 |
| Public Personnel Literature: The Last Decade Paul P. Van Riper | 226 |
| A Basic Bibliography in Public Personnel Administration | 232 |
| Making the Most of Campus Recruiting Robert J. Batson and Eleanor R. Batson | 249 |
| Labour Relations in Canadian Municipalities George W. Noble | 255 |
| Administrative Adjudication in New York State H. M. Engel | 262 |
| Around the Personnel World— | |
| Personnel Administration in Turkey James M. Clinton | 265 |
| Personnel Opinions | 269 |
| "Is it desirable, as a matter of policy, to enable public employees to work for other governmental jurisdictions for a limited period of time on a leave of absence basis?" | |
| The Bookshelf | 278 |
| "Elements of Managerial Action" . . . "Supervisors in Action" . . . "Executive Retirement and Effective Management" . . . Book and Pamphlet Notes. | |
| Personnel Literature | 284 |
| Index | 291 |

Public Personnel Review

The quarterly journal of the Public Personnel Association provides a medium for the publication of factual material and for materials that may represent divergent ideas, judgments, and opinions. The views expressed in articles and other contributions are those of the authors and may not be construed as reflecting the views of the Association or the editors unless so stated.

Subscription Rates. U. S. and Canada, \$6.50 per year; foreign, \$7.50; single copies, \$2.00, in advance. Prices on back issues quoted on request.

All correspondence regarding manuscripts, subscriptions, and advertising should be addressed to the editorial and business offices of *Public Personnel Review*, Room 456, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois.

Needed: A Public Personnel Rationale

TODAY, as never before, our field needs a clearly stated rationale deeply rooted in the personal understanding of all of us engaged in public personnel administration. Time and time again we are confronted with questions that challenge our ability to explain what we are doing—not only to others, but often to ourselves. For example: Why is this personnel policy good or bad? Why is a particular procedure necessary? Why do we have a service rating system? Why not promote exclusively on a seniority basis? The trite response, "It's in the law and rules," rarely of itself reflects the underlying rationale in a self-evident way.

Elsewhere in this issue discussing personnel literature, Paul P. Van Riper makes a telling point. After noting the proliferation of recent literature on the technical aspects of personnel, he says that the traditional literature in our field has tended to treat personnel management as a group of disparate functions rather than a systematic, coherent whole.

Is this a polite way of suggesting that too many of us in the public personnel field fail to see the trees, let alone the forest—that too many of us are preoccupied with viewing the landscape through our own personal knotholes? This is not a rhetorical question, but a very practical one which every career personnel man should answer for himself.

The personnel practitioner who, by choice or circumstance, becomes a specialist should not close his eyes and mind to what's going on outside his particular field of specialty. Quite to the contrary, he becomes a better specialist when he consciously develops "wide-angle vision," and is alert to the way in which his own specialty fits into the ra-

tionale of the field as a whole. It goes without saying, of course, that the personnel administrator must develop and maintain "wide-angle vision" as a basic administrative skill.

The real question is: How does one acquire a rationale? It won't come simply from osmosis. It calls for planned, personal effort, persistently applied.

From Professor Van Riper's penetrating analysis, we can infer certain guides to follow. Granted, there is no Arnold Toynbee of public personnel administration in the United States today. Until that time arrives, each person concerned with public personnel must serve as his own catalyst and synthesist. Each needs to turn his professional interest, not only inward and downward, but outward and upward. We must maintain a balance between professional introversion and professional extraversion.

No better start could be made than with the *Basic Bibliography in Public Personnel Administration* that appears in this issue. How many of us can truthfully say that we have even a nodding acquaintance with more than a fraction of the whole? How often have we traced the impact of our own activities far afield to understand their influence in shaping the end product? How often have we sought out the professional colleague in another specialized field and discovered to our mutual amazement how interdependent we are on each other?

The typical personnel man of tomorrow, we fondly hope, will be one who not only has a mastery of techniques, but is also one who is constantly aware of the need for purposeful direction of his skills.

Meet the Authors

● **Eleanor R. Batson**, co-author of *Making the Most of Campus Recruiting*, was, for a number of years, PPA's Director of Publications and Managing Editor of *Public Personnel Review*. Since her husband's move to Kalamazoo, Michigan, she has been a free-lance editor and writer. She served as overall editor of the revision of *Municipal Personnel Administration*, the training text of the International City Managers' Association, and prepared eleven of the thirteen chapters. She recently assisted PPA on the project "Recruitment for the Public Service" which the Association conducted for the Municipal Manpower Commission.

● **Robert J. Batson**, co-author of *Making the Most of Campus Recruiting*, once served PPA as a Personnel Analyst. He is now an Assistant Professor in the Political Science Department of Western Michigan University and teaches courses in public administration and state and local government.

● **James R. Bell**, author of *Putting Perspective into Suggestion Systems*, is Professor of Government and head of the public administration programs at Sacramento State College. Before joining the college in 1957, he was Assistant Executive Officer of the California State Personnel Board. In 1948-1949 he served as a civilian consultant in the reorganization of the Japanese civil service. Dr. Bell has contributed to *Public Personnel Review*, *Public Administration Review*, and the Inter-University Case Study Program; he has written monographs on state government organization and essays on metropolitan area problems. He was active in the establishment of California's suggestion system and served on the Merit Award Board.

● **James M. Clinton**, author of *Personnel Administration in Turkey* in the Around the Personnel World section, is a Public Administration Advisor for the United States Operation Mission to Turkey (ICA). Stationed in

Ankara since December 1956, his "home base" is a management improvement program in Turkey's equivalent of the Bureau of Reclamation, but he has participated in management activities in many Turkish agencies. Prior to going to Turkey he was associated with Louis J. Kroeger and Associates in a position classification and salary survey of the Philippine Government and is a former Director of Civil Service for the State of Oregon. Mr. Clinton says his article was written to inform other USOM staffers about personnel administration in Turkey and that at their suggestion he submitted the article for publication.

● **John J. Corson**, author of *What the Personnel Man Should Know About Organization*, is Managing Director of the Washington Office of McKinsey & Company, Inc., International Management Consultants. After ten years as a federal executive, he has been in private business for ten years. During this period he has written extensively on problems of personnel and public administration, has served as President of the American Society for Public Administration, and has consulted on a large number of studies of public organization.

● **Herbert M. Engel**, author of *Administrative Adjudication in New York State*, has been engaged in the field of public employee training since 1957. Presently Assistant Director of Public Employee Training, Training Section, New York State Department of Civil Service, he was for some eleven years prior to 1957 responsible for the administration of the job training program for veterans in New York State, serving as Director of the Bureau of On-the-Job Training in the State Labor Department. He has written several articles on training, one of which, "A Practical Guide to On-the-Job Training," produced for the New York State Department of Commerce, has been given wide circulation by the Dartnell Corporation. Trained as a teacher, Mr. Engel holds

degrees from State Teachers College, Albany, and the University of Wisconsin. He is the past president of the Hudson-Mohawk Training Directors Society.

● **Brian MacBride**, author of *The Challenge of a Career in the Public Service*, is a 17-year-old student at Richview Collegiate Institute in Etobicoke, Ontario, Canada. His essay published here won the top award in an essay contest conducted by the Metropolitan Toronto Chapter of the Public Personnel Association in joint sponsorship with the Association's Eastern Regional Conference.

● **John W. Macy, Jr.**, author of *Public Service and Understanding*, is Chairman of the U. S. Civil Service Commission. Widely known throughout the public administration and personnel fields, Mr. Macy first entered government service in 1938 with the Social Security Board. He later held key posts with the Department of the Army and the Atomic Energy Commission and served as Executive Director of the U. S. Civil Service Commission from 1953 to 1958. Prior to his appointment as Chairman by President Kennedy in January, 1961, Mr. Macy was Executive Vice President of Wesleyan University, Middletown, Connecticut. A former president of the American Society for Public Administration, he has received special honors for his accomplishments in the field of public personnel administration from such organizations as the National Civil Service League, the U. S. Civil Service Commission, the Society for Personnel Administration, the Department of the Army, and AMVETS.

● **Luis Muñoz-Marín**, author of *Democracy and Revolution in Puerto Rico*, is Governor of the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico; his present term, beginning in January, 1961, is his fourth. Educated in public and private schools in Puerto Rico, he attended Georgetown Preparatory School and Georgetown University in Washington, D. C. The public offices held by Governor

Muñoz date back to 1916-1918 when he was Secretary to the Resident Commissioner of Puerto Rico at Washington, D. C. He became a member of the Puerto Rican Senate in 1932 and was president of that body from 1941 to 1948. An editor, publisher, and journalist from 1918 to 1948, he is also the founder of the Puerto Rico Popular Democratic Party. Governor Muñoz was awarded the PPA Award for Merit in 1960.

● **George W. Noble**, author of *Labour Relations in Canadian Municipalities*, is Personnel Officer for the Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto, a position he has occupied since the inception of the Metropolitan Corporation in 1953. Prior to 1953, he was employed with the City of Toronto, initially in the City Clerk's Department, latterly as a senior officer of the Personnel Department. He has acted as co-director of the University of Toronto Extension Department course in municipal administration and as a lecturer on personnel and labour relations.

● **Paul P. Van Riper**, author of *Public Personnel Literature: The Last Decade*, is Professor of Administration at Cornell University's Graduate School of Business and Public Administration. Public personnel administration has been one of his long-time, major interests, in capacities varying from academician to civil servant, lieutenant colonel in the Army, and researcher. His introduction to the subject was as a graduate student research assistant to the Public Personnel Association in 1939-1941; he has been a member of the Association for over twenty years and is presently an editorial consultant to the *Review*. Dr. Van Riper has taught at Northwestern University and George Washington as well as Cornell, and completed his Ph.D. at the University of Chicago. He is the author of *History of the United States Civil Service* (1958) and of numerous articles and other publications in the fields of American government and politics, public administration, and civil-military relations.

then he
missioner
C. He
an Sen-
at body
blisher,
is also
Popular
oz was
a 1960.

our Re-
is Per-
ity of
he has
e Met-
rior to
City of
Depart-
of the
ted as
oronto
micipal
person-

ic Per-
s Pro-
Univer-
s and
nel ad-
-time,
from
colo-
intro-
aduate
c Per-
e has
over
itorial
Riper
y and
l, and
ty of
of the
nd of
ons in
and
civil-

What the Personnel Man Should Know About Organization

John J. Corson

Organizational planning, to be effective, must be exhumed from the textbooks and given new life as a vital force in personnel administration.

IN THE comic pages recently, one of the "Peanuts" characters devoted his daily contribution to human enlightenment to the problem of organization. This sage and beguiling lad told one of his equally youthful and innocent-looking pals that the trouble with their ball team was that it wasn't organized, and he added that he was going to do something about it. He was going to list each fellow's name on this sheet of paper and then he was going to put down the position he plays. "If that isn't organization," he concluded, "I don't know what is."

Without wanting to be unkind, particularly to such a widely read authority as "Peanuts," I must suggest that the speaker in this instance just doesn't know what organization is. But to soften my discourteous challenge, let me suggest that many a personnel man holds a similarly naive view of what organization is.

Most personnel men, I am sure, are aware of the axioms of organization that are to be found in textbooks, such as: "Like activities should be associated"; "Duties and responsibilities should be delegated with the chain of delegation as short as practicable"; and "Each position should be subject to the line authority of only one higher position." But knowing these axioms, I submit, the personnel man should know much more about organization if he is to be effective in his own job.

What more should he know? He should know—as he really does—that the principles of organization we have inherited from the first quarter of this century deal only with

the mechanistic and static aspects of organization. An organization is never a collection of lifeless boxes outlined in black on white paper. It is always a group—small or large—of different, contrary, stubborn, some bright and some dull human beings; and when I speak of organization in those terms, surely I suggest that the personnel man has a part in organizational planning.

A New View of Organization

Considering the sterile nature of long-established axioms of organization, it is fortunate that a number of people not directly concerned with organization are busy-ing themselves with how people get along together in a business, in a bureau, in a hospital, or in an air wing. These people include Alexander Leighton, an anthropologist; Talcott Parsons, a sociologist; Rensis Likert, a psychologist; Wight Bakke and Ken Boulding, economists; and Ed Litchfield, a political scientist.

In summary they suggest to the personnel man who would think about organization that, in addition to the traditional axioms, he should consider four more elements. Here they are:

1. The value system of the group
2. The adaptive mechanisms
3. The operative code
4. The ecology of the enterprise.

I use these terms neither to confuse, nor to impress you. I am using the authors' own terms in frank admission of my wanton borrowing of their ideas. My contribution will be the restatement in my own words of how I would apply these ideas in the analysis of any organization.

Editor's Note: This paper was presented by the author at the Public Personnel Association's 1960 International Conference on Public Personnel Administration, New York City, October 23-27, 1960.

The Value System

Just as there is a difference between a house and a home, there is a difference between a horde of individuals and an organization. But where does one look for evidence as to the degree of organization that exists among a group of human beings?

Look for Objectives. This question is not difficult to answer. Look for the objectives of the enterprise. Look for them in formal written statements or in the statements of a chief executive; in the latter form they may be just as effective—or more so—as those found in neatly embellished policy documents.

All of us can call to mind numerous examples of companies or of governmental agencies that have floundered because they had no clear sense of direction. On the other hand, we can point to companies that have succeeded notably because they set a clear course and stuck to it.

The *why* of this essentiality of objectives is illustrated by another statement of the eminent comic-strip philosopher in "Peanuts." Standing in a limitless field of high grass over which he could not see, he said: "I don't mind playing out here in right field, but I would like to know that I am facing in the right direction." So it is with most of us. A clearly stated objective provides not only direction, but provides an automatic means of coordination and an important element of security for members of the group.

Creating Understanding. The mere existence of goals is not enough. If the organization is to be effective, its members must understand and believe in the goals. *It is the understanding of people, at every echelon, that is the prime test as to whether carefully etched-out goals do in fact bind human beings into an effective organization.*

For the personnel man, this simply means that communication, a matter with which he has long been concerned, is an essential element of organization.

Relating Personal Goals. Chester Barnard added a related insight as to organization more than twenty years ago. He pointed out that individuals fit into an organiza-

tion unqualifiedly only when they can see that the organization's goals are consistent with their own.

To weld a group of people into an organization is to enable each or most individuals to see that they can fulfill their varying personal goals—be they to make money, to make a name, to gain security, or to perform that sort of work that is satisfying to them—by contributing to the achievement of the organization's goals.

Who is better equipped to appraise this element of the organization than the personnel man?

The Adaptive Mechanisms

The second of the four elements of organization that I attribute to my adopted, theoretical god-parents, whom I named earlier, was termed the "adaptive mechanisms." All this fancy term means is that if a group of people are to function as an organization, even as eleven men wearing helmets function as a football team, they must be capable of changing their course when it is required.

The change in course of a business organization may be required by a merger, by the establishment of a new product line, or by declining fortunes.

A good organization is flexible. It can modify its structure and goals and change directions for its people as problems change. Ernest R. Breech, Chairman of the Board of the Ford Motor Company, once told the Harvard Business Conference (June 11, 1955) that: "If the organism is permitted to sit still long, it begins to develop hardening of the arteries, shortness of breath, and atrophy of the imagination."

The paroxysms that the Department of Defense suffered two years ago when it was reorganized illustrated the difficulties of ensuring such flexibility. The vast change in the strength and intent of potential enemies and in the potential devastation of new weapons made organizational change essential. But established agencies and their supporting constituencies made organizational change incomparably difficult.

To gain this flexibility—the ability to adapt—on the one hand, and the definiteness of clearly defined jobs, spelled-out relation-

ships, and specific lines of authority on the other, is a neat trick. Human beings find a consoling measure of security in the certainty of a precisely spelled-out organization, yet thinking people rebel against inflexible organization that acts as a strait jacket!

How does one build such flexibility into an organization? I can suggest four ways; no doubt there are others, but these will illustrate what is needed:

1. If the top executive is provided with a strong comptroller or other staff agencies that persistently appraise what is going on and suggest change, flexibility can be a continuing characteristic of the enterprise.
2. The "executive committee" of an enterprise (the bureau director and his top echelon in a federal agency) will sometimes (but not always) be able to detach itself, objectively appraise accomplishments, and agree on new directions.
3. The board of directors of the private enterprise, and more often the Appropriations Committee of Congress for the public agency, will question what is being done and force change.
4. The annual salesmen's meeting in private enterprise or the annual regional directors' meeting in a federal agency, if these colleagues from the field are encouraged to "speak up," can serve as an effective and constructive agent for inducing flexibility.

The Operative Code

Most organizations have what the authors I referred to earlier described as an "operative code." It is usually unwritten and even unformulated, but it is nevertheless a code that governs the way the enterprise uses its people to attain its ends. The codes of military organizations establish an authoritarian relationship between the people that make up the organization. The value of such a code in welding a group of human beings together in cooperative endeavor is eloquently shown in the motion picture *The Bridge on the River Kwai*.

In the typical university, deeply entrenched traditions form a code that assures

teachers academic freedom and a large degree of independence. Hence, the faculty in many institutions suffers the existence of a president or a chancellor and grants him freedom only to raise money, cultivate the institution's public relations, and to keep the buildings clean. And the president accepts his role and consults with his faculty through organisms that it establishes!

To focus our attention on why one must learn the code that prevails within an enterprise if he is really to understand the organization of an enterprise, I would like to tell a brief story about an insurance salesman and the chairman of the board of that insurance company. I talked with the chairman one evening in his apartment in New York about the kind of an educational system this country should have. We agreed with enthusiasm that this country must have an educational system in which every individual—the day laborer's son as well as the son of a multi-millionaire—is encouraged, even forced, to develop his fullest individual capabilities.

I then asked whether an individual company didn't likewise have an obligation—to provide an opportunity for each individual to develop his capabilities. He heartily agreed, and then I told him of an experience I had had with his own insurance company. My mother had asked me to purchase an annuity for her. I called the local office of the company and an eager, young man called on me. We arranged the purchase with dispatch, and I endorsed a check that my mother had made out to me and gave it to him.

As this bright-eyed, bushy-tailed young fellow left the room, I could visualize the pride with which he would tell his wife that evening of the sale he had made. But in an hour's time, he called to ask if he could come back to see me. When he did, it was to tell me that he could not accept the check I had handed him. I asked why. He explained that it was against the company's rules to accept a check that was endorsed. My mother had left town, and it would have been difficult, if at all possible, to obtain another check. I was irked and wanted to know why this was against the company's rules. He answered, "I don't know." Then he suggested that I call the local office

manager. When I did, he too said that he didn't know why. "It's just the company's rules," he explained.

This story emphasizes that the science of organization, as is personnel administration, is dedicated to the basic goal of seeing that each individual is encouraged to use his own intelligence and imagination to the maximum.

Whether an enterprise does or does not utilize each individual to the fullest depends in many instances on the unwritten (or written) code that prevails among executives and workers alike within the enterprise. The prevailing code at many a railroad or a newspaper has been established by the unions and acquiesced in by the management; it ensures that each worker will *not* be utilized to the fullest. In some companies the prevailing code is set by the president whose impatience and merciless criticism over the years dictates that individuals do not venture their own opinions; they say "Yes," and live.

Members of our Foreign Service are a well-disciplined, well-tailored lot. They can be relied upon to handle a variety of situations tactfully and very much like their colleagues would on the other side of the world—but not venturesomely. Members of the Forest Service are similarly well disciplined; all are trained as foresters, all are accustomed to living in the open and, even in Washington—at least in the summer—they refuse to wear a coat or a tie. But more important, they are disciplined to speak their minds—and they do.

The code, usually unwritten—not a manual or organization chart—determines, in fact, the extent to which authority is delegated and how its exercise is coordinated. And this I know: the delegation of authority goes to the heart of the personnel job.

The Ecology of Organization

Now let us turn to the fourth element of organization I have referred to—the ecology of organization. All too often students of organization have myopically concerned themselves only with *internal* structure. Chester Barnard puzzled many students more than twenty years ago when in *The Functions of the Executive* he wrote of or-

ganization as comprehending the customers of an enterprise.

Surely this should not have been a novel idea for students of public administration. The close and essential relationship of a governmental organization and its constituency is exemplified almost daily—by the kinship of such twins as the American Legion and the Veterans Administration; the Association of State Highway Superintendents and the Bureau of Public Roads; the parents, women's, and welfare organizations and the Children's Bureau; and the NEA and the American Council on Education and the Office of Education.

Nor is it a novel idea that the effectiveness of many business firms depends not only on the organization that is shown on the organization plan, but on the more extensive organization that includes a network of suppliers, the financiers on whom the business relies, and at least the more influential customers. Let me suggest a few illustrations. The Curtiss-Wright jet engine program was utterly dependent on its suppliers; the production of a jet engine, they say, is as a watchmaker's trade in which they are simply putting together parts made by suppliers. Other business firms are guided very intimately by their bankers; I suspect Studebaker-Packard is an instance at the moment. Still other businesses exist to serve one or two customers and every facet of their operations is influenced by the wishes of the principal or dominating customer.

Summary

An oft repeated criticism of the personnel man is that he is too much concerned with forms and processes, and too little with human beings. He is too much concerned with application forms, performance rating blanks, with ceilings, with programs and exit interviews, and too little with people. Not long ago, I heard a certain personnel office referred to as "a paper-shuffling shop."

So it is with organization. Organizational planning is what the textbooks say it is. It involves the definition of jobs, the spelling out of relationships, and the fixing of clear, short lines of authority. But organizational planning is more than this. It has to do with a going, not a static, concern; and to plan

1961
tomers
novel
ration.
of a
nstitu-
y the
merican
ration;
Super-
Roads;
aniza-
d the
Educa-
ective-
ls not
wn on
re ex-
net-
whom
more
a few
engine
s sup-
they
which
made
guided
inspect
t the
serve
et of
wishes
er.
onnel
with
with
erned
rating
and
ople.
onnel
hop."
ional
is. It
elling
clear,
ional
with
plan

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

for the effective working together of a going group of people, we must supplement the old tried-and-true axioms of organization with a few new ones. When we consider

what these newly recognized elements of organization are, we see that these are the substance of what the personnel man should know—and probably does.

How to Order Reprints

The publisher does not stock reprints of articles appearing in *Public Personnel Review*. Reprints can be purchased, however, directly from the printer in quantities of 100 or more.

ORDER DEADLINES. The *Review* is published quarterly in January, April, July, and October. Type for each issue is discarded one month after publication, and the printer cannot fill reprint orders after that time. In other words, the deadlines on ordering reprints are as follows: January issue—February 28; April issue—May 30; July issue—August 31; October issue—November 30.

REPRINT COSTS. The minimum charge for reprints is for 100 copies; additional quantities are at a substantially lower rate. Shipping charges are extra. The printer's reprint price schedule is as follows:

| Length of Reprint | First | Additional |
|----------------------|----------|------------|
| | 100 | 100's |
| 4 pages or less..... | \$21.75* | \$1.20 |
| 5 to 8 pages..... | 34.25* | 1.50 |
| 9 to 16 pages..... | 49.10* | 2.50 |

* Shipping cost from Brattleboro, Vt., extra.

ORDER PROCEDURE. The following procedure is recommended for reprint purchasers:

1. Place your order as soon as possible. (See deadlines above.)
 2. Address your order to the attention of Richard H. Sherwin, General Manager, Vermont Printing Company, Brattleboro, Vermont.
 3. Identify the material you want reprinted by giving the issue, page numbers, title, and author. Specify clearly the number of copies you want reprinted.
 4. Provide full addressing information for shipping the reprints and for billing purposes.
-

Putting Perspective into Suggestion Systems

James R. Bell

Are we being honest with ourselves about suggestion systems? The author thinks a re-examination of our philosophy is needed.

IN A rapidly changing technological society where social values are being modified constantly, we need to re-examine and re-state often the basic assumptions or philosophy underlying our personnel management programs. Such re-examination should be followed by appropriate revisions of our personnel practices and procedures. This paper is an attempt to examine the validity of suggestion system philosophy to see how well it agrees with suggestion system practice and to propose changes in both to accord with the realities and needs of the work place.

The following propositions regarding suggestion systems are those regularly encountered in the personnel literature. They have been drawn at random from current texts on personnel management. The evaluation of these propositions will disclose that certain familiar postulates relating to suggestion systems are either lacking in factual support or are actually contradictory to the assumptions which underlie other well established personnel practices. The conclusion recommends a single guiding postulate for suggestion systems and proposes some changes in suggestion system practices.

Proposition No. 1

Employees have a vast reservoir of good ideas for improving their work and need only the encouragement of management and systematic procedures to release a flood of beneficial suggestions.

The basis for this assumption is hard to identify. Extended observation of almost any ordinary work group will reveal just

the contrary. Most employees are trained to do their jobs in certain ways; they accept this training and their work methods uncritically and most of them go about their work for years on end without giving very much thought to change. Most of us like the *status quo*. Well formed habits and routines are comfortable and reassuring. Change is upsetting. Some contemporary research causes us to doubt that creativity is characteristic of the average American adult male. Many employees sincerely believe that management has worked out how it wants the work done and has devised the best ways for doing it.

There are additional reasons for doubting that suggestion systems will really unleash employee creativity. Because of the routine character of much of today's work in business and government, the employee's time-saving idea of today may put him out of a job tomorrow. It is unlikely that employees in great numbers are going to come forward enthusiastically to present ideas which may one day result in their own unemployment. Some unions resist suggestion systems for this reason.

Suggestion system statistics belie the proposition. Twenty suggestions per 100 employees per year is considered a good rate of submission. Two hundred thirty-five National Association of Suggestion Systems members reported for 1959 that among each 100 eligible employees 17.2 submitted suggestions. Adopted suggestions—the better ideas—number about one-fourth to one-fifth of those submitted. This means that the pool of ideas is to be found among only 4 or 5 per cent of the employees. Some large governmental merit award programs have submission rates as low as 5 to 10 per cent which means that only 1 to 3 per cent of the employees are submitting acceptable

Editor's Note: This article was adapted from a paper presented by the author at a meeting of the Bay Area Chapter, National Association of Suggestion Systems, Sacramento, California, May 17, 1961.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

suggestions. These data hardly support Proposition No. 1 that there is a great pool of untapped worthwhile ideas among employees.

Finally, if employees have a genuine "need" for creative expression, why is it that suggestion system managers must devote so much time and money to promotion, publicity, urging, coercing, pleading to get so few good suggestions from so few employees?

Proposition No. 2

With a good suggestion system, employees will have a "sense of participation" and this is good for employee relations generally.

This proposition is one of those bits of folklore which has been responsible for the uncritical establishment of not only idea award programs, but numerous "employee relations" gimmicks. No one has determined just what constitutes a "sense of participation"; how you determine its presence; and if it is present (which no one can establish) what contribution it may be making to the attainment of the goals of the organization.

Brushing aside these substantial questions however, it is clear from the statistics that so few employees submit suggestions that the sense of participation can hardly extend widely within the work force. A recent Air Force study revealed that 73 per cent of the employees had never submitted a suggestion. Members of the National Association of Suggestion Systems, with a total of over one-half million employees, reported for 1959 that less than 10 per cent of the eligible employees submitted suggestions. Only 2 or 3 per cent of the employees received awards for adopted suggestions. Where and how does this sense of participation arise and who feels it? Put directly: How, under these circumstances, can an idea award program make a substantial contribution to the improvement of general employee relations?

Proposition No. 3

Suggestion systems are a means of communication between employees and management. Employees will feel that they are

closer to and in a sense participating in management.

Obviously, the first question is: Who is management? In training courses we tell first-line supervisors and middle management that they are the foundations of the management structure—"on the management team," is the way it goes. The foreman and supervisor are exhorted to make the "vital shift" from worker to manager. Job descriptions spell out in detail the managerial responsibilities. Yet in spite of all this, suggestion systems are designed to bypass and to obviate communication with this "key" level of management. How can employees communicate with management under these circumstances?

It is doubtful that the suggester is really communicating with line management at any level. He is provided a channel for, in effect, saying to a non-line management agency (award board, suggestion monitor, or whatever it may be called), "I don't trust the management here so I'm sending my idea to you. I think you will both protect my identity (until it has to be revealed) and see that my suggestion gets fair consideration."

The general literature on organization communication stresses the need and the means of maintaining two-way free communication between employees and management, not excluding lower and middle management. The mechanics of many suggestion systems are clearly counter to this philosophy. The consideration of employee ideas as they are forced back down the management chain from the impersonal suggestion office can hardly be claimed either to give employees a sense of participating in management or to improve employee-management communication.

Discussions with many supervisors have convinced the author that the established procedures more often antagonize supervisors than improve their communication with employees. The suggestion system procedure as generally established assumes that the formalized, systematic by-passing of management is better than using management channels for the discussion by employees and managers of problems of work which should be of mutual concern.

Proposition No. 4

Even though there may be serious flaws in the suggestion system philosophy as now expressed, it cannot be denied that the good suggestions, although comparatively few in number, do result in tremendous savings.

This assertion can neither be proved nor disproved. No comparative studies have been made (so far as the author can determine) which reveal how many employee suggestions were made before an idea award system was established, how much was saved thereby, and how that compares with the results after a system has been installed.

No responsible personnel man or manager would deny, however, that over the last fifty years a great deal of our progress in technology and in operating practices and mechanics in government and business has been due to employee ideas freely contributed without expectation of payment or other award. Did employees have no ideas before the advent of suggestion systems? And did they hold their ideas back because no pay was offered for them? Even the most ardent supporter of suggestion systems would not contend this. We will never know how much clear gain in operational savings arises from idea award plans.

Once a system is established, a valid criticism is that the savings are overstated. The following factors should go into estimating them: (1) the amount of the award; (2) the costs of operating the system; (3) the full costs of investigating the idea; (4) the full costs of experimentation and installation of the idea; and (5) the full costs of developing the suggestion initially to the extent that it is done on time taken from the job.

The first and second items are easily identified and no doubt are fully stated. The full costs of investigation are rarely charged and in many cases not at all. One company calculated that an average of two hours' time was given to considering each suggestion submitted. At ten dollars per hour each submitted suggestion would cost twenty dollars to investigate. Costs of experimentation and installation in the fourth item are usually included, but how fully is unknown. It may be that managerial resistance to sug-

gestion systems and to the notion of paying for employee ideas results in these costs often being overstated. The last cost, time taken from the job by the suggester and his collaborators in developing the idea, is rarely, if ever, stated.

One other reservation regarding purported savings must be expressed. It has to do with long-run savings. Many awards are based on the first-year savings. Some systems arbitrarily assume that the saving will continue undiminished for a given period of time, say five to ten years, and the system is entitled therefore to claim savings of five to ten times the first-year savings. Some long-run savings can legitimately be claimed—exactly how much could only be determined by a laborious and costly follow-up to ascertain how much each suggestion did in reality save.

Because of the rapid changes in modern technology and procedures, and considering the minor nature of most of the suggestions, there is good reason to suspect that long-run savings may be overstated. In any case, there is no doubt that costs are not fully stated and that suggestion system initial savings may well be overstated.

Let's Face Facts!

The foregoing evaluation of suggestion system philosophy and practice does not argue for the abandonment of such systems. Rather, it is an argument for a reappraisal of philosophy and practice and for an attempt to bring both into conformity with the reality of modern organization life. There are inconsistencies between claims for and performance of such programs. Far too much has been assumed for too long without critical analysis simply because spectacular savings could be claimed as against awards made.

It is proposed that a single principle—namely, monetary gain to the organization—be the basis for establishing employee suggestion plans. They should be viewed purely and simply for what they are: *a method for buying employee ideas*. Let us drop all pretenses that they "give a sense of participation," "improve communication," "stimulate employee creativity," and so on. If such by-products result, so much the

better, but the system should not be founded on such unprovable and, in some cases, unlikely propositions.

If the suggestion system is an organized way of buying employee ideas to improve productivity and to save money, then the whole matter of procedures can be faced up to squarely. New attitudes toward management participation and communication will emerge and the hypocrisy in the present systems can be swept away. But here, we encounter perhaps the most serious contradiction and obstacle of all—the matter of supervisory participation.

Whither the Supervisor?

We shall have to reconcile basic, conflicting ideas regarding supervisors and their functions. On the one hand, we claim that a supervisor is paid to improve methods, that he is among other things an innovator. This is why he cannot receive awards for suggestions affecting his own unit. On the other hand, many supervisors are actually controllers, inspectors, expeditors—stabilizers, if you will—and guardians of the *status quo*. Most are neither paid nor especially encouraged to innovate.

Simple proof that the supervisor is not really viewed as an innovator is seen in the deliberate building around him of the suggestion system channel because it is believed that he fears new ideas and will suppress them. This conflict regarding supervisory attitudes and performance must be resolved before suggestion system procedures can be reconstructed within a new philosophy.

It is proposed that lower and middle managers be brought into full partnership in award plans and that they share equitably in suggestion awards applicable to their work and originating in their units. Supervisors must be given an incentive to promote new

ideas. Various schemes can be developed and different bases of compensation can be established.

Perhaps supervisory awards can begin with a 15 per cent sharing at the first level and scale down to 10 and 5 per cent for the next two levels above. Fuller participation by the supervisor in idea development will result in more good suggestions, result in higher awards, and reduce the large number of poor suggestions. Supervisory payments must be over and above, not taken from, the employee's award.

Buy Now—Save Later

The proposed procedure means that all suggestions must be initiated and perfected in the line as a part of normal work activity. They will not be routed around management and back down as at present. Line management must have the last word in the matter of work improvements which are essential to the management function.

What is offered is a kind of profit-sharing plan based on operational savings. In larger organizations a high-level committee may be desirable to review accepted suggestions, to examine the basis for estimated savings, and to maintain reasonable uniformity of standards. With this different philosophy the suggestion system coordinator's function should change. He can become a man whose duty is to help management identify "problem areas" and to stimulate employees and supervisors to develop solutions to them.

In summary, what is proposed here is a clarification and simplification of suggestion system objectives and the creation of a simple line system for stimulating, perfecting, and installing money-saving operational improvements. It is a plan for buying the good ideas and the creativity of all employees—non-supervisors and managers alike.

Democracy and Revolution in Puerto Rico

Luis Muñoz-Marín

Puerto Rico's Governor pays tribute to the civil servants of his country and their role in "Operation Bootstrap."

LAST OCTOBER, in my message to the Public Personnel Association's 1960 International Conference, I said:

We have created an extensive merit system to assure that ability and dedication will be recompensed as much as possible. Yet we still find ourselves torn between the legitimate needs of the great body of people who require more and more government service, and the needs of the band of loyal people who provide the service. One of the great challenges to the administrators of any government is the search for a fair and equitable balance between them.

I believe that the problem is that of serving the needs and desires of the majority without sacrificing or neglecting the needs and desires of the minority.

In Puerto Rico, our government, with limited resources, is in a constant day-to-day struggle to reach a balance among the scores of pressing needs of our people. We have no pat answers, no absolute formulae. We try to keep in mind, however, certain fundamentals: (1) basic needs, such as good education and good health; (2) basic principles, such as representative government and respect for individual freedom; and (3) basic truths, such as the dignity of man.

How are we going about meeting the needs of the people, and specifically the civil servant, in a developing society like Puerto Rico? Had we unlimited resources, we could simply allocate funds on the basis of absolute need. We do not have unlimited

resources, and democratic needs are always interlocked.

We try to achieve a balance between these needs. The Commonwealth now spends almost 30 per cent of its yearly budget on education. Yet some of our children are still on double session, textbooks are still in short supply, and teachers are still not paid what we would like to pay them. If we were to devote anything extra from our annual budget to education, some other service to the community would have to suffer. Some other dedicated public workers would inevitably suffer more.

Humble Beginnings

The Commonwealth's civil service system was created in 1947. Included in that system are a merit program for appointment and advancement, a comprehensive retirement program, an extensive scholarship program for the self-improvement of civil servants, and an incentive awards program. In terms of the politically oriented public service system Puerto Rico had previously known, this was both an extreme and an expensive venture for our government. However, we knew that in the long run we could achieve far more by drastic changes than by patchwork repairs.

Significantly, 1947 was the year that Puerto Rico was entering a great experiment—the year we launched "Operation Bootstrap" as we now know it. Prior to that, we had a development program, the heart of which was government ownership and management of certain industries. That phase had passed by 1947. We had proved to ourselves that extensive industrial development was possible in Puerto Rico. We then set incentives to attract the needed investment—from Puerto Rico itself, from the United States, from the world. We were

Editor's Note: This article was adapted from an address given by Governor Muñoz before the Eastern Regional Conference of the Public Personnel Association held in San Juan, Puerto Rico, May 24-27, 1961. Primarily intended as the Governor's welcome to Puerto Rico to the delegates of the Eastern Regional Conference, the address also represented his personal response to the 1960 PPA Award for Merit (see pp. 45-46, "Public Personnel Association Business—1960" by Kenneth O. Warner, *Public Personnel Review*, January, 1961).

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

determined to free ourselves from our absolute dependence on a one-crop economy.

In 1947, we had fewer than twenty factories promoted by our industrial development program. Today we have close to seven hundred. We had a per capita income of about \$250 a year in 1947; now we have one of nearly \$600. In 1947, the life expectancy of the average Puerto Rican was under 60 years. Today it is over 70, as in the United States itself. In addition, we have hundreds of new roads, schools, homes, and hospitals.

No magic was used to bring all this about. It was accomplished by a conscientious day-to-day devotion to the growing, changing needs of a society in transition. Puerto Rico has no doctrinaire economic slogans, and it needs none. Puerto Rico has no political orthodoxy. The mandate of its people is: "Create as great a civilization as you can, and do it with the utmost respect for freedom and human dignity."

All "Hands To Work"

What we have is a willingness to work and to make the inevitable mistakes, and to learn as much as possible from each mistake. This is a long and sometimes painful process. In Spanish, we describe our development program as *jalda arriba*, or climbing up a hill.

It was, and still is, a long and hard climb up the hill away from poverty. Our peaceful revolution in Puerto Rico began at a time when even the security of a square meal seemed to many Puerto Ricans like the promised land. In those days it took faith to talk about a better life. There was no sign of it anywhere—not in our worn-out fields, not in our leached soils, not in our barren mountains or our miserable slums. But we "put our hands to work," as we say in Spanish, and we raised ourselves to the point where an attitude of hope is today realistic for almost every Puerto Rican.

Puerto Rico's revolution is still going on, and we have it firmly under control. We are spilling no blood; we are not dividing father against son and brother against brother. Rather, we are in the midst of a great democratic ferment, carried on by all our people within and without the govern-

ment. For anyone who wants to read about it, the success of our revolution is a sure sign that democracy works, if only you are willing to strive for it.

We still have much to do in Puerto Rico. Poverty is still with us, and in a few cases it is extreme. But we are doing something about it. We are promoting more jobs, training more workers, educating more of our young and our old. Of course, we could not do this without an intelligent, dedicated corps of civil servants. They have every reason to be proud of their work and of the building of a civilization to which they so devotedly contribute.

This dedicated corps of trained, educated public servants behind our revolution is a major reason why it has succeeded. That is one of the many elements in the Puerto Rican experience that may be helpful as examples to other emerging societies.

Some authorities have said that we have made the fastest emergence from underdevelopment in the history of the world. That may or may not be true. Certainly we have made substantial progress, but we do not hold ourselves up as a model to be copied like a tracing. You cannot take this experiment and transfer it bodily to another economy, another culture, or another land. Our problems were Puerto Rican problems and we met them with Puerto Rican solutions.

Nevertheless, there are obviously many lessons for others here and, as a result, thousands of observers have come to Puerto Rico from the emerging countries.

Peaceful Revolution Is Possible

There was one great truth that emerged from the Puerto Rican experience that we think can be generally applied. It is that social and economic revolutions in underdeveloped countries can be successful within the framework of peace and democracy. Tough problems can be solved, major advances can be made, and economic justice can be extended without the loss of freedom.

History has shown us that democracy is enduring and dictatorships are not. This truth is of much significance to the United States. Certainly the United States must, for

purposes of international intercourse, deal with many dictatorships. But it should not, in pursuing this necessary business, ever appear to be wooing or admiring them, for in the end they fail. Furthermore, the people who throw them out do not forget those who were, or appeared to be, their oppressors' friends, and thus enemies of the people.

To some extent, this happened in the Cuban situation. Fidel Castro has made the most of it. The Cuban revolution, in the beginning, had democratic goals. Fidel Castro's stated aims were good: agrarian reform, equitable distribution of wealth, restitution of constitutional government. This movement had many friends, including myself, in the United States and elsewhere. One could not quarrel with its aims or the need for them.

They could have been accomplished by Castro in friendship with the United States, and with United States help. I know this is so because the United States never inter-

vened in Puerto Rico—even at a time, before the Commonwealth was established, when it could have done so legally. We had turned to methods of state socialism in our efforts to create industry. But even that great American conservative, Senator Robert Taft, agreed that we had no alternative.

Whether he agreed or not, the United States government made no effort to hinder the development of our reforms in the manner that we chose to make those reforms. It even provided aid and encouragement to our effort to defeat the extreme poverty that prevailed in the lives of our people.

This clearly should be of important significance to Latin Americans who know that their countries need a great revolution, and should know that it can be carried out peacefully, with respect for freedom and with the friendship and aid of the United States. We in Puerto Rico are good citizens of the United States as well as a Latin American people.

HISTORY OF THE UNITED STATES CIVIL SERVICE

Paul P. Van Riper, Cornell University. The first history of the civil service of the federal government to be published in more than fifty years. Especially impressive are the chapters analyzing the problems of the civil service at the end of World War II and in the Eisenhower administration. Belongs in the professional library of every personnelist. 588 pp. \$7.50

LEADERSHIP IN ADMINISTRATION: A Sociological Interpretation

Philip Selznick, University of California, Berkeley. "... happily devoid of a single word of jargon and deals in stimulating fashion with a subject that has been neglected in the current literature of organizational theory . . . the Selznick volume deserves special recognition for its readability and for its suggestive, stimulating ideas."—Marver Bernstein, Princeton University, *American Political Science Review*. March 1959. 162 pp. \$4.00

GROUP DYNAMICS: Research and Theory

Dorwin Cartwright and Alvin Zander, University of Michigan, Editors. "This work is the second edition of what to me is the best book in the field of group psychology. . . . The editors have done an admirable job in presenting the best in an exciting branch of the social sciences."—Leonard Berkowitz, *Contemporary Psychology*, June, 1961. Second Edition, 832 pp. \$7.25

*15% discount postpaid to P.P.A. members if check accompanies order.
Our complete catalog will be sent upon request.

ROW, PETERSON AND COMPANY

Publishers of Good Books in Evanston, Illinois, and Elmsford, New York

he, be-
lished,
We had
in our
n that
Rob-
native.
United
hinder
n the
forms.
ent to
overty
ole.
nt sig-
know
lution,
ed out
n and
United
itizens
Latin

ern-
izing
ion.

d of
rent
its
sity,

the
have
ard

Y
rk

Public Service and Understanding

John W. Macy, Jr.

A stimulating proposal from the U. S. Civil Service Commission Chairman would provide means to advance public personnel practices in all the Americas.

IN PROPOSING mutual goals for the Americas through a new alliance for progress, President Kennedy declared:

For our unfulfilled task is to demonstrate to the entire world that man's unsatisfied aspiration for economic growth and social justice can best be achieved by free men working within a framework of democratic institutions. . . . [I]f our alliance is to succeed, each nation must formulate long-range plans for its own development—plans which establish targets and priorities, insure monetary stability, establish the machinery for vital social change, stimulate private activity and initiative, and provide for a maximum national effort.

This dynamic declaration of mutual purpose constitutes the central challenge to government administrators throughout the Americas. The administrative leaders of Puerto Rico are, in their policies and programs, offering a living model of democratic action in pursuit of President Kennedy's goals. In a brief period of time—less than a generation—significant change has been generated through the application of leadership and talent to the human problems calling for governmental solution.

Puerto Rico, which nurtured the earliest European settlers of the New World almost five centuries ago, became a modern show case for the rest of the world and a modern laboratory in which leaders from other lands could study the successful techniques of "Operation Bootstrap." It is fitting, then, that we consider the role of public service in responding to the demands of future change and development in the Americas.

Editor's Note: This article is an adaptation of Mr. Macy's remarks before the Eastern Regional Conference of the Public Personnel Association held in San Juan, Puerto Rico, May 24-27, 1961.

Civil Service Must Lead the Way

Certainly a strong, vigorous, and imaginative public service is one of the most important democratic institutions required in society's advance toward new goals. With rapid technological change, explosive population growth, and mounting interdependence of governments, the skill and experience of a trained, continuing corps of civil servants become an increasingly essential ingredient in government at all levels.

The degree of effectiveness and success in public administration in a free, democratic government is dependent upon the degree of quality and commitment in its public service. Competence, integrity, and impartiality are required elements in such a public service. From these qualities must flow not only the most efficient and economical execution of policy but the ideas and proposals which provide the raw material for policy change and improvement at the top executive or legislative level.

In a true sense, the creative force of the civil service should contribute the thrust necessary to advance public programs in response to an ever-changing future.

At the Roots of Good Public Service

A sound public service is based upon a sound system of public personnel administration—the field that constitutes our chosen and highly valued profession. The foundations for this system have been cast in the basic objective of a merit system where equal opportunity is offered to all citizens to compete for public office in terms of their personal skills and capabilities.

It is clearly the objective of such a system in a democracy to:

1. seek out, attract, and retain the most

competent personnel to staff essential public activities

2. **preserve political neutrality** and to eliminate any reality or semblance of personal patronage or favoritism
3. assure equal opportunity to all groups for service and advancement by rejecting discriminatory standards such as race, creed, color, sex, or other non-quality measures
4. provide training programs to enhance performance on present jobs and to prepare the better employee for more difficult and more responsible work
5. assure advancement in the service only on merit and through demonstrated ability, not through seniority or docility
6. provide pay based on the importance, difficulty, and responsibility of the job and the qualifications and achievements of the individuals
7. offer pay and benefit plans reasonably related to those of progressive private employers, adequate to support a decent standard of living, proper in terms of government's social objective for the total population, and sufficient to insure integrity of all officers and employees
8. develop a climate for high quality, productive effort dedicated to the public interest and with respect for the individual worth and dignity of every man and woman rendering such public service.

Merit systems should be truly representative of the people they serve. They must be firmly based on the special cultural, geographical, and related factors of each country. It is not wise to transplant personnel features from one country to another without locally formulated changes and adaptations. But certainly these basic characteristics are appropriate guides for the fostering of stronger merit system programs in any government.

More Than Meets the Eye

In our pursuit of improved personnel practices it is essential that our professional fervor not lead us into assuming that these practices are ends in themselves. Without question, their reason—and our reason—

for existence is to enhance and carry out in the most effective fashion possible the public objectives and programs for which agencies and personnel staffs have been created.

It is the privilege of personnel professionals to concern themselves with the human side of public management. That privilege carries an accompanying obligation to assure consideration of human needs and involvement in all public programs. This obligation assumes greater proportions as the pace of our nations accelerate and change—automation, scientific development, new commodities, and other symptoms of change call for action on the human front in all public programs.

Likewise, the importance of long-range systematic planning cannot be overemphasized. There is critical need to look ahead toward projected manpower and skill requirement for our changing career services and to adapt our personnel system to facilitate rather than obstruct change. The merit system need not have static features; it must have the dynamism to join in and promote constructive change.

No one person or even all the institutions in any one country can embody all the wisdom and understanding called for to move ahead in this field. No one person or country can provide the needed answers to vast problems arising in the search for progress in a democratic and free society. But we can, and we must, share our experiences with ever-broadening understanding in the hope that our combined aspirations and objectives may produce combined improvements.

A Bold Step

In this connection, I would like to convert words into action. I would like to propose that the Public Personnel Association accept the leadership in promoting the creation of a Center for Public Personnel Progress in the Americas. Located in Puerto Rico, this center would offer the means for collaborative, bilingual effort to improve public personnel planning, research, and training throughout the Western hemisphere.

The setting in Puerto Rico would be particularly appropriate in view of its geographical location at the crossroads of the Americas and in the light of its significant

progress in self-government and self-development in the past twenty years.

The basic purposes of such a center would be:

1. to provide a meeting place where public personnel leaders from Canada, the United States, and the Central and South American Republics could discuss mutual problems, exchange experiences and ideas, and formulate cooperative plans and projects for the future
2. to collect, catalog, and disseminate to public personnel agencies in all states materials (sample policies, procedures, research results, and case studies) prepared to encourage and facilitate improvement in personnel programs
3. to promote research on a cooperative basis in the social and administrative sciences
4. to develop combined training programs intended to prepare a larger number of

men and women to serve in the public personnel field.

"Alliance for Progress"

Successful implementation of the program proposed by President Kennedy for the Americas—*alianza para progreso*—can only be achieved through effective performance of personnel in the public services of the individual countries. Recognition of this fact places a greater obligation upon public personnel administrators to contribute more creatively in their professions. In keeping with the concept of mutual assistance in seeking mutual goals, this center could be a potent instrument in promoting progress on a broad American front.

The goals are essential objectives for free men and women. In the hands and minds of public servants are stored the most potent resources for democratic development. May we join to foster the optimum realization of those resources in support of the *alianza para progreso*.

Rules Aren't Enough . . .

. . . [A]dministration cannot be considered solely as a science or solely as an art. Neither, in practice, has anybody ever maintained either extreme view. Principles, i.e., universal rules, cannot by themselves serve as a background for administration unless their application is supplemented, supported and corroborated by the specific art, based on experience and knowledge, of putting them into practice. The creative force of an ideal administration resides in that art.—English summary of "Public Administration as a Science or an Art," by Georges Alexandris (original in French). *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, No. 1, 1961.

After All, It's His Rating . . .

If the merit rating has any value at all, it is to the employee—so he may know how he is really doing on the job and where to improve. If the supervisor does not have the courage to call in an employee and freely discuss the rating with him in terms of improving his work performance—as well as acknowledging good work—then the whole business of rating loses its principal value.—Lloyd Griffiths in *Service: A Bulletin on Public Relations*, November, 1959.

The Challenge of a Career in the Public Service

Brian MacBride

A young Canadian student discusses the public service—its functions and its opportunities—in a prize-winning essay.

TODAY, a career in the public service offers young Canadians almost unparalleled opportunities to benefit themselves and their country. In nearly every field, from diplomatic work as part of this country's delegation at the United Nations, to a technical job, helping to construct a highway that will link a valuable mining district in the north to the industrial cities of the east, there is room for young ambitious people who wish, not only the personal rewards of a lifetime occupation, but also the personal satisfaction of knowing that they are contributing to the welfare of all their fellow citizens.

Gone are the days when a civil servant was regarded as a man with mediocre ability holding down a plush government job; gone are the days when civil servant appointments were little more than a means of rewarding political supporters. Whether the position be local, provincial, or federal, the public servant is more than just a government employee. In today's world he is a dynamic and influential part of our way of life.

Opportunities on Local Level

It has been said that the municipal government is closest to the people. Certainly we notice more often the accomplishments of a municipality in our day-to-day activities, for it is up to the local executive to build streets, put out fires, supply water, and carry out numerous other services which

are essential to the retention of our high standard of living.

In the complex communities of the twentieth century, these jobs are done by experts—men and women trained in such diversified undertakings as law, finance, public health and sanitation, architecture, and many types of engineering. As a community expands, so do its problems. Slums must be cleaned up. Parks and recreation centres must be administered. The sick and poor must be cared for. Many kinds of skills are needed in the proper administration of local government, and each one plays an important part in the growth of a community.

Provincial, Federal Careers Diversified

It is at the provincial and federal levels that the scope of required occupations becomes enlarged to the point where it covers not only those employed by the municipalities, but almost every profession.

Those interested in medicine, for example, can find rewarding careers under both administrative levels. Medical people of all types are employed by the Dominion government in various ways, ranging from staffing hospitals, nursing stations, and health units in different parts of the country, to carrying out cancer research in the fight to control this terrible killer.

The Environmental Sanitation Division of the provincial government needs men and women to carry on the task of reducing the incidence of diseases borne by milk, food, water, sewage, insects, and rodents. Important too is the social worker who may help to administer Family Allowance and Old Age Security legislation from an office, or organize welfare and recreational programmes for Canada's Indians and Eskimos.

Experts in bacteriology, chemistry, botany, pharmacy, biology, and other sciences are

Editor's Note: The editors of *Public Personnel Review* are pleased to publish this prize-winning essay by Mr. MacBride, a 17-year-old student of Richview Collegiate Institute at Etobicoke, Ontario, Canada. His entry won the first prize of \$150 in an essay contest conducted during 1960 by the Metropolitan Toronto Chapter of the Public Personnel Association in joint sponsorship with the Association's Eastern Regional Conference.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

required in research and in the administering of assorted national and provincial interests. Surveyors, draftsmen, architects, engineers, and technical specialists of all types are employed in manifold tasks. Electrical engineers, for example, are a necessary part in the programme of establishing the communications and early warning systems for the defence of the country. The development, as well, of Canada's many natural resources—her mineral, forestry, and agricultural wealth—depends to a great extent on the abilities of her technological experts.

Molding the Young

But Canada's most important natural resource is her youth—her future leaders. It is in the development of young Canadians where one of the greatest responsibilities lies. The teacher at the elementary level must impress upon young minds the qualities of a good citizen in such a way that they will last throughout these youngsters' whole lives. Later, either through sparking interest in a particular field or through direct counseling, he will help these young people select their life-long work.

The librarian, another educator, has the responsibility of selecting and suggesting books which will influence the minds of both children and adults, and which will provide the background of information upon which intelligent public opinion can be based. The librarian is an important person in our democratic system, for only through a well informed public can a democracy survive.

Beyond the Borders

Personnel in Canada's public service can be found, not only in this country, but in literally every corner of the world. The Department of Citizenship and Immigration, for example, employs Foreign Service Officers in more than twenty-five foreign centres. It is their duty to interview persons who may someday become Canadian citizens. Their decisions have a direct influence on the quality of people and the types of skills emigrating to Canada, and thus they indirectly influence the growth of Canada.

Foreign Service Officers in the Depart-

ment of Trade and Commerce represent Canada's ever-expanding commerce in forty-six nations. These officers have the responsibility of promoting Canada's export trade abroad, showing these countries that Canada produces and exports cobalt bombs for the treatment of cancer and jet engines as well as wheat and furs.

One of the largest branches of our government, with a staff exceeding a thousand in Ottawa and abroad, is the Department of External Affairs. The External Affairs Officer abroad maintains official communication between the Canadian government and foreign governments and carries out the policies of the Canadian government in relation to these other countries. One of his responsibilities is keeping the Canadian government informed of the activities of the foreign government. On the basis of this information Ottawa makes decisions on external policy and on those aspects of internal policy which are dependent on conditions abroad.

In today's world, when nearly every twenty-four hours brings some international change, the services of an External Affairs Officer are invaluable. Diplomats and consuls are posted abroad for a variety of tasks ranging from the provision of passports to the evacuation of Canadians in time of trouble. Many delegates are required to represent Canada in the United Nations, some purely political, others going to work for the solving of humanity's non-political problems.

Building for the Future

Canada, as one of the leading Western democracies, is faced today with the challenge of proving that the achievements of free enterprise are superior in every way to those of a communistic system. It will be a hard battle; and to help win, Canada must have the best—the best scientists, the best diplomats, the best engineers, the best doctors and lawyers, the best men and women in every line of work.

The public servant of tomorrow faces a greater challenge than any personal quest. It is the challenge of a land in which much is still to be accomplished—a land well worth serving.

Public Personnel Literature:

The Last Decade

Paul P. Van Riper

Has public personnel administration been content to live off private industry's creativity? The dearth of public personnel literature seems to say "Yes."

THE STIMULUS for this commentary has been provided by the *Basic Bibliography in Public Personnel Administration* which follows.

In reviewing the literature concerning a field of study and action such as that involved here, two basic questions come immediately to mind. First, What is the general image of public personnel management as conveyed by the books, pamphlets, and other materials now available to the student and the practitioner? And, second, What is the adequacy of the existing literature from the standpoint of the major clienteles most directly interested in it? Let us consider these two questions in order.

The Problem of Perspective

Any such review as this requires both a point of departure and a time perspective. Perhaps the last major attempt to assess the trend in public personnel management—and the literature concerning it—at all levels of American government was by Wallace Sayre in 1948.¹

Sayre's stimulus more than a decade ago was the appearance of the first edition of the well known private industrial text, *Personnel Administration* by Pigors and Myers, which Sayre believed marked "an important milestone in the development of personnel administration" through its effort to relate the then relatively new concept of "human relations" to personnel administration.

At the same time, Sayre was trenchantly critical of developments in public personnel management. "The major barrier to the acceptance and influence which *Personnel Ad-*

ministration deserves in the public field," he wrote, "will arise from the wide gulf which divides its point of view and method from many of the deep-seated stereotypes and cherished rituals of civil service administration." Public personnel management, he concluded, then represented "a triumph of techniques over purpose."

Four editions in thirteen years plus acquisition of a considerable proportion of the private (and some of the public) personnel textbook market would seem to have substantiated Sayre's initial opinion of Pigors and Myers' efforts. Judging from today's literature in the field, are his conclusions with respect to the general state of public personnel administration still equally relevant?

Unfortunately, the answer to this question is not an unqualified "No." It is, of course, dangerous to judge the development of what is essentially an applied discipline by the state of the literature about it. To have so assessed personnel administration—either public or private—in the nineteenth century would have been to make laughable errors, for much that was in fact being accomplished was not recorded in any systematic way.

But the same cannot be said for the sixth decade of the twentieth century. The outpouring of writings in the personnel field has been immense and is growing in geometrical proportions. Nevertheless, while the literature in public personnel administration has progressed in a number of respects, it still reflects some of that "gulf" between what is possible and what in fact has been realized, which Sayre pointed out in the late forties.

¹ Wallace Sayre, "The Triumph of Techniques Over Purpose," *Public Administration Review*, Spring, 1948, pp. 134-137.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Net Gains

Certainly the following general developments, all reflected in the current literature, represent a net gain of considerable proportions. Above all, there has been a growing *rapprochement* between public and private personnel administration since World War II. Prior to 1940, for example, no list of materials in public personnel management would have reflected the considerable number of private personnel items now listed in the *Basic Bibliography*.

This *Review*, as well as the journal of the Society for Personnel Administration, has reflected an increasing interest and concern in relating public and private personnel approaches and techniques in recent years. The same is true of the most recent public personnel texts by Stahl, Powell, and Nigro. Furthermore, most present-day courses in public personnel administration at the collegiate and other educational levels either specifically refer to or otherwise reflect the developments in private personnel management. Certainly it is clear that the impact of the latter during the last decade has been considerably greater on public personnel administration and the civil service in general than Sayre predicted in 1948.

More specifically, this impact is visible in new emphases in the literature of public personnel administration on such matters as supervisory training, executive development, and, indeed, on all aspects of training. Much of the private literature concerning industrial relations is now being perceived as relevant to labor-management relations in government.

There is a new emphasis on employee services, incentives, and motivation, much of which stems from the experience of private industry. There is a general recognition of the need for new measures further to decentralize public personnel management to the operating agencies, especially in the federal government, and to provide more flexibility in procedures. And, finally, as in private personnel management, the decade and a half since World War II has seen greater and greater efforts to modify the role of the central governmental personnel agency from that of a policeman to

that of a major staff assistant to line management.

All of these developments parallel similar tendencies in private industry, not only because of the industrial example, but equally important, the need of government to compete with private enterprise in a period of unequaled peacetime manpower shortages.

These manpower shortages have also promoted a new interest in public service careers and career systems, something stressed in the personnel report of the Second Hoover Commission, in such special studies as *Executives for Government* by David and Pollock, and in all the textbooks on public administration in general as well as those on public personnel in particular.

Indeed, the urgent need—in both government and private industry—to utilize present manpower to the utmost has produced something of a new consideration of personnel management as a total process. The traditional literature, especially in the public field, has tended to treat personnel management as a group of disparate functions—such as recruitment, testing, classification, pay, training, discipline, services, and the like—rather than as a coherent “system” of interrelated and coordinated procedures aimed at support of the staffing requirements of a modern government with immense personnel requirements for a vast and complex web of duties and responsibilities.

New Trends

It is too much to say that the present literature yet treats public personnel management in any fully integrated way. But, in partial recognition of the need to coordinate personnel activities we find the newer literature in public personnel management bringing together such matters as recruitment, examinations, and appointment under the general heading of “staffing.” Classification, pay, training, promotion, and the systematic movement of personnel both vertically and horizontally are now being grouped under the concept of “career system patterns.”

Such formerly separate topics as welfare services, performance ratings, incentive systems, working conditions, supervisory methods, and some aspects of union-management

relations are coming to be seen as interrelated in terms of a broad concept of "motivation and productivity." Ethics, loyalty and security, limitations on political activity, public relations, conflicts of interest, and discipline are being increasingly recognized as all related to the central problem of maintaining a responsible and responsive civil establishment.

For confirmation of this, one has only to look at the major headings in today's personnel texts and at the titles of some of the items in the *Basic Bibliography*. This is not to say that all personnel systems in the United States are in fact operating in these coordinated terms; rather, this is clearly the trend of recommendation and development. Certainly present training at the collegiate level is now taking this approach.

Finally, the recent decade has seen the beginnings of an effort to tackle the difficult but crucial problem of evaluation of the total personnel program. Here the federal government has made the greatest strides, with the 1954 publication of the U. S. Civil Service Commission, entitled *Evaluating Your Personnel Management*, as a pioneer effort.

This has been followed by more specialized departmental publications. Of these, the publications of the civilian personnel department of the Air Force are especially complete. The specialized publications of the various departments aimed not only at a general common-sense type of evaluation but also at systematic development of a personnel work-measurement system which, in the absence of profit-and-loss statements, provides one of the few available vehicles for the development of more precise and quantifiable measures of performance for all elements of personnel management. Literature on this basic subject is, however, as yet almost nonexistent in other than the federal government.

Major Gaps

While it is clear from the currently available literature that some practitioners and students of public personnel management are attempting to think, write, and act in terms of the individual employee as a whole person, a work group as a total group, and

a civil service as a total personnel system, it is equally clear that this tendency has by no means reached its full practical limits.

There is as yet, for example, no analysis of current American public personnel management as a total "system," in the sense that that word is being used today in, for instance, engineering. More precisely, there is no American equivalent of E. N. Gladden's penetrating and critical analysis of the British civil service in his *Civil Service or Bureaucracy?* published in 1956. Our textbooks get at this sort of critique to a limited extent, but they have other purposes to accomplish.

To put the matter another way, administration as a whole—both public and private—is being increasingly thought of as a total sequential process, with each segment interrelated with other segments and all in turn comprising a coordinated whole. As suggested above, this is the trend of thought in American public personnel management, but the integration in either literature or practice is as yet quite incomplete. This is especially true at the state and local levels.

Similarly, no American has as yet published an article or work carefully relating and comparing different types of personnel systems—civil versus military, rank-in-the-man versus rank-in-the-job, promotion from within versus lateral entry, or American versus foreign. Indeed, there are now in print only two books which attempt any serious comparison of public personnel systems on an international basis. Both are written by Englishmen and neither contains any reference to the United States. The most complete and thorough, covering the major public services of Western Europe, is Brian Chapman's *The Profession of Government*. Perhaps this will provide both an incentive and something of a model for some such study involving our own theory and practice.

To be sure, we have quantities of literature outlining possible types of tests, various systems of performance ratings, and alternative forms of incentive systems. In a very limited sense these are "comparative." We also have a few references to foreign experience in our textbooks, and David and Pollock have made an effort to compare "alternative senior career service systems"

in their *Executives for Government*. But, on the whole, the literature and practice of public personnel administration in this country can only be described as extremely parochial in subject matter and outlook. This is most devastatingly apparent when we endeavor to export some of our public personnel practices.

We seem often to assume that American public personnel management is "the" way to do it, when in fact our civil service system is unique in the world, not only as a total system but also in a number of its major components. This would not be so bad if we could articulate our system to others—not just explain our practices (which we can do quite well) but outline the reasons for them, their relation to our social and political system, and their possible effects on an alien society. This most of us cannot do, for neither our public personnel training and experience nor our literature have prepared us to do this.

In most of our education and practice we tend to assume a sort of traditional American pattern of public personnel techniques and procedures. In the bulk of our civil service literature we are primarily concerned with "how," but only occasionally with "why," and almost never with "whether." While the *Basic Bibliography* is necessarily somewhat biased in favor of materials of assistance to the practicing personnel man, there is little that could be added to it, outside of a very few articles, which might counterbalance this emphasis.

More Missing Links

Underlying this situation is the extreme paucity of significant research relating to public personnel management and the civil service. This has been pointed out by Cecil Goode in his penetrating *Personnel Research Frontiers* and by Sayre and Mosher in their recent *An Agenda for Research in Public Personnel Administration*. To be sure there are the recent Leonard D. White administrative histories, large portions of which concern personnel management, and my own history of the U. S. civil service. These help to provide perspective. But, outside the military, there is little current research of

more than a relatively *ad hoc* and applied nature, and not even much of that.

Despite our present intense interest in executive development, for example, almost the sole evidence we have concerning what top-level government executives actually do and the nature of the problems and decisions they face is contained in Bernstein's *Job of the Federal Executive*. Useful as it is, this volume can hardly be described as research of real depth or breadth. Industrial sociology is, significantly, labeled "industrial" and has passed government by. Political sociology is concerned with "bureaucracy," but seldom with public personnel management. Applied anthropology is of little more assistance in the analysis of governmental problems.

The result of all this is that the public service has been forced to look to research by or about industry for most of its innovative ideas in the past thirty years. The last major contribution of the public service to personnel management goes back a good forty years, when private industry began to pick up from government the idea of examinations and testing as an aid to selection and placement. But even then it was the military experience in World War I, rather than that of civil government, which provided the immediate impetus.

Literature for Whom?

The final basic question to be considered briefly here concerns the adequacy of the available public personnel literature as viewed from the standpoint of the various clienteles especially dependent upon it. At least four major groups come to mind quickly: (1) the journeyman personnel technician, who is and must be a highly competent technical specialist; (2) the personnel director and civil service commissioner, whose range of concern covers the entire field of public personnel management and verges on general management; (3) the line supervisor and administrator at all levels, whose interest is almost solely that of the generalist; and (4) the academician and student in our educational institutions, particularly at the collegiate level.

Of the first category—the personnel technician—we can dispose very quickly. In terms of available guidance in the form of

texts, pamphlets, brochures, and the like, he has, to put it crudely, never had it so good. If one assumes the desirability of our traditional American public personnel practices, the how-to-do-it literature is at an all-time high in terms of almost any standard of judgment.

A quick glance at the *Basic Bibliography* will make this abundantly clear. Those familiar with such bibliographies of a decade or so ago will find the change even more impressive. This kind of literature is not only more complete in its coverage of topics of interest to the technician, it is also much better written and presented than ever before. For this general trend the Public Personnel Association itself deserves a good deal of credit.

But the other clienteles do not fare so well. Of those remaining, the personnel director is best off. His interests most nearly coincide with those of the technician. He has available the *Basic Bibliography* and all it represents and he is also usually well enough trained to be able to utilize the vast literature of private personnel management. He can translate on his own.

Even so, he is severely limited in all the various respects previously outlined. For example, if he is responsible for an expanded training program, there is little except his own intuition and the experience of those around him to suggest "training for what" with any precision. If he (or the civil service commissioner or the line administrator) wishes seriously to evaluate his program on bases other than guesswork, there is little he can refer to for guidance. And, if he is called on to interpret to others—at home or abroad—what he is doing, there is almost nothing on the shelf on which to draw.

Going, Going, Gone

The typical civil service commissioner is of course much less well off, in most cases, for he does not usually possess the background of training and experience which will enable him to use much of the present literature to advantage. The first major—and almost the sole—effort to provide any pamphlets (there are no books) especially designed for civil service commissioners has

been made by the Public Personnel Association. However, this dates back barely over five years, and the publications can still be counted on the fingers of one hand.

The line administrator, in both private industry and the public service, is almost bereft of guidance directly oriented to his more generalized requirements. The last book prepared especially for the government executive who wished to know more about the civil service in order to operate more effectively through its personnel system was prepared by Lewis Meriam in 1938 and has been out of print for more than a decade.² There is nothing currently available to replace it.

The nearest equivalent—also unique—is a similar volume recently prepared for the executive in private industry by James H. Taylor of Michigan's School of Business Administration. It is entitled *Personnel Administration: Evaluation and Executive Control*. There is also the Army's *GI-Manual*, but it is of little direct assistance to anyone outside the military. Apparently the first attempt to familiarize new political executives with the public personnel system within which they must operate has been the U. S. Civil Service Commission's unique pamphlet *The Federal Career Service—At YOUR Service* prepared in late 1960.

For the student and academician interested in "training" as opposed, say, to "education"—interested in policies and practices rather than why's and wherefore's—there is considerable assistance available. For such purposes the texts are excellent and the practical literature plentiful and well written. But there is at least one major gap here. There are very few "cases" available for either discussion purposes or problem solving, and most of these go back to the thirties and forties.

The last published set of *Cases of Public Personnel Administration* was prepared by Henry Reining, Jr., in 1949. For more current materials one must turn to a very limited selection available through the efforts of the Inter-University Case Program in Public Administration and published by

² Lewis Meriam, *Public Personnel Problems from the Standpoint of the Operating Officer* (Washington, D. C.: The Brookings Institution, 1938).

the University of Alabama Press. Otherwise one must turn to casebooks relating to private industrial experience, of which there are now quite a number. The Society for Personnel Administration has prepared an excellent little pamphlet on *The Case Method*. But as far as public personnel administration is concerned, this is method without as yet much to work on.

For the student and academician in, for instance, the liberal arts, where the emphasis is and should be on general principles, on the nature of major social institutions (of which the civil service is one), on personnel as an aspect of a total administrative process, or on the impact of civil service systems on government and consequently on the entire society, there is almost nothing. For the graduate student there are, as we have noted, few research studies for stimulation and guidance.

Danger of Stagnation

Perhaps the final test of any body of literature is the group of new adherents and contributors which it attracts. Industrial personnel management, supported by industrial psychology, industrial sociology, applied anthropology, human relations, and industrial relations, is engaged in new and exciting research and experimentation. This, in turn, has produced an immense new body of literature. From my own collegiate vantage point, I see student after student attracted to this literature, interested in its methods, excited by its findings, and, finally, moved to orient their studies in its direction. Eventually such students themselves become contributors; and so the body of literature further expands and develops.

For all categories of students, there is little in print concerning the American civil service and American public personnel administration which can be termed either exciting or intellectually stimulating in any fundamental sort of way. It is no wonder

that the number of college students, at both undergraduate and graduate levels, who are seriously interested in public personnel administration as either a profession or as a field of study and research has undergone a serious decline in the last twenty years.

The further development of any field of study and action must ultimately depend upon the stock of new ideas and concepts—theoretical and practical—which become available. This, in turn, demands a constant input of intelligent and dedicated persons. The present situation in public personnel administration, with respect to both new ideas and new adherents, augurs ill for the future.

Conclusion

In summary, we may say that the state of public personnel administration in 1961 represents a considerable advance over that which Sayre perceived in 1948. This is certainly true of the literature concerning governmental personnel management—and it is probably fair to state that the literature reflects the state of the practice reasonably well.

However, while there is a vastly increasing body of writing on public personnel matters, much of it can only be described as "translations." American public personnel administration is at present living largely off the stock of new ideas deriving from the world of private industry and from academicians, researchers, and others associated or concerned with it. Civil government and public personnel administrators are creating little new of their own, nor is anyone else doing very much for them.

Public personnel management and those concerned with it must lift their sights higher and concern themselves much more with fundamental matters, both at home and abroad, if there is to be innovation from within as well as without.

A Basic Bibliography in Public Personnel Administration

A general reference source for the personnel practitioner, the public administrator, the teacher, and the student.

EDITOR'S NOTE: This bibliography was assembled by the staff of the Public Personnel Association, with the intention of providing a collection of basic literature of use to those engaged in, or interested in public personnel administration, as well as to teachers and students. This objective called for the bibliography to provide comprehensive coverage on a selective basis, rather than to cover any of the major fields of personnel administration "in depth."

The compilers of this list benefited substantially from advice received from a number of leading individuals in the field, but the PPA Secretariat assumes responsibility for the final selection of items in the bibliography. The persons who were kind enough to give us advice and counsel in developing this bibliography were:

LYNTON K. CALDWELL, Director, Institute for Training for Public Service, Department of Government, Indiana University.

WINSTON W. CROUCH, Director, Bureau of Governmental Research, University of California, Los Angeles.

JOHN F. FISHER, Executive Officer, California State Personnel Board.

JOHN D. FOSTER, Personnel Director, The Port of New York Authority.

J. STANLEY FRAZER, Director of Personnel, Alabama State Personnel Board.

WILLIAM W. McDUGALL, Director of Personnel, Louisiana Department of State Civil Service.

JAMES M. MITCHELL, Director, Conference Program on Public Affairs, The Brookings Institution.

O. GLENN STAHL, Director, Programs and Standards Bureau, U. S. Civil Service Commission.

PAUL P. VAN RIPER, Professor of Administration, Graduate School of Business and Public Administration, Cornell University.

JOHN A. WATTS, Director of Civilian Personnel, Department of the Air Force.

Users of the bibliography should bear the following points in mind:

Until January 1, 1957, the Public Personnel Association was known as the Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada. Items published prior to that date will therefore be listed under the latter name, either as author or publisher.

Although a number of the items listed are known to be out of print, they were considered sufficiently important to be included in this basic bibliography. Most of them should be available through personnel agency or university libraries.

• Personnel Administration—General

Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada. "Perspective in Public Personnel Administration." *Public Personnel Review*, October, 1956. (Entire issue)

A collection of essays by outstanding persons in the field commemorating the 50th Anniversary of the Civil Service Assembly.

Dimock, Marshall E., and others. "Personnel." Pp. 275-343 in their *Public Administration*. (Rev. ed.) New York, Rinehart and Co., 1958. 573 pp.

In this new edition in which Louis W. Koenig collaborates, stress is again on the practical side of government, leadership, and a dynamic economy. The area of the Presidency and government-wide services has been considerably enlarged.

Institute for Training in Municipal Administration. "Municipal Personnel Administration." (6th ed.) Chicago, International City Managers' Association, 1960. 414 pp. (Municipal Management Series)

Approaches personnel problems from the point of view of those who are responsible for developing and administering personnel programs. Sets forth basic principles, illustrates

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

these principles in the programs of cities and other governments, and provides practical suggestions for carrying these principles into effect. Methods and procedures are also emphasized to provide a day-to-day working manual.

Institute for Training in Municipal Administration. "Technique of Municipal Administration." (4th ed.) Chicago, International City Managers' Association, 1958. 441 pp. (Municipal Management Series)

An analysis of the functions of management, an indication of the scope of management in municipal administration, and illustrations of some of the techniques that have been proved to be most useful. A valuable handbook for the chief administrator and his principal assistants. Contains chapters on personnel administration and training.

Kaplan, H. Eliot. "The Law of Civil Service." Albany, N. Y., Matthew Bender and Co., 1958. 440 pp.

The basic text on civil service law. Provides an authoritative judicial review of personnel actions in government with brief exposition of the basic practices and procedures in administration of merit system laws.

Matthews, Lempi. (Ed.) "Tips Worth Tapping: A Collection of More Than 100 Suggestions for Improving Personnel Practices." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1960. 60 pp. (Personnel Report No. 602)

Presents over 100 "tips" for handling more efficiently, and with greater imagination, all aspects of a personnel program. Ideas presented are drawn from actual practice. Designed to serve as a workbook, this report is a valuable aid to every member of the personnel staff.

Morstein Marx, Fritz. (Ed.) "Elements of Public Administration." (2nd ed.) Englewood Cliffs, N. J., Prentice-Hall, 1959. 572 pp.

Contents: Part 1—"The Role of Public Administration"; Part 2—"Organization and Management"; Part 3—"Working Methods"; Part 4—"Responsibility and Accountability." Includes section, "Personnel Standards," by Milton M. Mandell.

"Municipal Personnel Data." In *Municipal Year Book*. Chicago, International City Managers' Association.

Section appears regularly in the annual volumes; covers trends, salaries, statistical data, and lists sources of information.

National Civil Service League and National Municipal League. "A Model State Civil Service Law." New York, The League, 1953. 32 pp.

A model law, adaptable to any level of government, embodying generally accepted principles of public personnel administration.

Nigro, Felix A. (Ed.) "Personnel Administration [Seven Publications]." Pp. 201-311 in his *Public Administration: Readings and Documents*. New York, Rinehart and Co., 1951. 493 pp.

Includes sections on the function of the executive and personnel administration, with readings on classification, recruitment, examinations, training, promotion, and employee organizations.

Nigro, Felix A. "Public Personnel Administration." New York, Henry Holt and Co., 1959. 499 pp.

People-oriented rather than process-oriented, this book emphasizes the most important problems in planning and carrying out a personnel program in a typical public agency. Discusses in detail various phases of the personnel program such as position classification, compensation, recruitment and the career service, selection, training, service rating, supervision, and morale and discipline as they are practiced in various countries of the world.

Pfiffner, John M., and Presthus, Robert V. "Public Administration." (4th ed.) New York, Ronald Press, 1960. 570 pp.

A standard text in the field of public administration at all levels of government. Discusses the traditional technical aspects of administration and emphasizes those areas that seem most important in understanding the rapid advances being made in the field. Also covers decision-making, the impact of data processing, and the human-relations approach in administrative leadership.

Powell, Norman J. "Personnel Administration in Government." Englewood Cliffs, N. J., Prentice-Hall, 1956. 548 pp.

Part I gives the background setting of personnel administration in government; Part II discusses special aspects and problems such as patronage, comparison of personnel administration in government and industry, ethical conduct, and security and loyalty; Part III develops the processes of public personnel administration such as classification, pay, recruiting, employee relations, etc. Each chapter ends with a summary list of conclusions.

Reining, Henry, Jr. "Cases of Public Personnel Administration." Dubuque, Iowa, William C. Brown Co., 1949. 132 pp.

Presents 62 cases covering all aspects of public personnel administration.

Shartle, Carroll L. "Occupational Information: Its Development and Application." (3rd ed.) Englewood Cliffs, N. J., Prentice-Hall, 1960. 384 pp.

A standard reference work for vocational guidance counselors and personnel technicians.

Stahl, O. Glenn. "Public Personnel Administration." (4th ed.) New York, Harper and Brothers, 1956. 628 pp.

Completely rewritten edition of the previous work by Mosher, Kingsley, and Stahl. Gives greater emphasis to principle and philosophy and includes three new chapters: "Career System Patterns," "Public Service Ethics in a Democracy," and "The Horizons of Public Personnel Administration."

Torpey, William G. "Public Personnel Management." New York, D. Van Nostrand Co., 1953. 431 pp.

Presents principles and practices of public personnel administration with the aim of synthesizing the academic and practical approaches.

U. S. Employment Service. "Dictionary of Occupational Titles." (2nd ed.) Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1949. 2 vols.

Vol. I: "Definition of Titles." Vol. II: "Occupational Classifications." The standard listing of occupations in the United States.

Veeder, William J. "A Personnel Ordinance for Small Council-Manager Cities." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1952. 18 pp. (Personnel Report No. 523)

A suggested personnel ordinance for small council-manager cities which provides a firm legal framework on which to build personnel policy.

White, Leonard D. "Introduction to the Study of Public Administration." (4th ed.) New York, Macmillan Co., 1955. 531 pp.

Complete revision within the general framework of the previous editions. Section devoted to personnel management has been compressed in order to make room for two new chapters dealing with industrial relations in the public service, and with the problem of loyalty and security.

Special Problems

American Assembly. "The Federal Government Service: Its Character, Prestige and Problems." New York, The Assembly, 1954. 189 pp.

Proceedings of the Sixth American Assembly, which was devoted to the problems of the Federal Service. Part I: "The Growth of the Federal Personnel System." Part II: "The President, the Congress, and the Federal Government Service." Part III: "Political Parties, Patronage and the Federal Government Service." Part IV: "Distinguishing Marks of the Federal Government Service." Part V: "Modern Personnel Management and the Federal Government Service."

Appleby, Paul. "Morality and Administration in Democratic Government." Baton Rouge, La., Louisiana State University Press, 1952. 261 pp.

Compares standards of administrative morality in private and public life, and studies some of the sources of trouble in governmental administration. The many factors involved in decisions between conflicting interests and in considerations of ethics and loyalty are weighed, and the pattern of administrative responsibility in a democracy is developed.

Bernstein, Marver H. "The Job of the Federal Executive." Washington, The Brookings Institution, 1958. 241 pp.

An exploratory study of the job of the federal executive and of the environment in which he works. Considers such questions as the nature of the executive's role and job, the differences in the functions of political and career executives, the special characteristics of the environment in which the federal executive operates, and the problem of obtaining and developing effective executives.

David, Paul T., and Pollock, Ross. "Executives for Government: Central Issues of Federal Personnel Administration." Washington, D. C., The Brookings Institution, 1957. 186 pp.

Discusses four major issues related to the problem of obtaining executives for government: Means of obtaining a sufficient supply of competent, qualified and politically loyal executives for top-level appointee positions; relative emphasis which should be given to alternative staffing concepts in filling the higher non-political posts; means of providing a more effective career service system for the upper levels of the federal civil service; and the need, if any, for a clear line of demarcation between the political and non-political appointee positions in the upper levels of the federal service.

Douglas, Paul H. "Ethics in Government." Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 1952. 114 pp.

Discusses political moral standards, ethical problems of administrators, ethical problems of legislators, and suggests further recommendations for improvement.

Eisenstadt, S. N. "Bureaucracy and Bureaucratization: A Trend Report and Bibliography." *Current Sociology*, Vol. VII, No. 2, 1958.

Summarizes the aspects of bureaucracy which constituted topics for analysis in the sociological "classics" and provides a brief survey of the major trends in specialized research in the field.

Ginzberg, Eli, and Anderson, James K. "Manpower for Government—A Decade's Forecast." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1958. 33 pp.

Discusses the major economic, employment, and demographic trends in the United States and how they will affect the manpower picture in the 1960's. Gives directions for action by government to secure adequate and competent personnel in the years ahead.

Goode, Cecil E. "Personnel Research Frontiers." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1958. 176 pp.

Report of a survey on the extent of ongoing research activities in the field of personnel and an inventory of the facilities and financial resources going into such research, with special reference to their implications for government. The author presents his conclusions and recommendations. The survey was conducted by Mr. Goode for the Public Personnel Association under a grant from the Ford Foundation.

Hieronymus, George H. "Job Design: Meeting the Manpower Challenge." Washington, D. C., Society for Personnel Administration, 1958. 42 pp. (Pamphlet No. 15)

Points out the compelling reasons for designing or re-designing jobs so as to make the best use of the highest skills, knowledge, and ability of employees; describes the means, methods, and practices to be applied to such job design.

Meriam, Lewis. "Public Personnel Problems from the Standpoint of the Operating Officer." Washington, D. C., The Brookings Institution, 1938. 440 pp.

Discusses all aspects of public personnel administration from the standpoint of the operating official responsible for getting specific tasks done or for rendering specific governmental

services. Treats the subject simply and realistically, with use of illustrative cases.

Millett, John D. "Management in the Public Service; The Quest for Effective Performance." New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1954. 417 pp.

Presents the common problems of management that face department or agency heads from the practical rather than the political or theoretical point of view. Includes chapters on leadership, communication, and supervision as parts of the common problems of work direction; and essentials of personnel policy and techniques of personnel management as some of the common problems of work operation.

Sayre, Wallace S., and Mosher, Frederick C. "An Agenda for Research in Public Personnel Administration." Washington, D. C., National Planning Association, 1959. 64 pp.

A review of the major types of research needed to increase basic knowledge and achieve fresh perspective on public personnel administration.

Society for Personnel Administration. "Professional Standards for Personnel Work." Washington, D. C., The Society, 1956. 32 pp.

Covers the professional status of personnel work, the characteristics of personnel work, the background of persons currently in the personnel field, and desirable preparation for personnel work.

U. S. Department of Agriculture Graduate School. "Democracy in Federal Administration." 1956 Jump. McKillop Memorial Lectures. 80 pp. (paperbound).

Discussions of ethics, impact of specialization, future status of the U. S. public service.

U. S. Department of Agriculture Graduate School. "The Influences of Social, Scientific, and Economic Trends on Governmental Administration." 1960 Jump. McKillop Lectures. 80 pp. (paperbound).

Includes treatment of various personnel problems—recruitment, classification, personnel utilization, and effective executive development.

Wengert, E. S., and others. "Prescription for the Public Service." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1954. 20 pp. (Personnel Report No. 541; out of print)

Represents a sincere effort on the part of three recognized public administrators to ana-

lyze the complex problems that face the public service in the United States and Canada.

Reports of Special Studies

Page, Thomas. "State Personnel Reorganization in Illinois." Urbana, University of Illinois, Institute of Government and Public Affairs, 1961. 165 pp.

A study of an attempt to adapt an "ideal" organization for personnel administration to the political and administrative realities of the environment in which it has to operate.

President's Committee on Administrative Management. "Report of the Committee with Studies of Administrative Management in the Federal Government." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1937. 382 pp.

The report of the "Brownlow Committee." Contains recommendations on federal personnel management.

U. S. Commission on Organization of the Executive Branch of the Government. "Personnel and Civil Service; A Report to the Congress." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., February, 1955. 101 pp.

Report to Congress on federal personnel of the second "Hoover Commission."

U. S. Commission on Organization of the Executive Branch of the Government. "Personnel Management; A Report to the Congress." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., February, 1949. 59 pp.

Report to Congress on federal personnel of the first "Hoover Commission."

U. S. Commission on Organization of the Executive Branch of the Government. "Programs for Strengthening Federal Personnel Management; A Report with Recommendations." Task Force Report on Federal Personnel [Appendix A], by the Personnel Policy Committee. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., January, 1949. 101 pp.

Report of the Task Force on federal personnel of the first "Hoover Commission."

U. S. Commission on Organization of the Executive Branch of the Government. "Report on Personnel and Civil Service." Task Force on Personnel and Civil Service, Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., February, 1955. 252 pp.

Report of the Task Force on personnel and

civil service of the second "Hoover Commission."

Historical and Descriptive Material

Campbell, C. A. "The Civil Service in Britain." London, Pelican, 1955. 383 pp. (paperbound).

A detailed description of the British civil service, its development, organization, and basic policies. Includes extensive descriptions of personnel operations in various ministries.

Case, Harry L. "The TVA Experience." New York, Harper and Brothers, 1955. 176 pp.

A study of personnel administration in the Tennessee Valley Authority and of some of its possible implications for the public service in general.

Chapman, Brian. "The Profession of Government." New York, Macmillan, 1959. 352 pp.

A comparative study of the public service in European governments. Describes how the common personnel functions are handled in the various countries covered, and provides historical background to the development of the public service as a whole and of each of its principal phases.

Gladden, E. N. "Civil Service or Bureaucracy?" London, Staples Press, Ltd., 1956. 224 pp.

A description of the British Civil Service as a developing institution, with special reference to its problems as a working body, and a critical examination of the present situation. Suggests lines for future development.

Lindsay, David R. "What's Ahead for Civil Service?" New York, Public Affairs Committee, 1957. 28 pp. (Public Affairs Pamphlet No. 258)

A brief description of the principal features of the federal civil service system together with a history of its development. Personnel administration at other levels of government is also treated briefly.

U. S. Civil Service Commission. "The Federal Career Service—At YOUR Service." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1961. Unpaged.

An introduction to the federal civil service for the newly appointed federal executive. Discusses the size of government, the concept of the career service, characteristics of the career staff, the excepted service, and other important features of the federal personnel system of spe-

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

cial interest to executives coming to the federal service for the first time.

Van Riper, Paul. "History of the United States Civil Service." Evanston, Ill., Row, Peterson and Co., 1958. 588 pp.

A study of the United States Civil Service in its development from 1789 to the present. Outlines the general nature and effects of the social interaction which has produced a public service suited to U. S. institutions, brings to light some relatively neglected aspects of the growth of our expanding administrative mechanism, and suggests an approach to the development of a theory of administrative organization appropriate to a democratic, pluralistic state.

Industrial Personnel Management

Jucius, Michael J. "Personnel Management." (4th ed.) Homewood, Ill., Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1959. 763 pp.

A standard text on industrial personnel management.

Pigors, Paul, and Myers, Charles A. "Personnel Administration: A Point of View and a Method." (3rd ed.) New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1956. 711 pp.

The third edition of a standard text on the personnel function in industry. Presents case studies.

Scott, Walter Dill, Clothier, Robert C., and Spriegel, William R. "Personnel Management: Principles, Practices and Point of View." (6th ed.) New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1961. 623 pp.

The latest edition of a long-standard work on industrial personnel management. Contains new material on human relations and a survey of personnel practices in private industry.

Taylor, James H. "Personnel Administration: Evaluation and Executive Control." New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1959. 326 pp.

Written from the perspective of the private business organization, this book contains much that is pertinent to public personnel administration as viewed by the high-level agency executive. Personnel administration is treated as an integral phase of the management process.

Yoder, Dale. "Personnel Principles and Policies." Englewood Cliffs, N. J., Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1959. 599 pp.

A general non-technical introduction to the principles of personnel management and industrial relations.

Yoder, Dale; Heneman, H. G., Jr., Turnbull, John G., and Stone, C. Harold. "Handbook of Personnel Management and Labor Relations." New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1958. Various pages.

A handbook and source book of tested practices in personnel management stressing the "how to do it." Subject matter covers every major function in the personnel management field in industry.

● Personnel Agency Management

American Management Association. "Justifying the Personnel Program: Costs—Budgets—Evaluation." New York, 1954. 51 pp. (Personnel Series No. 160)

Contents: "How the Personnel Program Pays Off," by Walter H. Powell; "Evaluating and Reporting Personnel Functions," by Seward H. French, Jr.; "Controlling and Measuring Personnel Costs," by E. W. Dwyer; "How To Present the Personnel Budget," by Howard M. Dirks.

Crouch, Winston W. "The Responsibilities of a Civil Service Commissioner." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1959. 14 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 19)

Discusses the extent and variety of responsibilities of a civil service commissioner, and concludes that they are basically: to provide policy leadership; to oversee the work of the technical staff; to develop and maintain understanding of and acceptance of those principles by the governing body and by the community; to ensure that equal opportunity and fair play govern the operation of personnel practices.

Crouch, Winston W., and Jamison, Judith N. "Hearings and Appeals: A Guide for Civil Service Commissioners." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1953. 24 pp. (Personnel Report No. 535)

Non-technical, non-legalistic statement on various types of hearings found useful in civil service and personnel board practice.

Crouch, Winston W., and Jamison, Judith N. "The Work of Civil Service Commissions." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1955. 46 pp. (Personnel Report No. 553)

Survey of 230 commission and board-type agencies with over 800 commissioners reveals composition, selection methods, duties and compensation for members. Tells something of the organization of civil service commission meet-

ings, how they are conducted and the type of function they perform. Gives some pointers on handling the major functions which a central personnel agency usually performs.

Lang, Theodore H. "Public Personnel Councils: Their Organization, Composition, Functions, and Operations." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1958. 30 pp. (Personnel Report No. 583)

Outlines problems involved in setting up personnel councils and discusses the function they serve in personnel administration. Includes appendix on public personnel councils in the United States.

Luck, T. J. "Personnel Audit and Appraisal." New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1955. 317 pp.

Deals primarily with personnel program evaluation in the large business organization in at least two ways: (1) the audit and appraisal process as developed in this book is in large part applicable to, and, to varying degrees, is in use in the field of public administration; and (2) the concepts and criteria on which audit and appraisal may be based are well stated and quite relevant to the assessment of an agency personnel system.

Page, Thomas. (Ed.) "The Public Personnel Agency and the Chief Executive—A Symposium." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1960. 40 pp. (Personnel Report No. 601)

A distinguished group of contributors from the fields of public personnel administration, political science, and public employee organizations present their views on how to best organize the personnel function at all levels of government.

Pfiffner, John M., and others. "What Every Civil Service Commissioner Needs To Know." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1956. 18 pp. (Personnel Report No. 562)

Contents: "The Functions and Duties of a Civil Service Commission," by John M. Pfiffner; "What I Have Learned as a Civil Service Commissioner," by James V. Bellanca; and "How To Get Commission-Staff Teamwork," by Charles W. Terry.

Public Personnel Association. "Public Relations of Public Personnel Agencies." Chicago, The Association, 1946. 259 pp.

A basic text, dealing with an area of increasing concern to public personnel agencies. Published as one of PPA's widely known "Policies and Practices" series.

Ruhl, Eleanor S. "Public Relations for Government Employees: An Action Program." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1952. 32 pp. (Personnel Report No. 524; out of print)

Basic assumption is that public relations involves everyone in an organization, not just a public relations officer or personnel department. Indicates some of the elements of public relations and outlines a few public-relations techniques.

Stover, Robert D. "Use of Personnel Consultants." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1955. 6 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 15; out of print)

Discusses use of personnel consultants and gives suggestions for selecting and hiring them.

U. S. Civil Service Commission. "An Approach to Work Measurement of Personnel Activities." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1956. 23 pp.

Presents a workable system for applying work measurement to personnel programs and operations.

U. S. Civil Service Commission. "Evaluating Your Personnel Management." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1954. 88 pp. (Personnel Management Series No. 6)

Presents principles and techniques by which an agency can evaluate its personnel program. Poses questions as to agency activity in various segments of personnel program and suggests methods and sources for securing information that will answer these questions.

U. S. Department of the Air Force. "Civilian Personnel: Guide to Evaluation of Civilian Personnel Management Activities in the Air Force." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1957. 134 pp. (Air Force Manual 40-5)

A checklist for the evaluation of air force facility personnel programs. Provides a fairly complete listing of personnel program functions and program elements.

● Classification and Pay

Baruch, Ismar. "Cost-of-Living Pay Adjustment Plans." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1953. 6 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 4; out of print)

Explains how cost-of-living pay adjustment plans work, their advantages and disadvantages.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Baruch, Ismar. "Position-Classification in the Public Service." (See entry under Civil Service Assembly, below.)

Brennan, Charles W. "Wage Administration; Plans, Practices, and Principles." Homewood, Ill., Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1959. 439 pp.

Textbook explaining such instruments of wage administration as job analysis, job evaluation, wage incentives, and personnel rating, and providing a vocabulary of its terms.

Byers, Kenneth M., Montilla, Robert, and Williams, Elmer V. "Elements of Position Classification in Local Government." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1955. 49 pp. (Personnel Report No. 554)

Pamphlet which discusses all phases of position classification from a practical viewpoint. Prepared for use of untrained personnel in small public jurisdictions who want to apply the elements of position classification for their particular purposes.

Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada. "Position-Classification in the Public Service; A Report Submitted to the Civil Service Assembly by the Committee on Position-Classification and Pay Plans in the Public Service." Chicago, The Assembly, 1941. 404 pp. (Out of print)

This publication is a basic text for anyone interested in position-classification in public jurisdictions. It is out of print, but should be available in public libraries and research institutions.

International Labour Office. "Job Evaluation." Washington, D. C., The Office, 1960. 146 pp. (Studies and Reports, New Series No. 56)

Describes the various systems of job evaluations used, gives examples and information on actual experience with job evaluation schemes, and discusses some of the problems and criticisms that have arisen in connection with the use of job evaluation.

Krause, Robert D. "The Pros and Cons of Longevity Pay Plans." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1959. 41 pp. (Personnel Report No. 591)

Defines longevity pay, discusses the principles involved, analyzes the advantages and disadvantages in relation to the basic pay plan, outlines steps in adopting a longevity pay plan, and discusses alternatives.

Ocheltree, Keith. "How to Prepare a Sound Pay Plan." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1957. 41 pp. (Personnel Report No. 572)

Discusses the basic considerations involved with this fundamental aspect of any public personnel program. Provides step-by-step instructions for setting up, adopting, and maintaining an equitable and workable pay policy.

Public Personnel Association. "Pay Rates in the Public Service." Chicago, semi-annually. (Available to PPA members only)

A series of semi-annual surveys of common job classes in a selected group of governmental jurisdictions in the United States and Canada.

Society for Personnel Administration. "Position Evaluation Techniques; A Discussion and Appraisal." Washington, D. C., The Society, 1956. 28 pp. (Pamphlet No. 10)

Examines position evaluation systems and techniques with emphasis on distinguishing levels and gradations of positions. Presents criteria for appraising evaluation techniques and then describes and analyzes particular evaluation systems and techniques and applies these criteria.

U. S. Department of the Air Force. "Planning, Conducting, and Completing Classification Surveys." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1952. 13 pp. (Program Supplement No. 13, AFM 40-1)

Underlines vital facts which the classifier should consider in drawing a realistic survey schedule and follows with a step-by-step outline explaining how to complete an actual survey.

U. S. General Services Administration, Office of Management, Personnel Division. "Guide for Wage Surveys." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1955. 17 pp. (Special Guide No. 1)

Step-by-step guide with pointers on how to proceed in collecting wage survey information.

● Recruitment and Selection

Adkins, Dorothy C. "Construction and Analysis of Achievement Tests." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1947. 292 pp.

Presents basic concepts and methods in the development and analysis of achievement tests. Covers test planning, test construction, basic statistical tools, and analysis of test results.

Bingham, Walter Van Dyke, and Moore, Bruce V. "How to Interview." (4th ed. rev.) New York, Harper, 1959. 277 pp.

Particularly brings out the developments in self-concept, personality and information theory, and psychodynamic and psychoanalytic concepts.

Brown, Ralph S., Jr. "Loyalty and Security; Employment Tests in the United States." New Haven, Conn., Yale University Press, 1958. 524 pp. (Yale Law School Studies No. 3)

A survey and synthesis of loyalty and security measures with suggestions for correcting and eliminating apparent excesses. Concentrates on these matters as they pertain to employment tests.

Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada. "Placement and Probation in the Public Service." Chicago, The Assembly, 1946. 201 pp.

A basic text, essential to any well-rounded professional library on public personnel administration. Published as one of PPA's widely known "Policies and Practices" series.

Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada. "Recruiting Applicants for the Public Service." Chicago, The Assembly, 1942. 200 pp.

The report of the Civil Service Assembly on recruiting applicants for the public service, issued as part of the "Policies and Practices" series. The standard source in this aspect of public personnel administration.

Coppock, Robert W., and Coppock, Barbara Brattin. "How to Recruit and Select Policemen and Firemen." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1958. 65 pp. (Personnel Report No. 581)

A working manual for the fire chief, police chief, city manager, civil service commissioner, and personnel director. Tells, step-by-step, how to plan and execute a recruitment and testing program to obtain competent men for fire and police work. Contains 15 exhibits of recruitment and publicity material, plus application and interview forms that can be adapted to fit local needs.

Corson, John J. "Executives for the Federal Service; A Program for Action in Time of Crisis." New York, Columbia University Press, 1952. 91 pp.

Pinpoints the critical nature of the lack of an adequate career system for top-ranking civilian executives. Tells what numbers and

types of executives are needed, how they are recruited, and problems involved in retaining and utilizing them.

Cronbach, Lee J. "Essentials of Psychological Testing." (2nd ed.) New York, Harper and Brothers, 1960. 650 pp.

Describes the major types of psychological tests and their uses. Gives considerable attention to standardized tests.

Dooher, M. Joseph, and Marting, Elizabeth. (Eds.) "Selection of Management Personnel." New York, American Management Association, 1957. 2 Vols.

A handbook of management selection. Also touches upon management recruitment and training as they are related to the selection process.

Hagerty, Philip E. "The Placement Interview." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1957. 8 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 18)

Pamphlet designed to help line supervisors and personnel administrators conduct better hiring interviews. Discusses objectives and techniques of interviewing, and explains how to reject applicants.

McCann, Forbes E., and others. "Physical Condition Tests in the Selection of Public Employees." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1958. 55 pp. (Personnel Report No. 582)

Provides guidelines in selecting and conducting tests to measure physical ability, stamina, and coordination. Gives complete instructions for giving 12 tests and tables for three different scoring methods. Particularly useful to agencies with small personnel staffs.

Marvick, D. (Ed.) "Political Decision Makers: Recruitment and Performance." Glencoe, Ill., The Free Press, 1960.

Discusses recruitment, socialization, and professionalization of top level officials.

Pfiffner, John M., and others. "Selecting Supervisors for the Public Service." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1955. 25 pp. (Personnel Report No. 551)

Contents: "New Concepts in Supervision," by John M. Pfiffner; "Use of Written Tests in Selecting Supervisors," by Joseph W. Hawthorne; "Use of Group Interview in Selecting Supervisors," by Harold Fields.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Pollock, Ross. "Guides for Rating Training and Experience." Washington, D. C., U. S. Civil Service Commission, 1955. 5 pp.

Lists 26 rating guides which can be used to rate training and experience records.

Society for Personnel Administration. "A Guide to College Recruitment." Washington, D. C., The Society, 1956. 15 pp. (Pamphlet No. 12)

Points out that a positive, aggressive, and continuing recruitment program is necessary to attract and retain college graduates. Outlines a program which is designed to attract high-caliber college talent in administrative, scientific, technical, and professional areas.

Taylor, Vernon R. "Guide for Setting Passing Points." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1959. 15 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 20)

Presents guides to the setting of passing points in written examinations when a flexible passing point system is used. Intended largely as a training aid. Includes a checklist which summarizes information needed and factors to be considered in setting passing points.

U. S. Civil Service Commission. "Improving Employment Reference Checks; Guides for the Construction and Use of Mail Reference Questionnaires (Vouchers) To Obtain Employment Information on Job Applicants," by Eva Stunkel, Sara M. Heitman, and Isabel S. Davidoff. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1955. 85 pp. (Personnel Methods Series No. 1)

U. S. Civil Service Commission. "Rating Training and Experience of Job Applicants." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1953. 55 pp. (A Test Development Program)

Draft of a report exploring the theory underlying the process of rating training and experience in civil service examinations.

U. S. Civil Service Commission. "Recruiting Scientists and Engineers for the United States Civil Service." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1959. 46 pp.

Report of proceedings of a Conference on Scientific Manpower, Washington, D. C., April 28-29, 1959. Partial contents: "Enhancing the Competitive Position of the Federal Government in the Acquisition and Retention of Scientific Talent," by Dr. Ralph D. Bennett; "Improving the Government's Scientific Service," by Dr. James R. Killian, Jr.; "Selecting for

Quality" (panel discussion); "Creativity and Technological Process," by Dr. C. Guy Suits; "Identifying Research Potential Through the Examining Process," by Dr. John G. Darley.

U. S. Civil Service Commission. "The Supervisor's Role in Selective Placement of the Physically Handicapped." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1957. 6 pp.

Outlines development of the program to employ physically handicapped in the federal government, and tells what the supervisor, specifically, can do to support the program.

U. S. Department of the Air Force. "Effective College Recruiting." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1956. 27 pp. (Program Supplement No. 24)

Offers guides for use in planning college recruitment activities. Tells, step-by-step how to plan and organize a recruiting program and how to apply and evaluate the results. Includes samples of procedures and forms developed by Air Research and Development Command.

U. S. Department of the Air Force. "Help Meet Labor Market Shortages in Professional Skills." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1959. 16 pp. (Air Force Pamphlet No. 40-15-4)

Suggestions as to how Air Force installations can aid in attracting recruits into those fields in which personnel shortages are acute: engineering, science, and technology.

U. S. Department of the Army. "Employment of the Physically Handicapped." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1957. 12 pp. (Civilian Personnel Pamphlet No. 54)

Presents suggestions and techniques for development and maintenance of an active program to employ the physically handicapped.

Wood, Dorothy Adkins. "Test Construction: Development and Interpretation of Achievement Tests." Columbus, Ohio, Charles F. Merrill Books, Inc., 1960. 134 pp.

A simple and understandable approach to the basic principles of test preparation and interpretation. Discusses individual differences and the use of tests as predictors and as teaching aids. The principles of psychological measurements, the relative usefulness of various common types of objective test items, and the planning, construction, and analysis of tests are also covered.

• Training, Supervision, and Employee Development

Adams, Robert W. "The Complete Employee; A Handbook for Personnel Appraisal." Chicago, Public Administration Service, 1959. 68 pp.

Presents four aspects of an individual to be described to give a complete picture: mental capacity; work habits and attitudes; stability; and "get-along-ability." Includes a list of two thousand words grouped in these four categories for ease in evaluating an employee.

Batson, Robert J. "Employee Evaluation: A Review of Current Methods and a Suggested New Approach." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1957. 39 pp. (Personnel Report No. 571)

Traces history of performance rating, gives present development and limitations of this technique, and suggests a new approach to employee evaluation.

Brunton, Robert L. "A Manual for Municipal In-Service Training; Purpose, Method, Procedures." Chicago, International City Managers' Association, 1960. 40 pp.

Discusses the importance of training, the problems of organizing a training program, methods which may be used in formal in-service training, the conference method of instruction and its variations, how to evaluate training, and how to make training more effective.

Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada. Committee on Employee Training in the Public Service. "Employee Training in the Public Service." Chicago, The Assembly, 1941. 172 pp. (Out of print)

Comprehensive survey of the subject. Includes the management of training activities, techniques of training, training materials, the training department, and evaluation of training.

DePhillips, Frank A., Berliner, William M., and Cribbin, James J. "Management of Training Programs." Homewood, Ill., Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1960. 469 pp.

A presentation of training methods and techniques emphasizing the concept of training as an integral phase of the managerial process.

Heyel, Carl. "Appraising Executive Performance." New York, American Management Association, 1958. 189 pp.

Offers an organized approach to appraisal of

executive performance which utilizes principles and guidelines distilled from a variety of experiences. Emphasizes that a formal appraisal once a year, followed by an appraisal interview, is not enough; it needs to be a continuing process.

Jurgensen, Clifford E., Lopez, Felix M., Jr., and Richards, Kenneth E. "Employee Performance Appraisal Re-examined." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1961. 29 pp. (Personnel Report No. 613)

Without minimizing the complexities and hazards, the authors sound an optimistic note for the feasibility of developing sound, accurate techniques of rating and evaluating employee performance. They speak from long-term experience in working with this problem in both industry and public service and show a keen awareness of the pitfalls as well as the possibilities involved in this difficult aspect of personnel relations.

McLean, Joseph E. (Ed.) "The Public Service and University Education." Princeton, N. J., Princeton University Press, 1949. 246 pp.

Fundamental problems of the relationship between higher education and the public service in a free society, including the basic personnel needs of government in the domestic and international area, the experience of the British civil service, and the capacity of American universities to meet these needs.

Maier, Norman R. F. "The Appraisal Interview; Objectives, Methods, and Skills." New York, John Wiley and Sons, 1958. 246 pp.

Describes and illustrates three appraisal interview methods: tell and sell; tell and listen; problem solving. Explains each method in terms of objectives, skills required, and motivational problems involved, and then tests the three methods with case material.

Randall, Raymond L. (Ed.) "Executive Development in Action: Patterns and Techniques." Washington, D. C., Society for Personnel Administration, 1955. 31 pp. (Pamphlet No. 9)

Based upon the proceedings of the First and Second Annual Institute for Executive Development, 1953-1954, "this document attempts to capture in topical outline form the main trends of thought at these sessions without identifying contributors."

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Sherwood, Frank P., and Best, Wallace H. "Supervisory Methods in Municipal Administration." Chicago, International City Managers' Association, Institute for Training in Municipal Administration, 1958. 302 pp. (Municipal Management Series)

Aims to help the supervisor analyze his duties and acquire effective techniques and insight into the human relations aspect of his job.

Society for Personnel Administration. "The Case Method: A Technique of Management Development." Washington, D. C., The Society, 1957. 32 pp. (Pamphlet No. 14)

Proceedings of a work shop on the case-study method. Discusses the philosophy and objectives of the case method, case qualities and case construction, climate and participation, and the question of whether the case method can change people. Contains a selected bibliography.

Sweeney, Stephen B., and Davy, Thomas J. (Eds.) "Education for Administrative Careers in Government Service." Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 1958. 366 pp.

Presents results of a research-conference program conducted during 1956-1957 to determine what is the best education and training for those who wish careers in local and state government. Partial contents: Part 1—"Education for Administrative Policy-making Careers"; Part 2—"The Position and Role of the Administrative Policy-making Officer."

U. S. Civil Service Commission. "Selecting Supervisors." Prepared by Milton Mandell and Sally Greenberg. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1951. 26 pp.

Lists and discusses qualities desirable in candidates considered for promotion to supervisory positions, and essential elements of a supervisory selection program. Includes sample voucher forms for first level and higher supervisory positions.

U. S. Civil Service Commission. Program Planning Division. "How to Start an Executive Development Program; An Outline." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1956. 25 pp.

Explains what executive development is and outlines a summary of action steps for setting up such programs. Also discusses in some detail specific items which should be developed to support the action program.

U. S. Department of the Army. "Getting Ready To Train Employees." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1953. 17 pp. (Civilian Personnel Pamphlet No. 41-B-53)

Covers the planning a supervisor must do and the actions he should take to prepare for organized job training where more formal and intensive instruction is necessary.

U. S. Department of the Army. "Training Needs and How To Find Them." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1953. 17 pp. (Civilian Personnel Pamphlet No. 41-B-51)

Points out the need for job training and suggests sources and methods through which specific needs can be located and defined.

• Morale and Discipline

American Management Association. "Leadership on the Job." New York, The Association, 1957. 303 pp.

Intended primarily for supervisors, this symposium presents the thinking of 23 leaders in the field, covering such subjects as communications, employee development, employee attitudes, absenteeism, union-management relations, and community relations, with heavy emphasis on human-relations techniques.

Batson, Robert J. "Employee Suggestion Systems." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1953. 7 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 1)

Summarizes some of the problems which must be solved to get a suggestion system in motion.

Beal, George; Bohlen, Joseph, and Randenbaugh, Neil. "Leadership and Dynamic Group Action." Ames, Iowa State University Press, 1960. 250 pp.

Applications of psychological principles to leadership of group activities. Practical emphasis on manipulation of groups.

Berlo, David K. "The Process of Communication: An Introduction to Theory and Practice." New York, Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1960. 318 pp.

A contemporary and basic theoretic work.

Davis, Keith. "Human Relations in Business." New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1957. 557 pp.

A textbook covering all phases of human relations at the work-place. Includes cases.

Davis, Keith, and Scott, William G. "Readings in Human Relations." New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1959. 473 pp.

A book of readings on human relations emphasizing recent developments, and drawn from various disciplines including sociology, psychology, philosophy, scientific management, and labor economics. Stresses philosophy, concepts, and principles rather than techniques.

Hegarty, Edward J. "How To Build Job Enthusiasm." New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1960. 257 pp.

Gives the manager specific ways that he can help his subordinates to show an interest in their jobs, improve their day-to-day performance, and prepare themselves for advancement to better jobs.

Herzberg, Frederick. "The Motivation to Work." (2nd ed.) New York, John Wiley and Sons, 1959. 157 pp.

The findings of a study conducted to determine what people think about their jobs, and how these thoughts affect their lives.

Kennedy, John R., Williams, Douglas, and Katzell, Raymond A. "Understanding the Employee as an Individual." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1961. 19 pp. (Personnel Report No. 614)

Each author provides insight into particular aspects of employee behavior. One focuses on the problem employee and deals with such specifics as absenteeism, alcoholism, uncooperativeness, and the physically and mentally handicapped. The second tells of some of the contributions made by the behavioral sciences to an understanding of employees; and the third discusses the why, who, how, and where of the use of employee attitude surveys.

Maier, Norman R. F. "Principles of Human Relations." New York, John Wiley and Sons, 1952. 474 pp.

Discusses methods of overcoming communication barriers, preventing misunderstandings and developing the constructive side of man's nature. Also includes a discussion of problems of human relations, new techniques and approaches to them, and the problems involved in training persons to practice effective techniques.

Merrifield, Charles W. (Ed.) "Leadership in Voluntary Enterprise." New York, Oceana Publications, 1961. 232 pp.

Simple and useful discussions of social environments of organizations, of character and requirements of effective leadership, individual-

organizational relations, and character of "democratic organization."

Miller, George A., Galanter, Eugene, and Priham, Karl A. "Plans and the Structure of Behavior." New York, Henry Holt, 1960. 226 pp.

An intriguing and basic examination of "what a human mechanism can be and do." Essentially a psychological study, the book has a provocative relevance to the person who would examine psychological behavior in administrative organization and factors which condition the effective use of personnel.

Petrullo, L., and Bass, B. M. (Eds.) "Leadership and Interpersonal Behavior." New York, Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1961. 382 pp.

Combines a basic theory with a variety of organizational applications directly relevant to management and personnel administration—leadership and personnel motivation—with emphasis upon both small groups and large organizations.

Redfield, Charles E. "Communication in Management; A Guide to Administrative Communication." Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1953. 290 pp.

Covers in an orderly and systematic way the fundamentals of communication for the executive. Part Two deals specifically with downward and outward communications including ordering, oral or written instructions, manuals, and employee handbooks.

Schutte, William M., and Sternberg, E. W. "Communication in Business and Industry." New York, Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1960. 410 pp.

Systematic examination of many aspects of communications in bureaucratic organization, with much that is relevant to personnel utilization and management.

Selznick, Philip. "Leadership in Administration." Evanston, Ill., Rowe, Peterson and Co., 1957. 162 pp.

A study of leadership in administrative organizations from the sociological point of view.

Society for Personnel Administration. "Ways to Speed Up Removal of Unsatisfactory Employees." Washington, D. C., The Society, 1954. 22 pp. (Pamphlet No. 6)

Suggestions for simplifying the removal-for-cause process in the federal civil service. Discusses present removal problems and their solutions and also presents a model policy and procedure for removals.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Tannenbaum, R., Weschler, I., and Masarik, F. "Leadership and Organization." New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1961. 480 pp.

A behavioral approach to the subject, with stress upon the application of concepts and theories of effective personnel utilization.

Tiffin, Joseph, and McCormick, Ernest J. "Industrial Psychology." Englewood Cliffs, N. J., Prentice-Hall, 1958. 584 pp.

Discusses the applications of industrial psychology to the traditional personnel functions, as well as to the area concerned with the adaptation of work to the capacities and limitations of human beings or "human engineering."

U. S. Civil Service Commission. "Recognizing Employees Through Incentive Awards; A Guide for Federal Supervisors and Executives." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1954. 14 pp. (Personnel Management Series No. 5)

Principal satisfactions which people derive from working are discussed and the importance of employee organization is stressed. Comments on factors which make an incentive awards program work and points out pitfalls to avoid in initiating such a program. Describes financial and non-financial incentives available in federal service.

U. S. Department of the Air Force. "Improving Management Through Employee Attitude Surveys." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1954. 92 pp. (Program Supplement No. 17)

Step-by-step outline for conducting an attitude survey, including sample survey questionnaire and tables and charts for data analysis.

• Employee Benefits and Services

Fay, Lew, and Peterson, Gordon W. "Medical Examinations for Public Employees [City and County of San Diego, Calif.]." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1954. 49 pp. (Personnel Report No. 545; out of print)

Sets up some useful criteria for a public agency to follow in deciding whether to develop a medical examining program and what types might be considered. Appendices include program, standards, and forms which are used by City and County of San Diego.

Gregg, Davis W. "Group Life Insurance." (Rev. ed.) Homewood, Ill., Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1957. 262 pp.

Analysis of concepts, contracts, costs and company practices.

Heisel, W. D. "Developing a Safety Program for City Employees." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1954. 5 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 14)

Summarizes elements which should be incorporated into safety programs for municipal employees and explains how to implement such programs. Indicates results of some existing programs.

Ocheltree, Keith. "Reducing Sick Leave Abuse." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1959. 36 pp. (Personnel Report No. 592)

Summarizes some of the principal approaches used by personnel administrators to control sick leave abuses. Points out advantages and disadvantages of each method of control and also considers "relationship of absenteeism to the over-all personnel program and to employee morale."

Pittsburgh University. Institute of Local Government. "A Model Employee-Benefit Ordinance." Pittsburgh, The Institute, 1953. 6 pp.

Contains suggested provisions for leaves, overtime, holidays, group insurance, and similar benefits.

Simonds, Rollin R., and Grimaldi, John V. "Safety Management; Accident Cost and Control." Homewood, Ill., Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1956. 555 pp.

Comprehensive text covering basic principles of accident prevention and cost analysis. Includes material on motivation as well as psychological aspects of safety.

• Employee Relations

American Bar Association. "Report of the Committee on Labor Relations of Governmental Employees." Chicago, The Association, 1956. 12 pp.

The Committee feels that "wherever practicable the privileges accorded to employees in private industry should be extended to public employees, modified to meet the unique needs of the public service and compatible with our concepts of democratic administration of public affairs." States that public employees have the inherent right to organize and to carry on

reasonable collective bargaining through democratically chosen representatives.

Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada. Committee on Employee Relations in the Public Service. "Employee Relations in the Public Service." Chicago, The Assembly, 1942. 246 pp. (Out of print)

Identifies major issues in the field of employee relations. Reviews progress made by organizations of public employees in the various areas of employee relations and considers areas of collective negotiation, adjustment of disputes arising from the interpretation and application of personnel policies, and the formulation of the policies themselves.

Godine, Morton R. "The Labor Problem in the Public Service." Cambridge, Harvard University Press, 1951. 305 pp. (Harvard Political Studies)

Study of extent to which civil service employees may be accorded rights of representation without impairing the government's control over its administrative machinery. Traces labor movement development in the public service, its objectives, and present status.

Hart, Wilson R. "Collective Bargaining in the Federal Service." New York, Harper and Brothers, 1961. 302 pp.

Explores the essential differences between public and private employment and analyzes pertinent facts of law and history bearing upon the subject of collective bargaining in public organizations. Discusses the arguments of critics and defenders of the government's traditional position on labor-management relations. Includes past history and present techniques of collective bargaining in industry; the policies and experience of governmental agencies that have introduced elements of collective bargaining; the conventional attitudes of federal agencies about labor relations; and proposed legislation in the field of compulsory arbitration.

Posey, Rollin B. "Employee Organization in the United States Public Service." *Public Personnel Review*, October, 1956, pp. 238-245.

Traces the development of federal, state, and local government employee unions and discusses their activities with special reference to collective bargaining, legislative and political activities, and strikes.

Posey, Rollin B. "How To Negotiate With Labor Unions." *Public Personnel Review*, January, 1953, pp. 11-17.

Pertinent suggestions on dealing with government labor unions. Discusses importance of

management's attitude toward negotiation, techniques of negotiation, negotiation agreements, and personal qualities of a good negotiator.

Rock, Eli. "Practical Labor Relations in the Public Service." *Public Personnel Review*, April, 1957, pp. 71-80.

Presents a composite picture of practices and experience in the public service, emphasizing problems of administrators and typical union leaders, and addressing some specific "do's and don'ts" to each of these groups.

Spero, Sterling D. "Government as Employer." New York, Remsen Press, 1948. 497 pp.

A study of the relations of government in its capacity as employer to its employees acting through their own organizations. Part I: "The Public Employment Relationship." Part II: "The Rise of Trade Unionism in the Public Service." Part III: "Public Employment Policies."

"Union Activity in Public Employment." *Columbia Law Review*, Vol. 55, No. 3, March, 1955, pp. 343-366.

Surveys pros and cons of union activity in public employment and concludes that public employees should have full rights to union membership, including mandatory collective bargaining, provided the right to strike is intelligently limited. This is a compromise which "would avoid interruptions in the crucial functions of government while still enabling many of those in public service to make sure that their lot is no worse than that of their counterparts in private employment."

Van Mol, Louis J. "Effective Procedures for the Handling of Employee Grievances." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1953. 25 pp. (Personnel Report No. 531)

Although the emphasis is on Tennessee Valley Authority's grievance procedure, the author attempts, by drawing upon experience of other organizations, both public and private, to evolve a set of principles which should be recognized and woven into any effective grievance procedure.

• Separation and Retirement

Batson, Robert J. "Employee Turnover Statistics: Collection, Analysis, and Use." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1956. 13 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 17)

Examines factors necessary to an understanding of turnover, presents some factual information regarding turnover experience of

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

employers, and suggests how public personnel agencies may go about getting a better picture of employee turnover situation in their own organizations.

Batson, Robert J. "The Exit Interview." Chicago, Public Personnel Association, 1957. 12 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 3)

Outlines major phases of exit interview program and shows advantages of such a program both for personnel office and top administrative officials.

Dartnell Publications, Inc. "101 Ways To Reduce Employee Turnover." Chicago, Dartnell, 1952. 80 pp.

Collection of more than 100 tested methods, systems, and procedures which have proved effective in reducing turnover during a period when capable replacements are difficult to secure.

Hewitt and Associates. "The Co-ordination of Federal Social Security with Public Employee Retirement Plans." Libertyville, Ill., The Firm, 1954. 11 pp. (A Public Service Report)

Outlines the steps which must be gone through when a jurisdiction wishes to supplement its retirement system with Federal Social Security.

Municipal Finance Officers Association of the United States and Canada. "Public Employee Retirement Administration." Chicago, The Association, 1954. 84 pp.

Papers delivered during 48th annual conference at San Francisco, Calif., May 23-27, 1954. Includes report on survey of federal retirement systems for civilian and military personnel, by H. Eliot Kaplan; section on federal social security and local retirement plan under coordinated program, and section on re-examination of retirement plans under rapidly changing economic conditions.

Municipal Finance Officers Association of the United States and Canada. "Retirement Plans for Public Employees; Basic Principles and Essential Provisions Governing Retirement Planning for Public Employees." Chicago, The Association, 1958. 46 pp.

Discusses the purposes of a retirement plan, outlines the steps which must be taken in establishing a retirement plan, and points out important considerations. Also discusses the Federal Social Security program and methods of coordinating social security with local retirement plans.

National Manpower Council. "Turnover in Governmental Employment." Washington, D. C., The Council, 1958. 14 pp. (Information Memorandum No. 133)

Presents findings of recent turnover studies relating to government employees in various jurisdictions, and compares them with studies of turnover in private industry.

U. S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. Division of State Merit Systems. "Problems of Mandatory and Variable Retirement Ages in State Employment." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1954. 10 pp.

Summarizes some of the considerations, other than legal and actuarial, which should be weighed in determining whether to fix mandatory or variable retirement age. Chart shows present compulsory retirement age in the various states.

U. S. Employment Service. "Suggestions for Control of Turnover and Absenteeism." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1951. 30 pp., forms.

Gives method for computing turnover and absenteeism rates, analyzing the cost of each, and providing corrective measures for specific causes.

U. S. Social Security Administration. "Old-Age, Survivors, and Disability Insurance for Employees of State and Local Governments." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1959. 14 pp. (OASI-32)

A brief summary of the provisions of Federal Old Age, Survivors, and Disability Insurance as they may be applied to public employees.

U. S. Veterans Administration. "Retirement Counseling." Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1956. 8 pp. (Circular 1)

Points out problems that employed persons face in connection with retirement, and indicates steps which the Veterans Administration can take to encourage employees to plan and prepare for retirement.

● Journals

Journal of Applied Psychology. American Psychological Association, 1333 16th St., N.W., Washington 6, D. C. Bi-monthly.

Monthly Labor Review. U. S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics. Available through U. S. Government Printing Office, Washington 25, D. C. Monthly.

Personnel. American Management Association, 1515 Broadway, New York 36, N. Y. Bi-monthly.

Personnel Administration. Society for Personnel Administration, 715 G St., N.W., Washington 1, D. C. Bi-monthly.

Personnel Journal. Personnel Journal, Inc., 100 Park Ave., Swarthmore, Pa. Monthly, except July and August combined in one issue.

Personnel Psychology. G. F. Kuder, P. O. Box 6965, Durham, North Carolina. Quarterly.

Psychometrika. The Psychometric Society, P. O. Box 592, Princeton, N. J. Quarterly.

Public Personnel Review. Public Personnel Association, 1313 E. 60th St., Chicago 37, Ill. Quarterly.

● Glossaries and Bibliographies

Becker, Esther R. "Dictionary of Personnel and Industrial Relations." New York, Philosophical Library, 1959. 366 pp.

Crouch, Winston W., and Jamison, Judith N. "The Work of Civil Service Commissions." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1955. 46 pp. (Personnel Report No. 553)

Dictionary of public personnel terms, pp. 34-42.

Headly, Ferrel, and Stokes, Sybil L. "Comparative Public Administration." Ann Arbor, Mich., Institute of Public Administration, University of Michigan, 1960. 98 pp.

A bibliography covering public administration in the United States and other countries.

Lomax, W. Richard. "Public Personnel Glossary." Bloomington, Indiana University, 1950. 40 pp.

Selection of words and phrases used most frequently by technicians.

Mandell, Milton M. "Common Testing Terms: Their Meaning and Use." Chicago, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada, 1953. 14 pp. (Personnel Briefs No. 11)

Explains the most commonly used testing terms in simple, understandable language.

Municipal Finance Officers Association of the United States and Canada. Committee on Public Employee Retirement Administration. "Public Employee Retirement Terminology." Chicago, The Association, 1956. 21 pp.

Intended to supply definitions of some of the most common terms generally used in public retirement system operations. Tries to avoid technical expressions and to explain meaning and application of terms in as simple and understandable a manner as possible.

Municipal Manpower Commission. "Urban Government Manpower: A Preliminary Bibliography." Washington, D. C., The Commission, 1961. Unpagged.

BIBLIOGRAPHY AVAILABLE AS PAMPHLET

This Bibliography and the accompanying commentary by Professor Van Riper will be available in separate pamphlet form from the Public Personnel Association, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois. Prices for single or multiple copies of the pamphlet will be quoted on request.

Making the Most of Campus Recruiting

Robert J. Batson and Eleanor R. Batson

Some suggestions for increasing the competitive position of the public for top college graduates.

ALL THE signs indicate a continuation in the 1960's of the revolution in the manpower field.¹ Automation, electronic data processing, and other innovations will affect the manpower needs of every major employer in the United States. Today, whole new professions are developing in the course of only a few years, where formerly it took decades or even centuries for this to happen. The percentage of the work population which is professional and technical will continue to skyrocket. The U.S. Department of Labor predicts that these two groups will increase by more than 40 per cent in the coming decade, compared with an increase of 20 to 25 per cent for all other employee groups except unskilled labor. The latter will decrease by 18 to 20 per cent.²

The revolutionary growth of colleges and universities will also continue. Enrollments are expected to increase by 70 per cent in the decade of the sixties, compared with a 40 per cent increase in the fifties.³ There are more people of college age due to the higher birth rates during and subsequent to World War II. More people of college age are going to college due to improved economic conditions.

One not yet widely recognized consequence of the increased college population is that jobs that were formerly filled with high school graduates are going to be filled by college graduates. This will be true even though college training may not be necessary to carry out the duties of the post. Thus, college graduates who seek high-grade clerical or semi-professional employment will expect to be recruited on the campus

in the same way that professional people, such as engineers, chemists, teachers, and the like, have been traditionally recruited. If public employers do not go to the campus for all types of college graduates, the best qualified candidate will be lost to the public service.

Many public agencies do engage in college recruiting. Nevertheless, they have been handicapped in their competition with industry for college-trained people by certain selection procedures and by the lack of funds.

The IOR Seminar

The report of a seminar on the recruiting of college graduates made by the Institute of Occupational Research prompted this article. The seminar brought together some recruiters for private industry and government, some college placement officers, and assorted personnel administrators. The question-and-answer session in which they participated focused on key recruitment issues. The emphasis was on private industry since only four government representatives were present.

Books could be—and have been—written about college recruitment,⁴ and obviously the experience reported at one seminar can hardly be said to be universal. However, some of the advice that was proffered may provide public personnel agencies with ammunition with which to persuade top management and legislative bodies of the importance of improving their competitive position in the college market.

⁴ An annotated bibliography on the subject of recruitment was published in the January, 1961, issue of this journal. Listings on college recruitment will be found on pp. 69-73. An excellent book published since the bibliography was prepared is George S. Odiorne and Arthur S. Hann, *Effective College Recruiting* (Ann Arbor: Bureau of Industrial Relations, University of Michigan, 1961).

¹ See Ewan Clague, "U.S. Manpower in the 1960's," *Public Personnel Review*, July, 1961, pp. 162-167.

² U.S. Department of Labor, *Manpower: Challenge of the 1960's* (Washington, D. C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1960), p. 11.

³ *Ibid.*, p. 15.

This article is built around eight questions, posed by the present authors, to which the discussions at the seminar provided information of particular interest to the public service.⁵ Interspersed throughout the remainder of this article are several direct quotes by participants in the seminar. Wherever these appear in the text, they are in italics.

Is College Recruiting Only for the Big Agency?

Many small cities or individual departments of larger cities and states typically have limited numbers of openings for college graduates. They may, therefore, wonder whether campus recruiting is practical for them. Experience reported by the smaller private organizations at the seminar would seem to indicate that, with the proper approach and patience, small organizations can attract qualified people.

The large firms attract more than we do, but we get our share.

When we go out to a new school for the first year, we don't expect to accomplish anything. We interview three or four or five. But we hire one. Then he does our recruiting the next year.

We concentrate on the better students who are close to home. In this way, we get good results.

The small public agency that cannot justify independent recruiting should explore the college recruitment program which the United States Employment Service provides for private employers. At the seminar, a representative of the New York State Employment Service said:

The state employment service will recruit on campuses for both small and large companies without fee. Company recruiters can interview applicants at the state employment office, and the employment office will screen them beforehand.

In those states where the state personnel

office provides services for local governments, it may be possible to get them to undertake college recruitment as an additional service if there is sufficient interest. Other possibilities for cooperative ventures in this area include state leagues of municipalities and national or state professional organizations. The personnel agency of a small city can also get in touch with college placement officers by mail, and they will undoubtedly place brochures and announcements on bulletin boards or pass the information along to potential candidates.

Which Colleges Should Be Approached?

College recruitment does not necessarily require a nationwide program. Each agency will need to identify for itself the best prospects as far as colleges are concerned. Find out which nearby colleges train students for the positions you seek to fill. It is better to build good sound relations with a number of small institutions than to make token whistle-stops at a large number.

Municipalities with several colleges in the immediate vicinity probably should concentrate on those institutions for most purposes. Smaller cities will have better success if they focus on small town colleges within 300 to 500 miles, rather than to try to draw people from large metropolitan universities.

These recommendations are supported by the experience of private industry.

We use lists of accredited institutions. We try to go where there are lots of people of the kind we are looking for. It helps to have good contacts with the faculty. The geographical factor is very important.

We find that about 500 miles is a good figure. After that you get more and more rejections; or they will accept your offer and quit within two years to go back home—this is what is expensive.

We concentrate on the better students who are close to home. In this way, we get good results.

Who Should Go to the Campus?

The selection of recruiters depends primarily upon the nature of the recruiting job. Small cities needing only ten or twelve college graduates a year cannot have a full-time recruiter. In most cities campus recruitment will be a part-time assignment to

⁵ The Institute of Occupational Research generously consented to allow liberal use of the transcript of the seminar. All quotations in this article are from the Institute report *206 Questions and Answers from the Seminar on Recruiting College Graduates*, June 6-8, 1960. Copies may be purchased at \$2.00 each from the Institute of Occupational Research, 104 Webster Avenue, Manhasset, N. Y.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

someone in the personnel office, unless the job is decentralized to the operating departments. But whoever is selected should be well prepared in advance.⁶

The recruiter must know not only about the hiring process, but must have detailed information concerning the job and the environment for which he is seeking recruits. A college placement officer said:

Be sure recruiters know what the entry jobs are and where they lead.

Perhaps even more important is that the same person be assigned to visit particular campuses on an annual basis.

Send the same recruiter each year. When you have to send a new one, break him in before you turn him loose.

Companies become unpopular with me when they change their recruiting officers frequently. I get tired of training them.

There was disagreement among the members of the seminar as to the desirability of technical know-how on the part of the interviewer. As a minimum, whoever does the interviewing must know what the recruit would be expected to do. Presumably, a broad-gauged personnel man who has intimate knowledge of the operating agencies and their problems could answer most questions the student might have.

A large agency that is looking for a large number of recruits for a single job class might be able to select a specialist, train him in recruiting and interview techniques, and send him out. More typical would be an agency which had need for a half dozen engineers, eight or ten social workers, a couple of accountants, etc. It would be inefficient and unconscionably expensive to send specialists to try to fill all these positions.

What Interview Techniques Should Be Used?

For most public agencies the college visit performs a different function than it does for the private employer. Sometimes the private recruiter may be authorized actually to make a job offer. In most cases, however,

he makes recommendations which are followed up by an invitation to the student to visit his employer's plant where more intensive interviewing takes place, especially by line officers. Thus, the interview techniques of the private recruiter are designed to elicit the maximum information from students for use in eliminating those the company does not want and pinpointing the ones they do want.

Since public personnel programs usually require formal competition of some kind, the college interview is largely designed to identify promising students and to persuade them to take a competitive test. Few public agencies probably would want to rely solely upon the rating of an interviewer, even if they were permitted by law to do so. Therefore, any interviews designed to test the student's reactions, personality, motivation, and the like will be conducted under controlled conditions.

Probably the only time that interviewers in the public service are authorized to make actual job offers, or anything approaching a commitment, is in the definite shortage categories where any engineer or social worker, for example, with only one head may be hired.

Do Tests Score Off Candidates?

College students tend to feel that their course grades should provide sufficient evidence of their ability. The discussion at the seminar indicated, however, that many private organizations now use formal tests in connection with their college recruiting.

Some of our divisions use tests. Some do not.

We test for some jobs, not others.

We give a little mental alertness test on campus at the end of the day to the boys we are interested in. We also use an outside consultant to measure personality. We like the results, and we give them to the department head under whom the man works after we hire him.

A number of the recruiters for private industry said that they did not use tests at all but relied on the campus interview and the interviews made at the company plant. Still others mentioned some drawbacks about testing that should be avoided. One stressed the use of short tests.

⁶A good short training manual for recruiters is Society for Personnel Administration, *A Guide to College Recruitment* (Washington, D. C.: The Society, 1956).

In those divisions which do more than two hours of testing, we get a distressing number of letters from men who say they turned us down because of the unfavorable impression created by the tests.

There is still, apparently, resistance on the part of students to formal personality tests—doubtless the result of their reading of *The Organization Man*. But properly phrased oral questions seem to open the floodgates of student self-analysis and permit the recruiter to get an insight into the student's personality.

We say we do not wish to pry into anything personal, but we would like him to tell us about the following points. We have been astonished at how much people are willing to tell us about themselves.

The questions that are most likely to turn up something of interest are: What do you think you have done well in college and why? Do you consider this achievement representative of your ability? What do you do in your spare time? If you had your childhood to live over, what would you like to be the same and what different? Was there any difference in your achievement at different periods of your education? If so, why? What do you look for in a friend? A wife? A boss?

From the testimony of private recruiters concerning the use of tests, it seems justifiable to conclude that the public service will not be at a disadvantage if testing red tape is minimized and test results are speedily made known.

Are Agency Visits Essential?

The crucial part of private industry's college recruitment program is the plant visit.

When they come to the plant, that's when they really get interviewed. At a laboratory they see three or four people who divide the topics to be covered. There will usually be an orientation interview by a personnel man, then an interview on the candidate's technical competence, then an interview on his future plans, then a job offer interview if they want him. Salary may be determined later, but we think it wise to tell him we want him, if we do. If we do not want him, we usually tell him later unless he is a good man who is obviously in the wrong department for him. Then we may try to set up interviews with another department.

Interviews at the plant usually take all morning.

The plant visit serves two purposes. First, operating officials are given an opportunity to see the candidates and play a vital role in the hiring process. Second, the visit enables the company "to sell" the student on the company. At a plant the student is usually given something approaching red-carpet treatment, lunch with executives he won't lunch with again for ten years, etc.

Participants were asked: "Does anybody pay the expenses of those who visit the plant?" The reply was a chorus of "Is there anybody who doesn't?" A hand count disclosed that of the eighteen recruiters present at the time, fourteen paid expenses. (The four employers who did not pay the student's expenses for a plant visit were not identified. One suspects, however, that they were the four public agencies represented at the seminar.)

Because public agencies have not usually been permitted to pay expenses for "plant" visits, they cannot insist on them. This disadvantage has been partly overcome by giving examinations on a decentralized basis. Thus, the employer at least knows about the employee. Inability to bring potential employees to the agency, however, puts the public employer at a disadvantage in selling the job to the student when the student can, and does, visit competing private employers. Few people like to "buy a pig in a poke" if they can avoid it.

Most legislatures, and even many personnel agencies, have the idea that plant visits are very expensive. First, such visits are never justified until the candidates have already been thoroughly screened. Accordingly, the number of candidates per vacancy who would be invited for a visit would be small. Second, most college students are accustomed to a modest standard of living. A bus ticket, a reservation at the "Y," and a modest meal allowance will fill the bill. Private companies themselves avoid extravagant expenses or entertainment which may "give a future employee the mistaken impression that the company will expect him to be extravagant."

We do no entertaining after five o'clock.

I would rather take a man home for dinner than out on the town.

Last year we withdrew a job offer when a

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

man seemed to be deliberately giving us the business on an expense account. We also informed the college placement officer by mail and by phone.

In many cases, where the public agency limits its recruitment to nearby colleges and universities, the cost of student visits would be minimal.

Can Part-time and Summer Employment Help?

Most college students take summer jobs that in no way prepare them for their future career. If public agencies would identify semi-professional tasks that could be performed by college students during the summer (or on a part-time basis year round) it should do much to improve the competitive position of the public service in the college job market. Students frequently raise questions in class based on their summer or part-time employment experience. A few students sprinkled through a student body who knew that all public employees were not "bums" could help greatly to raise the image of the public service on the campus.

Summer employment of students also has two immediate advantages. A student can be evaluated on the job with little or no embarrassment. If he proves unsatisfactory, then no further contact or encouragement to consider future employment is needed. On the other hand, if he does prove satisfactory, the chances of getting him on a permanent basis are increased. Many private industries recognize the advantages of summer employment:

Our acceptance rate on offers to people who have worked for us in the summer is at least twice as good.

We find one of our most effective recruiting programs is our hiring of sophomores and juniors for summer jobs.

We sign some of our best people at the end of the summer that they spend with us after the junior year.

We hire some juniors for the summer. They are our ambassadors when they go back for the senior year. They have been a tremendous help to us in some schools where we had difficulty.

What Success Can Be Expected of Campus Recruiting?

Several seminar participants cautioned that an employer should not expect too much the first time around:

When we go out to a new school, for the first year we don't expect to accomplish anything.

Even after the first year, an employer must expect to interview a lot to get a few. The competition is increasingly tough for well-trained college students.

To get a man on the payroll, we have to see about 30 candidates on the campus. Of these, about six will visit the plant, three will get job offers, and one will accept.

To hire 141, we had to make roughly three times that many job offers.

Sending an interviewer to the campus and retaining all other traditional public personnel practices and procedures won't do. College recruiting must be combined with all the attributes that have come to be associated with "positive" recruiting. Some special do's and don'ts follow.

The student must be impressed with the interviewer because to him the interviewer is the organization.

When a student has a class to get to, or has taken time out from a part-time job, it is unfair to keep him waiting an hour beyond his scheduled time because the recruiter wants to talk longer with the man ahead of him.

Don't send recruiters who are unprepared, who dislike recruiting, and who show it all day long.

The interviewer must know the organization and be able to answer all reasonable questions the student may ask.

Recruiters who cannot answer questions about their own companies are very unpopular with our students.

Recruitment literature should be short and to the point.

Brochures should contain specific descriptions of entry jobs. This is what students want most. Real descriptions of what the jobs are. Less about golf courses. The word "work" ought to be mentioned. In brief, they want to know about the job they are being interviewed for.

Examination procedures must be streamlined and must be flexible.

We have been told that students passed us up because our tests took too long—about four hours.

We test for some jobs, not others.

The student must be informed within a few weeks whether or not he will have a job offer.

In some instances we tell them at the end of the campus interview.

We let everyone know within two weeks whether we have a further interest or whether he is being rejected.

If there's a real hot shot, we let our eyes sparkle a little, and we urge him to get his application in right quick because we think we're going to be able to do something nice for him.

The Long-range View

Public personnel agencies must more and more take the long-range view toward the recruitment of competent applicants. They

must find ways to reach students when they are making their *career* choice, not wait until they are making their *employer* choice. Public agencies must help increase the attractiveness of the public service per se.

There are three things that can be done with relatively little expense. First, arrange for public officials—either recruiters or technical people—to be available to college undergraduate student groups for discussions. Second, encourage students of nearby universities to make group visits to public agencies. Third, maintain close working relations with college faculty members. There is much evidence that college professors have a great influence on the career choice of students.

A public personnel agency probably will have to justify college recruiting on the basis of getting quality candidates. The public service, by and large, "fills" its positions. However, if the public service wants not just people to fill beginning level positions, but people who can grow into the department heads of the eighties, it must do college recruiting.

NOTE TO READERS

Under special arrangement with Richard D. Irwin, Inc., whose ad appears on page 277, readers of *Public Personnel Review* can purchase any of the publications listed in the Irwin ad at a discount of 15% from the advertised list price by ordering through the Public Personnel Association and sending cash with their order. To take advantage of this arrangement, please do as follows:

1. Send your order to the Public Personnel Association at the address below, giving the titles, authors and list prices of the Irwin books you wish to purchase. Give the shipping address to which the order is to be sent.
2. Enclose a check or money order, deducting 15% from the total list price value of your order.

Readers who wish to purchase on a billed basis should **not** order through the Public Personnel Association, but should send their order directly to the publisher.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL ASSOCIATION

1313 East 60th Street

Chicago 37, Illinois

Labour Relations in Canadian Municipalities

George W. Noble

Municipal management will continue to occupy a back seat at the bargaining table unless it develops an intelligent awareness of its rights and obligations.

THE PROBLEMS which today are rapidly becoming of major concern to every municipality in Canada, are those arising from the growth of trade unionism among municipal employees and the practice of collective bargaining with representatives of these employees.

According to the Economics and Research Branch, Federal Department of Labour, there are over 100,000 municipal employees, represented by some 600 local unions, whose wages and working conditions are determined by collective bargaining procedures. It is apparent, therefore, that the manner in which these wages and working conditions are determined is important. Let us look at some of the problems that face municipal officials who deal with labour relations and contract administration in municipalities.

Some Needed Controls

One of the major problems appears to be the need for controlling municipal wage levels so that the taxpayers are not asked to pay municipal employees higher wages than they themselves receive for comparable work. An examination of the hourly wage rate paid general labourers in industry as compared with municipal labourers, in six of the major municipalities in Canada, indicates that municipal labourers are receiving wages 5 per cent to 10 per cent higher than general labourers employed in industry. Furthermore, the fringe benefits granted municipal employees are generally in excess of those provided labourers in industry.

In addition to the need for controlling municipal wages there is, particularly in the larger municipalities, a need for controlling the actions of local boards and commissions. These boards and commissions have, in certain instances, established wage levels and working conditions exceeding not only those

that prevail in the municipalities but those generally prevailing in industry.

The adverse effects of setting out-of-line wages and working conditions in the municipal service are not confined to that particular municipality; other municipalities are quickly faced with requests for similar wages and working conditions, and industry in the area is also adversely affected. Private business firms, as well as public officials, have a direct interest in how well labour relations are handled by municipal officials.

The establishment of excessively high wage rates in municipal service affects industry, by way of higher business taxes to pay those wages, and also has a bearing on the wage rates which industry must meet in the area, in order to recruit the staff it requires. Contractors tendering on municipal contracts are required, in some municipalities, to pay wages at least equal to those paid by the municipality, as a condition of securing the contract.

A statement of one of the speakers at a recent industrial personnel meeting, which I attended, pointed up the problem succinctly. He said:

Now I would like to suggest to you that the wages and working conditions of the employees of emanations of local governments are going to be a matter of concern to business and that we should take a greater interest in the way in which those wage and working conditions are arrived at. This is important because of the impact that it may have on your wages and working conditions. I urge that you interest yourselves in these affairs, that you give assistance where it is possible because I believe that it is probable that if you do not, there will be out-of-line wages and working conditions established which will haunt you in the future.

The thinking commonly expressed by personnel and labour relations people em-

ployed in industry is that municipal wages and working conditions are established without the municipalities having the information which industry would consider necessary before determining wages and working conditions. They also point out that municipalities lack the trained and experienced staff which industry deems essential.

If the problem of municipal labour relations has become as apparent to industry as the foregoing illustrates, then it would appear obvious that those persons responsible for determining wages and working conditions for employees of governmental organizations must also be aware of the need for establishing a method of control and ensuring that wages and working conditions are determined in a proper manner—one that is not only fair to the employee but also to the taxpayer who must pay the bills.

Many Unions—Many Problems

Another problem facing municipalities is that of dealing with numerous unions representing various groups or classes of employees. While there are many areas in addition to those I speak of, these two examples will point up the difficulties to which I refer.

In the Metropolitan Toronto area, it has become a fairly well established practice in industry to pay operating engineers a week-end premium of time and one-half or better for regularly scheduled shifts worked on Saturdays or Sundays. Operating engineers employed in the municipal services form a small, but important, part of the total staff required to maintain essential municipal services, such as water, sewage, hospitals, fire, police, etc., and, as a result of the practice followed in industry, we have and will again be faced with the request for premium pay for Saturday and Sunday work.

A comparable situation prevails with respect to general-duty registered nurses. The majority of hospitals in this area, paying approximately the same salary rates, grant nurses four weeks' vacation after one year of service. The nurses employed by the municipalities, on the other hand, are granted only two weeks' vacation—the same as for other municipal employees. The problem here is that while municipal councils are generally in favour of all municipal em-

ployees being given the same fringe benefits, conciliation and arbitration boards are more inclined to grant the fringe benefits currently provided in the trade or profession.

At one time no shift bonus was paid in our municipal service, but a conciliation board, dealing with a dispute between the corporation and the operating engineers, granted them shift bonuses for the second and third shifts, on the basis that it was common to the trade. Once this occurred, it was only a year or two until all other shift employees were granted shift bonuses, although the payment of shift bonuses was practically non-existent throughout municipal services at that time.

So far, we have been able to avoid the payment of week-end premiums to operating engineers and have limited nurses to the vacation entitlements granted other employees. However, there is no doubt in my mind that in denying fringe benefits common in the trade or profession, we are adversely affecting the recruitment of such staff.

Importance Not Yet Realized

Another factor which has considerable effect on the municipal labour relations function is the tendency of some municipalities to minimize the importance of labour relations. In government, as in industry, the establishment of personnel departments and the appointment of labour relations officials has occurred only after the need for such staff became apparent to top management. The labour relations function has become an accepted part of the administration of large municipalities and, through necessity, is becoming a part of the administration of most municipalities.

The introduction of full-scale collective bargaining between municipal corporations and their employees raises questions of major importance, particularly for those municipal officials concerned with personnel and wage and contract negotiations. While municipal officials have extensive experience in public administration generally, the majority of them have little or no experience in the fields of collective bargaining or labour relations.

Despite this, many municipalities still treat these important matters as a side line to be handled by officials having little or no ex-

perience in this field. Officials who are drafted, either to negotiate with the municipal union or act as the chief advisor to the council, too frequently have other full-time positions which do not permit them the time necessary to obtain the data on wages and working conditions so essential in negotiations. They often are unable to keep themselves current with developments in the labour relations fields. Once a collective agreement is signed, the official usually has no further contact with labour relations until the next round of negotiations.

Municipal authorities cannot afford to have contract negotiations and administration conducted in their behalf by persons less skilled in labour relations and collective bargaining than those persons representing the employees. This becomes very evident when you realize that over 50 per cent of municipal budgets is composed of salaries and wages. At one time the council, or a committee of council, met with the employees themselves, discussed their requests, and then told them what they would give them in the way of wage increases. Such is not the case now by any means.

Today, the requests of the employee unions are frequently prepared and presented to municipal officials by either lawyers experienced in the practice of labour law or paid union officials widely experienced in the negotiation of collective agreements. Their requests are well supported by statistics on wages and working conditions covering, not only comparable municipalities, but also wages and working conditions in industry in the area.

The municipal official who represents the corporation, or acts as the chief advisor to the committee doing the negotiating, frequently does not possess—nor, until recently, could he obtain—current information on comparable wages and working conditions in the various municipalities cited by the union. Without up-to-date information on wage rates and working conditions, a municipality negotiating is unable to refute the claims made by the union or to propose alternatives acceptable to the municipality.

The result is that basic labour policy decisions are made without the full knowledge of the alternatives or of the probable consequences. Once a policy decision is made and

incorporated into a collective agreement it becomes, as so many of us know from past experience, extremely difficult to undo or to remove from the collective agreement.

Short-sighted Clauses

The need for drawing proper collective agreements, that clearly set out the rights of the parties, is of major importance to municipalities. Many municipal collective agreements leave much to be desired from the management viewpoint. This is illustrated by the following sampling of clauses which I find in current collective agreements.

1. Employees retained past 90 days shall be placed on the Permanent Staff.

By the inclusion of a clause such as this, the corporation has waived its right to determine how many permanent employees are required to carry on the business of the organization. The right to determine how many permanent municipal employees are required is not a matter for negotiation with any union. It is a matter to be determined exclusively by management.

2. Temporary employees may be hired up to a period of six months for relief work.

The right to hire temporary, casual, or permanent employees, without consultation with, or subject to the approval of any union, is a matter to be decided by management. Municipal corporations must take a strong stand on matters such as this and insist that it is not a proper matter for negotiation and has no place in any collective agreement.

3. Members of the Force shall have a choice of work strictly on a basis of seniority.

To grant members of any municipal department the right to choose the jobs they will do, strictly on the basis of seniority, without any reference to qualification or ability to do the job is, in my opinion, a complete surrender of the management function.

4. An employee who works in a higher classification for a period of two months or more in any contract year shall be entitled to the rate of pay applicable to the higher category for a period of at least nine months of his work during the said contract year.

The effect of such a clause in a collective agreement is obvious. To pay an employee a wage rate for seven months, simply because he worked two months at that rate, rather than the rate for the job he is performing is absolutely asinine and can only compound the wage problems for the person charged with administering the wage and classification plan.

5. The Corporation shall retain in its' employ only members of the Union in good standing. The Union shall be the sole judge of the good standing of its members, and any employee who shall hereafter cease to be a member in good standing shall on notice to the Corporation be discharged immediately.

The municipal corporation agreeing to the inclusion of the foregoing clause has waived part of its management prerogatives—namely, the right to hire and discharge. This clause could place management in an untenable position in the event that an employee lost his good standing in the union because of reasons not related to his employment. This restriction on the rights of management has no place in a collective agreement.

6. Any working conditions or benefits, or other conditions of employment at present in force and recognized by both parties which are not specifically mentioned in this agreement and are not contrary to its intention, shall continue in full force and effect for the duration of this contract.

The inclusion of a catch-all clause like this, in any collective agreement, serves no useful purpose. It is apparent from the wording of the clause that neither the union nor the municipal representative who negotiated the collective agreement has any idea of what is implied, otherwise the benefits referred to would have been defined in the agreement.

These and similar clauses appear all too often in municipal collective agreements, and vividly illustrate those instances where basic policy decisions have been made without full knowledge of the probable consequences. That these clauses will prove harmful to the municipalities which have included them in their collective agreements goes without saying. The worst feature, however, is that other municipalities will be requested

to include similar clauses in their agreements, simply because they already exist in some current municipal agreements.

How Much Bargaining Power?

Many of the problems which occur in municipal labour relations arise from the fact that bargaining in behalf of a political organization has complications not commonly found in industrial bargaining. Labour relations in the municipal service have much in common with those in industry. In both cases conflicts of interests concern fundamental issues such as salaries and wages, hours of work, pensions, shift bonuses, vacations, sick pay, promotions, and many others.

While there is much in common in labour relations in industry and in municipal service, there are certain characteristics in the latter that are unique. Some of these characteristics are: (1) the political nature of the employer; (2) responsibilities to the public; (3) the security of employment; and (4) the nature of the services rendered by a municipality. All of these have a very definite bearing on the municipal bargaining process.

A municipality lacks many of the features which provide an industrial firm with a strong bargaining position. It does not obtain the bulk of its revenues from the sale of a product. The major source of revenue for any municipality is taxes, to which must be added the revenue accruing from government grants, licenses, tax sales of property, sales of municipally owned real estate, and, in some cases, revenue derived from the operation of municipal utilities. A municipality cannot as readily increase its revenues as can a private firm. Taxes can be increased, but this is very different from a private organization raising the price of a product and is moreover subject to a different set of pressures.

Revenues from the municipally owned utilities form only a small part of the income of most municipalities. The amount of government grants is clearly beyond the control of the municipality. Further, the municipality has much less flexibility in adjusting the services it provides than has a private firm. It cannot curtail or discontinue fire or police protection, water or sewage services,

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

or hospital and homes for the aged simply because employees demand exorbitant pay increases. Nor is the position of the municipality comparable with that of an industrial firm in relation to a strike threat from employees working in essential services.

These essential services furnished by municipalities are, in the majority of cases, monopolies of that type of service. A strike of municipal employees working in these areas could totally deprive the citizens of such services as water, sewage, etc. Strikes and threats of strikes by municipal employees working in these essential services have once again raised the question of whether any group of employees—municipal or not—should have such power over services which are so vital to the health and well-being of the community.

Councils No Match for "Pro's"

Another complication, arising from the fact that a municipality is a political organization, is in the composition of the bargaining team which represents municipalities. In an industrial organization the administrative head receives a delegation of authority sufficiently wide to enable him to make a settlement with the union. When the employer is a political body, the whole picture becomes much more complicated.

Bargaining in behalf of municipalities is generally conducted either by a committee of council or by council as a whole. Municipal councils do not delegate to their nominee the same measure of authority as is exercised by the official in charge of bargaining for an industry, despite the fact that councils are clearly not suitable bodies to deal with skilled union negotiators in working out satisfactory collective agreements.

A council cannot be expected to have the skill or knowledge necessary to deal effectively with the arguments put forward by experienced union representatives. Nor can it be expected to recognize the significance of union requests involving contract provisions dealing with management prerogatives. Councils during negotiations could find it difficult to maintain a solid front in relation to the union requests. In the larger municipalities, councils simply do not have the time to spend on the prolonged bargain-

ing sessions sometimes necessary to achieve a satisfactory settlement.

The foregoing, in my opinion, illustrates clearly that municipal councils should not be expected to do other than establish the policy with respect to labour relations matters, since the negotiation of a collective agreement is a complex affair and there is every indication that it will become more complex. Appointing an official, or a lawyer experienced in labour relations, to conduct the bargaining meetings does not, in any way, deprive the council of any of its rights, since it would still establish policy and ultimately must ratify all agreements reached by its agents before they become effective.

In industry, the final position of a company during bargaining is a closely guarded secret. How different is the situation in the municipal service! The position of members of council, in relation to the requests of municipal unions, is frequently as well known to the union bargaining team as to the representatives of the municipality.

One final complication which the political nature of the employer injects into the bargaining process is what might be called the political complexion of the council. This can have a very definite bearing on the type of settlement made with the employees and can result in policy changes each time there are changes in council.

A Call to Action

There are other problem areas in municipal labour relations, some of which I feel can be corrected by action on the part of the municipalities themselves. Inter-municipal cooperation in matters involving collective bargaining procedures are necessary for many reasons, two of which are of major importance, in my opinion:

1. The fact that municipal unions are now operating on a national basis
2. The need for establishing job classifications, wages, and wage plans covering the basic positions common to municipalities.

Municipal unions in the last few years have been working under fairly close direction from their national organizations insofar as their requested amendments to collective

agreements are concerned. Each year these organizations have national conventions, at which the local unions are represented. There the unions decide just what amendments they will seek from their municipal employers. There may be minor variations from area to area, but in the main, as an analysis of the amendments to collective agreements requested in 1960 indicate, there is a definite pattern established on a national scale.

Since there are, as I indicated earlier, some 100,000 municipal employees represented by employee organizations, paying approximately \$25.00 per year in union dues, the unions are well supplied with funds with which to service their members. The national organization has established area offices in most of the provinces of Canada, and employees of this national organization furnish the local unions with organizers, negotiators, research assistance, publications, and assistance in the preparation and presentation of briefs to conciliation boards. The national organization keeps its member locals informed as to developments in the labour relations fields including changes in labour legislation, conciliation and arbitration awards, etc. In short, the municipal union organizations are operating on a business basis insofar as servicing their members is concerned.

Compare this situation to that facing the municipalities. Until recently there was not even a central location where a municipality could obtain current wage rates and working conditions prevailing in other municipalities. Since the unions are already acting in concert, the municipalities cannot afford to do otherwise if they are to avoid being played off one against the other, as has happened since municipal employees became organized on a national basis.

If management is to retain the rights that have not as yet been frittered away by one municipality or another, there must be close cooperation between the municipalities. It is essential that a reliable source of information be developed, to which all participating municipalities would have access, so that municipalities will at least be as well informed as the municipal unions before they enter into bargaining.

It is now apparent that the major municipi-

pal unions have developed to the point where they can bargain on relatively equal terms with the largest municipal corporation. This being so, it indicates that these unions are better equipped to deal with labour relations matters than are many of the medium-sized and smaller municipalities. Whenever this situation has developed in industry, the various companies have grouped themselves together for collective bargaining purposes in an attempt to equate their bargaining power with that of a major union.

While there is no indication of such a development in the municipal field, it is very evident that municipalities will have to actively cooperate to a much greater degree than in the past if they are to bargain on equal status with municipal unions organized on a national basis.

The Necessary Tools

Although there are some 600 local unions representing municipal organizations in Canada, only a handful of municipalities have established job classification and wage plans. Without a proper classification plan, municipal management operates under a handicap—and at no time is this more apparent than at the moment a municipality starts to negotiate wage rates with unions.

It becomes imperative at this point that, if properly drawn wage and classification plans did not previously exist, such plans be established immediately. Without them, and soundly based salaries and wages, the municipality is in no position to defend its salaries and wages as being fair and just, both to the employee and the taxpayer, either during negotiations or before conciliation and arbitration boards.

In the absence of classification and wage plans, established in accordance with the basic principles of job classification and salary administration and applied uniformly throughout the municipal services, the gathering and comparisons of wage rates become meaningless.

As an illustration of this, look at the job of municipal labourer, which is common to all municipalities. Basically an employee in this class is required to perform unskilled manual labour. His duties involve such tasks as the collection of garbage, ashes, refuse,

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

cutting grass, clearing snow, digging trenches, and a variety of other unskilled duties. Today, because of the lack of classification and pay plans throughout municipal services we have municipal employees designated as "labourers" performing duties ranging from unskilled labour work to driving heavy automotive equipment with variations in wage rates.

Not only do situations such as this render comparisons of the rates paid labourers in municipalities valueless, but they also provide excellent material for union negotiators who have exploited these variations in labour rates to the utmost in their presentations to municipalities and conciliation boards. A proper comparison of wage rates would require comparison of the so-called labour rate, paid persons operating heavy equipment, with the rate normally paid employees designated as equipment operators.

This is just one example of the situation which presently exists. It will be corrected only when municipalities realize the necessity for installing wage and classification plans, established in accordance with the basic principles of job classification and applied uniformly throughout the municipalities.

Waves of the Future

The trends which I see as those facing municipal labour relations officials during coming contract negotiations are as follows:

1. Continued pressure by municipal unions to further infringe on the rights of management by seeking inclusion of contract clauses limiting such rights
2. Pressure for reduction in the hours of work
3. A tendency on the part of conciliation and arbitration boards to award wage increases on the basis of wage settlements made by other municipalities and industry in the area, without regard to the fact that your rates may already be the highest in the area
4. Municipal unions, under the direction

of the national organizations, will be working closely together during negotiations.

The trends which I feel that we, in the municipal field, must foster and develop are:

1. Close cooperation between municipalities in labour relations matters. This is a must. If municipalities continue to operate in the labour relations field as they have to date, they will continue to be sitting ducks for the unions, with further increased wage and salary costs to the taxpayer.
2. Further develop the provincial municipal groups which have recently been established. If this is done, every municipality, no matter how small, will have ready access to assistance in labour relations matters so that eventually there will be at least one official in each municipality conversant with labour relations matters.
3. Foster the development of management groups within municipal services and restrict the union bargaining unit to those employees who properly belong within the unit certified. In a number of municipalities only department and deputy department heads are excluded from the bargaining unit. This is a most undesirable situation which must be corrected before management groups may be established.
4. Municipalities must develop their knowledge of existing labour legislation to the point that they are fully aware of their rights under such legislation. Many of these rights have been waived or nullified by clauses placed in collective agreements. Certainly any request to the provincial government for amendments to labour legislation, which would strengthen the weak bargaining position of municipalities, is not likely to receive much consideration if we are not exercising, to the maximum, those rights which we already possess under existing legislation.

Administrative Adjudication in New York State

H. M. Engel

A training program designed to lubricate the wheels of justice has met with success for personnel and public alike.

STATED in the broadest terms, administrative adjudication relates to certain quasi-judicial activities which occur when an individual or a business establishment faces particular processes of the state. These processes, part and parcel of the "internal" administration of government, culminate in formal or informal hearings deciding particular issues.

Administrative adjudication encompasses the gamut of actions by the state: revoking a driver's license; disciplinary action (under the Civil Service Law) against a government employee; permitting a motor carrier to charge a higher tariff; or settling an unfair labor charge. All of these illustrative issues—disposed of through the conduct of hearings—concern personal or property rights or privileges.

The Many Faces of Justice

Fairness in the administration of justice represents the major psychological hurdle when the public faces government. Nearly always the hearing officer is employed by the agency involved in the case, as are the members of the legal staff presenting the case, plus any investigators offering testimony. How easily the implication may be given that all the cards are stacked against the public, in favor of the government!

Admittedly, there is a wide range of views as to what is construed to be a fair hearing. Further, there is a wide range of opinion relative to the meaning of the term "administrative justice." This is due to the nature of the problems with which administrators and adjudicators deal; problems which must, of necessity, take many forms and shapes.

Hearings are different things in different agencies. They extend from hearings that amount to an informal talk across a desk to something approaching a full-blown

court proceeding. Nevertheless, despite the particular variety or species of administrative adjudication, a certain uniform thread seems to run through all. It was the recognition of this thread, a thread of interest common to most agencies, which led to the eventual development of a series of training institutes in the subject of administrative adjudication.

Recognition of the Problem

Within the New York State Department of Civil Service, the Training Section is charged with developing and organizing training programs in areas of common interest to all state departments and not available through existing facilities. Interest in administrative adjudication developed as a result of requests by the counsels of several agencies for formal training designed to supplement previous courses for investigators.

A 14-session, 42-hour course given to investigators from a number of different agencies included instruction in the rules of evidence and the rights of persons being investigated. Agency counsels felt that training in these subjects should be followed with training in succeeding steps in the process; namely, the administrative hearing and adjudication.

Based on these requests, a proposal was made by the Director of Public Employee Training for an extensive study of needs in this area. This was accomplished through two interdepartmental advisory committees, in Albany and New York. The advisory committee members were all eager for improvement in administrative adjudication within New York State government.

The program goals as envisioned by the committee were: an improved "climate" or approach toward the public; better written

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

decisions based on findings of fact—which would be more apt to be sustained on appeal; and overall expediting of the hearing process in order to eliminate unnecessary time lags and administrative waste.

Selection of Subjects and Instructors

The principal accomplishments of the committee were the delineation of subjects to be included in a course of study, and decisions as to whether it would be feasible to develop an interdepartmental program in which these items could be furnished. It quickly noted that six or seven major subjects should be included in any interdepartmental program in administrative adjudication, and that each session should last approximately three hours. The major subjects were the following:

1. The Nature of the Quasi-judicial Process
2. Preparation for the Hearing
3. Conducting the Hearing
4. Administrative Evidence
5. The Decision
6. Judicial Review.

A panel permitting the trainees to raise questions on subjects covered during the first six sessions, or to indicate special problem areas which may not have been discovered, was provided as the seventh and final session.

The recruitment of well-qualified instructors was also tackled by the advisory committee. Several committee members agreed to serve as instructors, not only because they were well versed in particular subjects, but because they were personally interested in furthering the programs. In other cases committee members assisted in the recruitment effort. Committee meetings and all recruitment projects were coordinated by the Training Section staff.

The Show Takes to the Road

Sixteen trainees from eight different agencies were the participants in the first program, conducted in New York City early in 1959, and a detailed record of the instructors' lectures and comments was maintained. At the conclusion of the sessions this record was made available to the par-

ticipants and others interested in administrative adjudication. This program was followed with one especially prepared for the Bureau of Motor Vehicles. Referees from the entire state participated in this course, held in Albany during the summer of 1959.

Participants in both courses prepared written evaluations, detailing their views as to course content, quality of instruction, and course utility in relation to their own jobs. These evaluations provided the lecturers and discussion leaders with many useful suggestions concerning continuance and expansion of the program.

Based on the results of these two experimental courses, the details and objectives of training in this area were brought to the attention of the Governor by the President of the Civil Service Commission. Subsequently, a planning session attended by administrators of most state agencies was held in order to consider future programs. The conferees agreed that training in this area should have as its principal goal the improvement of the adjudicative process and the development of a more uniform concept of administrative justice in New York State.

Value Becomes Apparent

The planning session had as its immediate result two additional interdepartmental programs, one in Albany and the other in New York City. For participation in these courses the departments were permitted to nominate their own trainees and to assign them on the basis of their operating needs and requirements.

Also as a direct result of the planning session, the Department of Mental Hygiene requested a special program covering the subject of the conduct of disciplinary proceedings. This was arranged as separate presentations for assistant hospital directors and hospital directors. Both dealt with the conduct of administrative adjudication directed at providing a fair hearing to an employee brought up on charges.

A special program was also arranged for the Temporary State Housing Rent Commission dealing with the conduct of hearings by that agency. Another program initiated was that for the Department of Public Service. The participants in this program

were Hearing Examiners and Motor Carrier Referees. Early in 1961 a program was presented for the Department of Conservation in connection with license revocations in hunting accident cases.

All of these courses were adapted to meet the particular requirements of the participating agencies. For example, through an analysis of previous hearings conducted by the agencies, the instructors tailored their material to cover particular agency procedures. In the case of the disciplinary proceedings, conducted by the Department of Mental Hygiene, legal research was prepared in connection with the handling of patient testimony.

By-products of the Program

In each of these programs the function of the Training Section was to coordinate the development of course material, recruit instructors, schedule programs, arrange for the nomination of trainees, and provide moderators for the sessions. The Training Section also prepared a kinescope, employing the closed-circuit television facilities of the College of Education, State University in Albany.

A mock hearing portraying a driver's license revocation was filmed in the college's television studio, using the kinescope process, on 16-mm. sound film. This training

film was shown to participants in several programs. At the request of the Bureau of Employment Security, United States Department of Labor, this material was also made available for a series of regional conferences dealing with the appeals process in that federal agency.

Another related by-product was the publication of a symposium of administrative law by the Albany Law School, Union University, in January, 1960. Some time during 1961, a manual for hearing officers will be published to serve as a guide in administrative adjudication in New York State. It is based on the lecture material developed for the courses described above.

Conclusion

It appears that through the medium of organized training, some important progress has been made, up-grading the standards of administrative justice in New York State. Training has pointed the way toward a more uniform treatment of the public. It has also provided the participants with a forum for the exchange of ideas and raised new points concerning the law and significant court cases.

Finally, the lectures have served to stimulate the trainees in their thinking and to encourage them in re-evaluating their methods of operation.

First Class—All the Way . . .

If we are to endure, and we must, America must build its strength, not only in its economy and defenses, but in its government which is charged by the Constitution with the leadership of our national effort. To do this, we need in the public service the most able and competent people that this country has to offer. We cannot have first-class government with second-class personnel.—Excerpt from "The True Spirit of the Public Service," address by the Secretary of Commerce, Hon. Luther H. Hodges, at National Civil Service League Annual Career Service Awards Presentation, March 21, 1961. *Good Government*, April, 1961.



around the personnel world

Personnel Administration in Turkey

James M. Clinton

Soon after my arrival in Turkey I went to look for an apartment to rent. At one new building I found an older fellow who had arrived in a chauffeur-driven Buick and whom I assumed to be the owner. I attempted to inquire about the apartment but found that he did not speak English and at this point my vocabulary in Turkish was about three words. He then shifted to German, which I had studied in college, and we were able to communicate to a certain extent. I later learned that Turks who were educated before World War I usually spoke German. Those who were educated between World Wars I and II usually speak French and those who have been educated since World War II speak English. This is the best index I have found of the influence of Western culture on Turkey.

Turkey's great leap from the Middle Ages to modernization was between the two world wars under the leadership of the powerful Mustafa Kemal Ataturk. It was during this period that Turkey began effectively to adopt European methods for governing the country. For its civil code it turned to the Swiss system. For personnel administration it turned to the French.

Pay Rates under the Barem Law

Turkey does not at the present writing have a central personnel office; but being a centralized system of government, it does have a personnel law that applies to all levels of government.¹ This law is called the Barem Law. It is enforced through the fiscal authority of the Ministry of Finance which controls expenditures of all departments of the government. Entrance pay rates for employees under Barem Law are based on the educational attainment of the employee. Salary increases are then based on longevity. If an employee is a university graduate, he can enter the state service at one of the higher "degrees" or salary ranges. If he is a high school graduate, he enters at a lower level. There is only an incidental relationship between the difficulty of work performed and the employee's salary rate.

Since World War II there has been a continuous and drastic inflationary spiral in Turkey. Salaries have not kept pace with the cost of living and at the present time are far from adequate. In order to maintain adequate staffs and fulfill their functions many of the departments of the government have turned to a variety of salary subterfuges. One of these has been to hire an employee on a daily wage basis not fixed by the Barem Law. Newer laws have provided for these daily rates without bringing the fixed salary levels up to a realistic level. In some departments nearly 90 per cent of the employees

¹ Editor's Note: We have been informed by the author that, subsequent to the preparation of his article, legislation was passed creating a General Personnel Office for the purpose of modernizing personnel administration in Turkey, although the details of setting up the office had not yet been accomplished as this issue went to press.

are now paid on daily rates. Employees have sacrificed the tenure, retirement benefits, and other benefits that go with the Barem rates in order to have the higher take-home pay of the daily rates. Many employees have been allowed to retain a rate of pay under the Barem Law and also accept additional pay under the daily rate structure. Others are receiving pay for three positions without, of course, doing any extra work.

Inequities, Confusion Stalk Pay System

From time to time the Grand National Assembly has attempted to do something for the state employees without changing the basic pay rates of the Barem Law. This has been done by providing "extra pays" or bonuses. Until recently, employees were getting 17 months' pay per year. Last year an attempt was made to raise the basic pay and eliminate both extra pays and the daily pay; however, when the law was passed, "technical" employees were exempt. Many "administrative" employees took salary reduction through adjustment to the "higher" fixed rates while technical employees continued on the daily pay rates. The result of this adjustment, plus the continuation of the subterfuges, has resulted in even greater inequities in pay among the employees and created chaos in the government's pay system.

The government is by far the largest employer in Turkey as much of Turkey's industry is state owned. The confusion in pay extends also to the state industrial enterprises as some of these have managed to have special laws passed which apply to them, or at least to part of their employees. Hence, there is also inequality in the pay of employees of the industrial or banking organizations of the state.

Selection Procedures and Position Classification

Entrance tests are not a requirement; however, some departments of the Turkish government have attempted to qualify candidates by administering examinations. These are usually given in cooperation with the Ministry of Education which prepares and monitors the examination. One large government department gives an examination every three months and employees are hired during the intervening period from successful candidates. Employees are not hired in rank order; but, since the examination is usually in the nature of a general knowledge test, they are interviewed after the examination and selected on the applicability of their previous experience and training in relation to the current job openings. Some departments also administer promotional examinations. These are more closely related to the kind of work performed although they frequently cover a wide range of subject matter. Here again the examination is qualifying and rank order is incidental to selection for promotion.

Many departments have a system of annual rating of employees by supervisors. These ratings cover a wide range of traits from performance on the job to the conduct of the employee in personal life, such as the employee's sobriety and whether he promptly pays his debts or not.

None of the departments have a complete system of position classification. In 1953, with the assistance of the U.S. International Cooperation Administration, a job evaluation study was made for the shop employees of the State Railways. This has been kept reasonably current. At the present time, *Devlet Su Isleri*, which closely resembles the U.S. Bureau of Reclamation and is the second largest governmental department, is conducting a position classification survey of its nearly 10,000 employees with the assistance of an International Cooperation Administration advisor. Under the current system, employees are recorded in large ledger books followed by a rough title which may or may not be descriptive of the work performed. Often the title indicates only a pay "degree" such as "officer." Personnel record-keeping is difficult and the resulting statistics unreliable.

Fringe Benefits

Fringe benefits have played an important part in personnel administration in Turkey. Whereas the government employee has suffered in salary rates, he has not suffered in fringe benefits. They greatly exceed those common to the United States. For example, after only one day of employment the Turkish government employee is entitled to a full year's paid sick leave. He is entitled to full medical and hospital coverage, for which he does not make a contribution. This extends during retirement to death. His family is entitled to hospital coverage. Retirement pay is based on a percentage of pay and is elective at intervals after 25 years service. It is based on the fixed salary schedules and is therefore not adequate at the present time.

Many departments operate summer rest camps for employees and their families. Uniforms are furnished free for guards, messengers, and others required to have them. Often heavy coats and other such garments are furnished for outside workers in the winter time. Life insurance is usually not provided. Some departments have a system of paying 10,000 Turkish lire (\$1 = 9 T.L.) to the survivors of an employee and an assessment is made against all other employees to provide the funds. Paid vacations approximate those in the United States. Each month an employee is permitted a few hours "administrative" leave for taking care of personal business.

Weak Links in the Personnel Chain

Most employees enjoy protection in their positions. Those on the fixed salaries can only be fired for cause. In practice, dismissals are almost unknown. A dismissed employee can sue in regular courts. Daily paid employees theoretically can be dismissed, but in practice are only released for grave offenses that have little to do with efficiency. They may be released through a reduction in force. Some departments follow a practice of elevating older employees, inefficient employees, or employees who have gotten into trouble to the status of "consultants." The more efficient of these are used on various committees or are given special assignments, sometimes involving research or responsibility for special studies in selected areas of their ability. In some cases, however, they continue to draw salaries without being utilized.

One of the weakest areas in personnel administration is related to delegation of authority. Probably because of the influence of autocratic rule in Turkey through the centuries, the levels of administration just below the top echelon and down through the organization are neither conditioned to accepting authority nor accustomed to having it delegated to them. Nearly all decisions, large or small, are passed up to the Directors for action. This results in the Directors having much more detail work than they can attend to and prevents them from devoting time to planning and scheduling the activities of the organization. Under Turkish law, any employee can be held responsible in a court of law for his decisions and can be sued by anyone. This motivates them to seek a ruling from higher authority or diffuse the responsibility by establishing a committee to take action.

So far this article has, by mere statement of fact, emphasized the weaknesses of personnel administration in Turkey when viewed in the light of United States standards and experience. In order not to give an unbalanced picture we will comment upon the steps being taken to improve personnel administration in Turkey. Before doing so, however, we wish to state that despite the weaknesses—from the Western viewpoint—many Turkish agencies are surprisingly well run and have a record of outstanding accomplishment. This has been made possible by having, in some cases, intelligent, forceful leadership and a demand for unswerving devotion to the leaders of the organization. A great deal more labor goes into the construction of structures because of the lack of machinery, but the task is accomplished. Also in various procedures of the government the method is awkward and time consuming, but results are achieved.

The Push for a Central Personnel Office

From time to time over the last ten years there have been attempts to pass legislation establishing a central personnel office. These attempts have not been successful because of the natural reluctance of the politician to give up whatever influence he may have over appointments to public positions, the lack of an organization to promote such legislation, and, surprisingly, the opposition of public employees themselves. This opposition stems from the fact that those on daily pay rates fear that if a central personnel office is established they will be forced back onto fixed pay rates which would be lower than the pay they now receive. The government has not been financially able to couple a general salary increase with the establishment of a central personnel office.

The prospects for the establishment of a central personnel office are brighter now than at any time in the past. The present government in Turkey, set up after the May 27, 1960, revolution, has taken a number of forward steps in such governmental techniques as establishing a central planning organization. It has under consideration a revised version of the previously submitted laws establishing a central personnel office. In our opinion, the proposed law has many deficiencies but it does call for a system of position classification and for salaries to be based on the principle of equal pay for equal work. An attempt will be made to quiet the opposition of the daily paid workers by providing assurances that their salaries will not be reduced during a period of adjustment to whatever salary rates might result from the new legislation. The new law is under consideration by the interim government and may be established subject to later confirmation by an elected assembly to be set up under a new constitution.

Out of the Past and Into the Future

The Public Administration Institute for Turkey and the Middle East is an organization that was established to provide training in public administration for government employees and to give general assistance to governmental agencies. This organization has been assisted by the United Nations. It has offered courses to government employees in personnel administration and organization and methods studies for government agencies. It has given considerable assistance and advice to the new government and has been a strong influence for the establishment of a central personnel office, a central organization and methods office, and other governmental improvements.

For the past three years the International Cooperation Administration has sponsored public administration trainees for study in the United States and Europe. Many of these have studied personnel administration and returned to their departments where they are making improvements in personnel administration. Some departments have also financed foreign study for their employees in personnel administration.

The ICA has given assistance to universities in Turkey where personnel administration has been taught. Two years ago ICA assisted in launching a management improvement program including personnel administration in *Devlet Su Isleri* which has served as a demonstration to other agencies. Recently a similar program was started in the General Directorate of Customs, and programs will soon be started in the State Supply Office and in the Ministry of Interior. Other programs are in the stage of formulation.

With the assistance of the ICA, the Public Administration Institute, and the Political Science departments of the universities, a trained cadre of government officials is being established which will have a strong influence on personnel administration in Turkey. It is believed that the nation is on the verge of a great breakthrough in this area that will facilitate the improved functioning of the entire government and in turn assist in improving the economy of Turkey.

IMPORTANT QUESTIONS of personnel policy and practice seldom yield "cut-and-dried" answers. The editors have posed the question below to several persons representing different points of view to give readers guidelines in formulating their own policies.

THE QUESTION

"Is it desirable, as a matter of policy, to enable public employees to work for other governmental jurisdictions for a limited period of time on a leave of absence basis?"

Says JOHN W. MACY, JR. . . .

Chairman, U. S. Civil Service Commission

Perhaps the best brief comment on the value of personnel interchanges was made about the federal service in the report of the Sixth American Assembly in 1954:

The Federal career system should be cut to the pattern of American customs and institutions. A closed, self-contained system is not in the American tradition. The Federal Service should provide both for promotion from within and for the lateral entry of personnel, particularly in the middle and higher grades. It should be open to interchange with the other fields of American life—business, trade unions, universities, the professions, state and local governments. Such exchanges benefit both the Federal Service and these groups, and our society is the richer. Efforts to close the door on such interchange should be vigorously resisted.

In the years since 1954 the pace of change in our national life has continued to quicken and the need to keep pace in the conduct of the public business at every level of government has increased as well. At the same time the forces tending toward narrow, "institutionalized" careers (public and private) have not on the whole diminished. Thus, difficulties in crossing institutional lines remain as a substantial obstacle to the most effective use of our human resources in a period of rapid change.

Freer interchange among the personnel of the various public jurisdictions on a leave of

absence basis could be a significant step in helping to maintain the principle of an open, flexible system of public employment advocated by the report of the American Assembly and by many other thoughtful observers of our institutions.

Such "openness" has many practical advantages. Surely no one would deny that we should encourage wherever we can the sharing of valuable experience and the search for common solutions to our common problems. Certainly a sensible and relatively inexpensive way to do this is to provide for direct, personal involvement of technical, professional, and managerial personnel with the problems faced by their counterparts in other sectors of public administration. All should gain from this process.

A list of programs in which federal, state, and local governments share a common concern comes readily to mind—welfare, health and sanitation, housing, transportation, recreation, conservation, civil defense, education, regulation of commerce, taxation, and financial administration are but some of the areas in which common problems and common skills can be found.

To mention but one example of what we face in these areas in the coming years, consider the impact of the commercial use of atomic energy. The special knowledges existing at local, state, and federal levels must be brought to bear on a concerted effort to assure the public health and safety. Fortunately, steps are being taken to do this in

the field of atomic energy but there are numerous other areas of vital, though perhaps less dramatic, concern which will require similar mutual effort and pooling of skills.

In the federal service we are thoroughly convinced of the need for and the usefulness of a wide variety of interchanges. Within the federal establishment itself, agreements for permanent interchange have been in operation for several years between the competitive service and other federal merit systems (TVA, AEC, and the Canal Zone, for example) and they are working well.

Moreover, there are a number of existing methods to obtain expert advice on a temporary basis and to broaden the experience of federal employees, but we are not satisfied that there are as many avenues open as are needed. Therefore it is highly encouraging to me that organizations such as the Public Personnel Association are actively exploring this field.

Obviously, there are difficult obstacles to overcome. Questions of dual employment and the protection of employee rights and benefits in the home organization would require legislation. There are problems of comparability of pay and of availability of funds for moving expenses, and so on. Employees must be given satisfactory answers to such questions as "How will my chances for career advancement at home be affected by a period of service elsewhere?"

Fortunately, not all of these problems and questions have to be solved everywhere at once. Modest beginnings can be made and, in fact, have been made through such devices as the Department of Agriculture's Interchange authority under P.L. 918, 84th Congress, and under the atomic energy program already mentioned. The Council of State Governments has prepared model legislation for the protection of the rights and benefits of employees who are on interchange assignments. Adoption of such legislation should be encouraged.

By stimulating discussion of the possibilities and problems of freer movement of public employees, I am sure that further advances can be made. There is no better time to start than the present.

Says ORVILL E. AULT . . .

Consul General of Canada at San Francisco, California.

The public employee who is sought for work with other governmental jurisdictions is usually an officer with considerable experience in administration, finance, or technology. The number of such employees needed by governments abroad is very great. Except for political appointments in this country, the number of involuntary movements of personnel from agency to agency at home for temporary periods is not great.

However, the demand is increasing and more officers are being faced with the decision "to move or not to move." More agency heads are now faced with the need for framing conditions under which their officers may or may not be released for limited periods to work elsewhere. I shall limit my views to transfers abroad.

Before bringing the issue to the level of policy, it should be said that international agencies, private agencies, and national agencies have been hard pressed in the last two or three years to meet the requests of foreign governments for highly specialized staff. The demand has been great, the processes slow, the red tape considerable, the conditions of work not always as represented, and the results not always satisfying. Hard-pressed chiefs of departments at home have rightly raised questions as to the need for enticing key officers away from them when the need for their services was relatively as great or greater, in their view, at home.

On the employee side, there have been some officers who, for personal reasons, have sought temporary posts abroad. They have had personal complexes of their lives satisfied at times by the move. Some have had little interest in returning from the "importance" of an expert post abroad. Many of these officers have done better work abroad than at home. The image of a complex or inadequate officer remains at home. Recruiting is not so easy now because they have become types. Fortunately, the number is small.

In ten years of very close association with service abroad as an expert, as a recruiting agent, and as administrator of a foreign aid

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

program, I have seen a few officers or staff members who should not have been sent—or allowed to go—abroad. In my view, there are three types of these: (1) the officer who is completely out of sympathy with the new nationalism in the “new” foreign country where he is asked to serve; (2) the officer who, as a person, does not get on well with his associates at home, and this means with subordinates as well as with chiefs; and (3) the officer who is not an “expert” in his field, who is not fully trained, has had a very narrow experience, or who cannot be expected to give some leadership in this field, even in a primitive setting. I have met a very few of these three types abroad. In my opinion, they do a disservice overseas.

As for policy, I would strongly urge that public services permit selected employees to serve on leave of absence for one or two terms of a year or two each with other agencies, especially agencies abroad. The two terms should be separated by at least one or two years back in his own service. Retirement contributions while abroad should be paid on the same basis as service at home.

The employee while absent might enter promotion competitions but is not likely to be moved to a vacant job while he is on contract to another agency. He should continue to be a part of a salary and promotion system that functions to no disadvantage to him while he is away. His post should be filled by another officer during his absence. His experience and responsibility abroad should be considered in his promotion or reappointment on his return.

In setting the policy, I would have these criteria:

1. The chief of each department has an objective and he must meet this or assess how well he is meeting it before he releases staff to serve elsewhere for even a temporary period.

2. In a large agency, the daily routine experiences may be adequate to develop a staff and no one needs to be “sent out” or released for experience.

3. An officer is helped and not hindered by experience, whether it is at home or abroad.

4. A legislative or executive policy decision should be made, stating that the

country or the jurisdiction has a responsibility to help other states, countries or jurisdictions by releasing limited staff who are competent, and needed. This policy should be clear and definite lest the chief of a division has to make this determination along with the decision as to whether he is able from stress of work to release an employee.

5. The conditions of release, time of absence, number of terms to be served, and seniority while absent should all be made clear.

6. The method of advertising requests for experts and the method of selection of experts from within the staff should be known in general terms.

The difficulties in putting such a policy into practice are considerable. Every request is different and every employee has his own problems. A few “don’ts” might be helpful. *Don’t* allow an employee to develop an international career and use his job back home as a safe one to which to revert when he chooses. On the other hand, if he finds the satisfactions and successes in an international career, *don’t* stand in his way. *Don’t* allow the choice to be delayed too long. No employee should be away from his post for five years then suddenly return in a demanding mood.

Keep in touch with “on leave” employees at regular intervals so that they retain their interest and are kept informed. Neither give advantages to these employees nor penalize them. There should be rules on seniority, retirement contributions, and promotion credits, but they have to be flexible and just. An able employee who is working in his own field abroad and gaining good experience should not be disregarded in a promotion situation because he is “on leave abroad.”

Many employees have found an unfriendly attitude on their return to their home post, as if they had managed a tour for themselves to exotic places while the home staff “carried the load.” Good personnel practice should have prevented this. I know of no exotic tours that do not have their hardships. I am also aware that a home staff has to share duties while a member of the staff is absent for any reason.

Don’t encourage employees to bargain

for positions abroad and *don't* allow agencies to do recruiting among the staff of your department. The best results are obtained if a recruiting agency and the head of a department sit down together to determine the need to be met abroad and the best qualified person who might be interested in taking the assignment. A roster of competent "available" people in each department has been suggested for quick and emergent needs. It is very difficult to keep such a list ready for instant use because family situations change and even competence changes.

Above all, *don't* on your responsibility endorse a selection that is bound to fail. Some employees change for the better just because they move. However, the risks are high. A failure or personnel problem case is not likely to be corrected by missionary zeal in a foreign post.

Finally, the budget bureau, the treasury, or the civil service commission must make some provision for a staff that is large enough to meet some of these foreign demands if a department, by its nature, is frequently called upon to lend staff to other agencies at home or abroad.

The advantages to the employee of this "foreign service" are greater than the advantages to the employer. However, it is my view that sufficient use is not made of the experience and knowledge of the employee who has served elsewhere "on leave." There are two types of employees who can best serve on these assignments—the young middle-level employee who is on his way to the top of his profession or administration and the senior employee with a good career of expertise behind him who can be a consultant abroad for one or two years and then return to his own department in an advisory post before retirement.

The middle-level employee going abroad as an expert usually has a greater opportunity while overseas to work in a political environment. He is closer to a minister or a politically appointed head of an agency or department. He is continuously aware of political turbulences and their effect on the country or the work he is expected to do. He may also be aware of a complex stratified bureaucracy that makes even routine decisions slow and their effect frustrating.

However, with initiative and the prestige

of his position, he can find ways—he must find ways—of accomplishing the purposes for which he was summoned from a post that may have seemed unimportant at home. While the senior officer going abroad gains this experience, he does have an opportunity to test his knowledge and methods in a strange new environment.

The expert overseas is brought face to face with costs—costs that are frequently exorbitant and funds that have to be spread so thin. He must, if he is conscientious, put long-term and short-term values on goods, services, and events.

Finally, the employee from one country who goes to another has a stronger "nationalist" feeling than he had at home. He compares values and decides perhaps for the first time that his country's institutions and way of life are better by comparison. It is good to make this discovery, but bad to put it to improper use. If he is fair, he develops tolerance along with his new appreciation. He may become a little critical of some of his home customs in the light of new values, but he must not become boastful or "ugly."

He has to be a good representative, a good ambassador, a friendly expert who is in a foreign country to help and to guide and to give advice, but not to direct. He should grow in humility and in stature.

Says RALPH D. TIVE . . .

Executive Director, Pennsylvania State Civil Service Commission

In 1956, the Pennsylvania State Civil Service Commission began a program of reorganization and professionalization of the merit system in the Commonwealth. This project had barely been initiated when a far-reaching extension of civil service by executive action was added. Classification as a distinct technical entity was unknown, recruitment and training never existed, and even in the area of examinations there was inadequate staffing. The circumstances surrounding both problems which faced us required speed in their resolution and completion. It was obvious that without help both programs would be seriously hampered, and failure would bring discredit to the commission and its program.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

We sought help, and this help came from several sources, including the Public Personnel Association. In my opinion, the best aid we received came from employees of other jurisdictions who came to Pennsylvania for varying periods of time to help us and advise us. We asked for and received help in the fields of examination, classification, public relations, recruitment, organization, and even in the area of what might be called the philosophy of a merit system operation. With this help, we were able to meet deadlines for qualifying examinations and were able to carry out our basic reorganization plan.

When a jurisdiction is faced with problems such as those mentioned above, it is obvious that it will seek all possible sources of help, whether it be from professional organizations, professional consultants or from other jurisdictions. This is what we did in the situation I have described. We recognized a similar situation when we gladly acceded to a request by the Public Personnel Association to grant a three-month leave of absence to an examination technician to help in the Kentucky qualifying program.

To my mind, a more valuable procedure would be a continuing relationship between employees of one jurisdiction and the central personnel agency of another. It seems to me that there is much to be said for having periodic, fresh, objective, and dispassionate assessments of our program by skilled and knowledgeable employees of other jurisdictions. It is my opinion—and my experience satisfies me that it is valid—that such a relationship can do much to improve personnel administration in all the jurisdictions involved.

This proposal does not require extended absences from the consultants' home base, and may not require leaves of absence. I believe it will answer some of the questions posed by the current "Personnel Opinions" topic with regard to the obstacles which might be considered. It would not be necessary to concern oneself with effect on seniority, retirement, and other such items. This proposal does not comprehend the existence of an emergency or a crash program. It does presuppose that all of our operations will profit from a brief but intensive evaluation by people who are not intimately in-

involved in the day-to-day operation of any governmental function.

Let me illustrate from our experience how this might operate. About two or three times a year, we invite employees of other jurisdictions, who helped us during 1956 and 1957, to come to Pennsylvania. The period which is spent here generally does not exceed two weeks. Our purpose in this is not that we have a specific emergency or a critical problem on which we would like outside thinking; the consultant is merely invited to come to Harrisburg, observe our operation, and comment either favorably or critically. He spends time with the bureau directors responsible for all of the technical and administrative operations of the commission. He discusses their problems with them and notes those areas which may be critical or may develop into crises.

At the end of the period of his visit, he spends a considerable amount of time with me. He may tell me of the progress or the lack of progress which he has found in any one or all of our various operations. He then suggests possible solutions, and in many instances will submit written recommendations or suggestions for improvement or change.

We have found this to be extremely valuable and are continuing this cooperative endeavor. From such consultations during the past three and one-half years have come a proposed new set of rules soon to be adopted by the commission, a new method of handling criminal records and character matters generally, revisions in our examination and certification processes, new approaches to classification, and new emphasis in our public relations—to mention only a few.

I believe we have contributed to better personnel administration in the jurisdictions from which our consultants come. Some of the things which we have done and are doing are different and perhaps are improvements on methods in other states. The consultants take these philosophies and these procedures back with them when they leave. Certainly one of the major contributions has been that the consulting employees of these other places gain a broader perspective in the field of public personnel administration. They become acquainted with problems which on the surface may be unique

to Pennsylvania, but which might and sometimes do come up at home. It may be trite to say this, but everybody benefits from such an arrangement. Yet it is simple, avoids many procedural complications and has benefits for all.

Our experience indicates that a continuation of these arrangements is justified and probably could be extended. I am sure that we would be happy to consider extension of such arrangements on a mutually reciprocal basis.

Says ROBERT BIREN . . .

*Director, Office of Management Planning,
International Cooperation Administration*

An organized program for granting leaves of absence to public employees to work for other governmental jurisdictions or for other organizations has obvious advantages to the employee, his parent agency, and the organization to which he is loaned. The success of such a program depends on a variety of factors including the numbers and skills of employees who might take advantage of such leaves, the agency's authority to grant the leave and at the same time protect the employee's seniority and retirement rights in the home agency, the agency's ability to place its employees in situations which would further their development, and the ability of the agencies concerned to finance the arrangements.

The International Cooperation Administration has had a program of this type for several years, and is considering an expansion of it. The reasons for its adoption and the advantages which have been derived from it are described below. The principal difficulty encountered in the administration of the program has been to find appropriate placements for available ICA employees. This has been true despite the variety of skills the agency can utilize, and, conversely, can furnish through its employees, and despite its wide range of contacts within the United States government, international agencies, educational institutions, and private industry. State and city governments with more limited or less formal contacts might encounter considerable difficulty unless they can develop effective cooperative

procedures for exchanging information on employee and position availabilities.

The ICA has a special interest in finding appropriate placements in the United States for some of its employees who have served overseas. By United States standards, most of the eighty-five countries in which ICA has missions are hardship posts. Many diseases not found normally in the United States are endemic in these areas, and general health facilities may be poor or non-existent. Adequate educational facilities are not always available, and in some of the areas there is internal strife or constant threat of war. To maintain technical competence and high morale in a personnel corps subjected to such conditions, and to the extraordinary physical and emotional stresses of living in radically different cultures, requires extraordinary efforts in many personnel processes.

To counteract the adverse effects of long-term overseas assignments under such conditions, ICA employees and their dependents are permitted to return to the United States every twenty-four months for a period of leave of six to eight weeks. During this brief period, however, it is not possible to achieve a satisfactory re-orientation to American living and thinking.

To permit employees to remain in the United States for longer periods under normal living conditions, the agency has developed a system of rotation between Washington and overseas posts. The number of such assignments is insufficient, however, as the overseas staff is twice the size of the Washington staff. Other assignments are made by detailing employees to educational institutions for new and refresher training and, to the extent possible, to other agencies within and outside the government on full-time work assignments. To date, assignments outside the agency have been limited but the experience gained indicates that the potential placements are considerable.

During the past two years, placements have been made in the state governments of California, Florida, Nebraska, and North Carolina; in Cornell University, Oklahoma State University, University of Minnesota Hospital, and Georgetown University Hospital; in the United States Department of Agriculture and the United Nations Food

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

and Agriculture Organization. The types of skills represented among these employees are sanitary engineering, public health nursing, and advisors in the fields of education, public administration, community development, city planning, and horticulture.

The employees assigned outside ICA continue to retain their retirement, health and insurance benefits, and suffer no loss in retirement service credit or salary since ICA continues to pay the employee. In some instances the receiving agency transfers to ICA the amount which would normally be paid for the service rendered. In other instances the employee is assigned on a non-reimbursable basis. To the extent reimbursement can be obtained, the program can be expanded and made more useful.

The advantages realized by the various participants in such a program are numerous. For example:

1. The lending agency is aided in retaining better-informed, more competent, and highly motivated personnel and, at the same time, can improve its public relations and recruitment potential through the activities of its employees during their diversified assignments.
2. The employee is provided an opportunity to renew technical and cultural contacts in the United States and to up-date his technical skills intensively, but naturally, through regular academic and professional activities. Occasionally, the new experience gained may lead to new occupational opportunities—perhaps for post-retirement activity. Many urgent personal requirements, such as lengthy medical observation, education of teen-age children, care of aged parents or other relatives, which could not be solved during a short period of leave can be taken care of during a one- or two-year assignment.
3. Agencies which accept these employees for an assignment have an opportunity to secure the services of personnel with backgrounds not commonly available, such as operational international economists, specialists in tropical horticulture, and public administration employees with background in more than

one type of governmental activity. They obtain well-qualified personnel at no increased cost since the ICA pays at least the difference between the salary normally paid by the employer and the salary the employee earns in ICA. In addition, employees assigned under these conditions can devote full time and interest to the job at hand without competing with other employees for advancement.

4. Institutions to which an expanded program of this type should be of particular assistance include colleges and universities seeking instructional personnel to meet critical requirements, and state and local agencies in such fields as agriculture, public health, education, and economic planning. If adequate resources can be made available for the staff needed to plan and carry out a vigorous program of this type, there can be no doubt of the value which will accrue to all the parties to such arrangements.

Says DR. WILLIAM J. RONAN . . .

Secretary to the Governor of New York

It is good public policy to encourage career employees to work in other governmental jurisdictions for limited periods of time while on leave of absence from their permanent positions. In my own career I have had the opportunity of service at all three levels of government and I would not trade that experience.

The last several decades have produced profound changes in the nature of our federal system. In years past, functions of government were far more compartmentalized within each of the several levels of government. The impacts of the great depression, the New Deal, World War II, and the cold war, have resulted in a general loosening of this compartmentalization. As a well known political scientist, Morton Grodzins, has succinctly observed, "No important activity of government in the United States is the exclusive province of one of the levels, not even what may be regarded as the most national of national functions such as foreign relations; not even the most local of local

functions, such as police protection and park maintenance."

It is in this frame of reference that one can best judge the need for an expanded program of personnel interchange. A state highway department engineer who has had a responsible job experience either in the U.S. Bureau of Public Roads or a municipal department of public works, or both, can make a more creative contribution in his career assignment in the state agency.

Such benefits can be derived from personnel interchanges at almost any stage in a civil servant's career. Advantages can accrue to both the employee and his permanent department whether the interchange takes place in the beginning, toward the end, or in mid-career. In fact, an employee could benefit from a limited work experience at another level of government at several different stages in his career.

The demands of the cold war and the breaking up of the colonial empires have required our nation to commit itself to comprehensive programs of technical assistance in nearly every corner of the world. These programs provide a splendid opportunity for American civil servants to participate in the development of the less technically advanced countries and in turn bring back to their career positions a new perspective which can make them more effective citizens and officials.

The benefits to a civil servant from a work assignment away from his career job need not be limited to work in other governmental jurisdictions. Substantial benefits can come from a tour of duty in related private employment. The expanding technical and scientific requirements upon government call for an increase in personnel exchange with industry, universities and private research organizations.

Despite the conviction on the part of most leaders in public personnel management that these employment interchanges are both useful and important, there is relatively little interchange. There are technical and housekeeping obstacles, but the biggest hurdle has been inertia on the part of management. Interchange as an abstraction is fine, but if it means disrupting the routines of personnel management, it all too often has been avoided. What is needed is a genuine

desire on the part of management to effect a workable program of exchange.

When one begins to focus on the specific obstacles standing in the way of intergovernmental personnel exchange, the total problem begins to reduce in size. Let us take seniority for example. Procedures can be developed to allow civil servants on limited leaves of absence to other governments to participate in promotion examinations or be considered for non-competitive promotion as vacancies occur. What is usually needed to protect the employee's seniority privileges is a little ingenuity on the part of the personnel managers plus some conviction on the part of the department heads that their agency's program will be enriched upon the return of a career employee from service elsewhere.

As to problems involving retirement plans, these too can hopefully be worked out. In New York State we have been fortunate in the fact that our state and local retirement systems are designed to facilitate easy transfer between the state government and our local governments. Study should be given to the possibility of utilizing either the federal social security program or the plans of the large insurance companies for the safeguarding of retirement benefits.

Increased flexibility in public employment is stimulated by the early "vesting" of the pension rights of employees. The federal government has permitted the vesting of pension rights for many years. New York State civil servants, as a result of recommendations from Governor Rockefeller, can now vest pension rights after fifteen years of service.

For many years I have advocated the administration of joint examinations resulting in parallel eligible lists that could be certified for appointment to federal, state, or local agencies. These examinations could be run by the U.S. Civil Service Commission or by a state civil service department and could be given in such fields as social welfare, public health, civil engineering, or the management arts of personnel and budgeting. The joint examination process would also contribute to a more flexible public service.

In summary, I urge that increased thought be given toward stimulating the exchange of career employees between various units

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

of government and related private employment. I do not advocate that such a program be permitted to grow in size so that it would become disruptive to normal governmental operations; nor do I advocate that the necessary leaves of absence be extended over too long a period of time. (In actuality, such dangers are unreal as the amount of exchange today is negligible.) What is needed now is concentrated study and analysis leading to more workable plans for the exchange of career officials.

The Public Personnel Association might well initiate a study of the needs, problems and means of implementing an expanded personnel exchange program between the various levels of government, industry, and the universities. Here is an opportunity for public personnel administrators to constructively meet the current challenges presented by both federalism and the nation's new responsibilities in an age requiring the constant acquisition of new skills and broader perspectives.

Management Books from Irwin

PERSONNEL MANAGEMENT, *Fourth Edition*

By Michael J. Jucius, The Ohio State University

Provides personnel managers and other business executives with a timely and realistic guide to sound principles and practices in personnel management. \$10.60

PRINCIPLES OF MANAGEMENT, *Third Edition*

By George R. Terry, Northwestern University

Explains and illustrates basic principles of management, along with the four fundamental functions of management: planning, organizing, actuating, and controlling. \$ 9.65

ELEMENTS OF MANAGERIAL ACTION

By Michael J. Jucius and William E. Schlender, The Ohio State University

Presents a comprehensive analysis of the elements necessary for managerial action and how they can be integrated for organizational effectiveness. \$ 9.00

PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION

By Alva F. Kindall, Harvard Business School

Studies the actual problems faced by executives at all levels of an organization in carrying out their responsibility for personnel administration. \$10.60

ORDER YOUR BOOKS TODAY

NOTE: Readers can save 15% by taking advantage of the cash-purchase arrangement described on page 254.

RICHARD D. IRWIN, INC.

1818 RIDGE ROAD

HOMewood, ILLINOIS

the

bookshelf

Elements of Managerial Action. By Michael J. Jucius and William E. Schlender. Homewood, Ill., Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1960. xi, 439 pp. \$9.00.

Reviewed by

CHARLES H. BENTLEY

Vice President

*American National Bank and Trust
Company of Chicago*

If you are an undergraduate who has decided to major in the field of management, whatever that might be, and if your professor has prescribed this textbook for the course, and if you still have nine uncommitted dollars, you will want to purchase this book. Frankly, we wish you had elected economics or finance, but the decision to major in management was yours, not ours.

Through the use of this textbook you will learn something about the general field of management and its philosophy. You will learn that the basic parts of the manager's job are planning, organizing, directing, and controlling. You will learn that there are techniques for setting a company's objectives. (Unfortunately, you will learn that in a certain survey almost half of the respondents considered service to customers and providing employment as the objectives of their firms. Apparently all of our acquaintances were too busy earning a profit for their company to answer that particular questionnaire.)

As a student of management you will learn that there are line organizations, staff organizations, and informal organizations within business. You will learn that there are specialists within the management structure and that there are frequently relationships that do not show on the organization chart. The student of management will receive an introduction to the field of human relations—that is, what the phrase means—and some

superficial aspects of motivating people. There are theories of morale, factors of morale, and facets of morale. This textbook, and presumably the course that goes with it, proceeds to discuss the handling of grievances, of disciplinary action, procuring the executive team, executive development and appraisal, and executive compensation.

Students of management will find little new in this book to increase their understanding of the management process or to increase their own effectiveness as a manager. This is not to minimize the value of this book, since it is presented frankly as a beginning textbook in a college management course. In this reviewer's opinion, such courses are so devoid of real substance that a 439-page dissertation is quite an accomplishment in itself.

Supervisors in Action: Developing Your Skills in Managing People. By J. J. Famularo. McGraw-Hill Book Co., Inc., 330 West 42nd St., New York 36, N. Y., 1961. xii, 238 pp. \$4.75.

Reviewed by

FRANK P. SHERWOOD

Acting Dean

*School of Public Administration
University of Southern California*

The quite obvious purpose of this book is to impart the so-called "simple truths" of supervision in as readable a fashion as possible. If there are such truths, then this effort may be counted a success.

There appears to be little doubt in the mind of the author as to their existence. He is at a number of points very clear—indeed quite optimistic—in his assumption that behavior in the pattern proposed will make for a happier work crew, greater productivity, and broader social benefit. It is all very

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

simple and rational, as he explains in his description of the process of counseling:

If there is a sound reason for the supervisory suggestion, and there usually is, the supervisor should be prepared to explain why an employee can't afford *not* to follow through on the suggestion, or why it will pay him to find time. This should not be too difficult to accomplish. For example, attendance at a two hour course, six weeks running, will result in improved performance on the part of the employee; better training of employees will improve productivity and reduce turn-over; better performance leading to a promotion will mean more money for the wife and kids; a good attendance record means a better chance for a merit increase; careless work habits resulting in serious accident could mean weeks at no pay; overtime means extra money for extra comfort; helping someone today will mean getting help from that someone tomorrow, and working in this way will bring added enjoyment to the work (pp. 188-189).

In this "relatively new approach," we have a good illustration of the misleading character of much writing in administration. It is assumed that everyone should agree on their personal, group, and organizational interests and that these are inherently congruent. The improbability of such a state of affairs hardly need be argued. Further, there is no indication in the book that individual perceptions are shaped by experience and seldom communicate the same reality to different human beings.

In short, the real-life situation is one where our interests do differ considerably, where our perception of reality varies, and where our selection of the paths by which we achieve certain needs is drastically affected by our cognitive abilities. It seems to me that the supervisor who fails to recognize the omnipresence of these conditions has little chance for success. We therefore can do considerable harm in saying something is easy when it clearly is not.

At times in this book the drive toward simplicity seems especially overdone. For example, there is a case study which deals with the problem drinker and the conclusion is that he should be sent to Alcoholics Anonymous. The girl who never observes the rules is dealt with by this kind of gambit: "You probably forgot, Grace, but we have a memo. . . ."

In all fairness, of course, it must be

pointed out that writing a book on supervision is no easy task. The subject itself is as broad as the vast arena of knowledge in human behavior. Yet the audience presumably is one with no more than a high school education and certainly one with no real sophistication in the social sciences. How do we put these things together? What is really worth communicating to the supervisor?

I am inclined to question whether many of the traditional subjects—the common fare of this and most other books on supervision—do a great deal to advance understanding. I doubt, for example, that preaching does much good, as is suggested in the following passage: "It is part of your learning and training to see to it that your employees know what they are expected to do and how to do it. Unless you raise their job skills, the performance of individual employees and of the work team as a whole will remain static" (p. 81).

In the literature of administration it would seem that we are developing some dimensions which may be far more critical and more helpful to the supervisor in the prosecution of his tasks. Particularly it would seem that the work in the field of group behavior, a subject not covered in this book, is relevant. The supervisor works in a group and is typically far removed from the organization taken in its total aspect. Getting to know more about group cohesiveness, about the setting of group standards, and about the locomotion of groups toward goals would seem to be vital.

Leadership, with its concerns about style and influence, is another potentially significant area of understanding; and in a society as dynamic as that of the United States, every administrator must increasingly regard himself as a change agent. It would seem that an orientation along these lines might produce greater potential benefit for those who are on the first line of leadership in American government and industry.

In the last analysis, I cannot escape a sense of futility about the impact of this book on the people in supervision. Admittedly, it may be read and enjoyed because it is smooth and articulate; but that it will change behaviors, I doubt. Supervisory training will have to depend on more dynamic techniques of getting the message across, such as the Pigors' Incident Method, role-playing of various kinds, and sensitivity training.

Executive Retirement and Effective Management. By Richard A. Beaumont and James W. Tower. Industrial Relations Counselors, Inc., 1270 Avenue of the Americas, New York 20, N. Y., 1961. viii, 248 pp. \$7.50. (Industrial Relations Monograph No. 20.)

Reviewed by

E. B. SHULTZ

*Cornell University
Studies of Retirement Policies*

This monograph is a report by two knowledgeable students of industrial management about their findings from 228 companies by mail-questionnaire responses and from 46 companies in which they made field studies. These 274 companies cover a wide range as to size but only seventeen have fewer than 1000 employees and thirty-two have over 20,000 employees.

Mandatory retirement at a fixed age was reported to be the policy in about 82 per cent of the cases, but their policies were not always strictly applied. The actual practices reported are grouped into five classes: Class A—No Normal or Mandatory Retirement Age; Class B—Normal Retirement Age, but Indefinite Retention; Class C—Normal Retirement Age, but Selective Retention; Class D—Mandatory Retirement Age Which May Be Waived; Class E—Mandatory Retirement Age With No Exceptions. Classes C and E were the most common practices reported in the mail questionnaires (by 162 of the 228 companies); Classes C and D were the most common practices found among the field study group. Class C was the model practice in the total sample (in 109 of the 274 companies).

The authors seem to believe that only mandatory retirement can be systematic and support a systematic executive staffing plan. Although the authors report their findings objectively and veer away from value judgments, one finishes reading the monograph with the impression that they believe executive training programs and staffing are seldom influenced by any considerable degree of flexibility in the retirement age. This impression persists despite their acknowledged recognition of the well known facts that: (1) people do not age alike; (2) executives do not suddenly become inefficient when they reach a specified birthday; (3) decisions on retirement require the same kind of judgments that must be made concerning other personnel actions such as employment, termination, and promotion.

It is entirely possible that rigid executive training programs require rigid retirement policies, but it is also possible, or so the reviewer believes, that executive training programs could be flexible and thus accommodate a flexible retirement policy.

One of the fresher treatises in the monograph concerns early retirement. This provision in retirement plans is no longer just a protective device to give employees a vested right to their employers' contributions when they have to be terminated before they reach the retirement age. Recently early retirement is also being considered a protective device for the employer by which he can retire those he no longer desires to keep.

The authors find early retirement now being utilized by a number of companies to more or less gracefully get rid of executives who have ceased to be effective or who are excess due to mergers, reorganizations, or contraction of operations. In making this use of early retirement, the retirees are usually given a supplementary retirement benefit so they will receive about the same company pensions as though they had reached retirement age. Also they are usually offered special counseling to try to persuade them that they wish to retire.

The reviewer suspects that, while the supplemental benefit is acceptable in these cases as an inducement to retire, the counseling is either resented or accepted philosophically with tongue in cheek, depending on the disposition of the retiree. When early retirement is elected voluntarily by an executive, the authors believe this objectionable because it disrupts the systematic program for maintaining an effective management team. Therefore it should be discouraged, presumably by penalties of some kind. This viewpoint ignores or considers irrelevant findings of sociological research that those who retire voluntarily make the best adjustment to retirement.

The authors suggest, because of increasing social pressures or because of the predicted future shortage in the age group from which executives must emerge, that many able executives may have to be retained beyond the present normal or mandatory retirement age. If this is true, and I believe it is, at least two solutions seem to this reviewer to be available. Either the retirement age must be advanced and greater use be made of early retirement to eliminate the inefficient executive, or acceptable procedures and criteria must be adopted for retaining the effective executives beyond age 65.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

To the reviewer, the latter of these alternatives seems preferable. Also, both on the basis of personal experience and some of that cited in the monograph, I believe this alternative is entirely feasible if those in the higher echelons who must make the decisions have the courage and insight for which they are being remunerated.

The evidence is clear that, in spite of mandatory retirement age policies, it was necessary in so very many cases to make exceptions to meet practical situations. One wonders why it is not deemed wiser and better management to draft a rational policy and procedure for doing what so frequently becomes necessary, and even more frequently might be desirable. Surely the arbitrary exceptions to a stated policy create more problems than rational executive decisions on retirements and retentions.

For those who wish a readable review of

the various retirement policies and practices of executive retirement now in effect, this monograph is very informative. For those who seek solutions to specific problems and situations it is of little value. The information presented must necessarily be unidentified as to source and the accounts are exceedingly sketchy. Probably its chief merit, and possibly its purpose, is to provide evidence that here is a consulting organization which has gathered a great deal of information on executive retirement which might be helpful in dealing with particular situations and problems.

Since this review is written for the readers of *Public Personnel Review*, I should add that the monograph is of limited value to public administrators except where laws and regulations governing retirement leave considerable freedom for administrative policy and judgment.



BOOK AND
PAMPHLET
NOTES

Programmed Learning: Evolving Principles and Industrial Applications. Jerome P. Lysaught (Ed.). Foundation for Research on Human Behavior, 1141 E. Catherine St., P. O. Box 1261, Ann Arbor, Mich., 1961. 179 pp. \$3.00.

The papers in this report were presented at a series of meetings of businessmen and social scientists held in October 1960. The purpose of the meetings was to explore the possibilities, current applications, theory, and outlook for the future of programmed learning with the aid of devices, which include automated teaching machines. Participants from Eastman Kodak and IBM discuss the experiences of their respective companies with programmed instruction as a training device. Other papers cover the principles of programming, differences in approach, and learning theory and future research. Included in the report are eight appendixes, a bibliography, a list of known programs and programmers, and a list of present and possible manufacturers of teaching machine equipment.

Personnel Administration: Principles and Cases. Alva F. Kindall. Richard D. Irwin, Inc., Homewood, Ill., 1961. xvii, 713 pp. \$10.60.

The author, Professor of Business Administration at the Harvard Graduate School of Business Administration, has assembled for this volume a variety of actual cases involving problems in personnel administration that certain business and governmental organizations in the U. S. have encountered. They have been designed to offer a realistic approach to the subject of personnel administration, rather than an analysis of the techniques per se. Divided into nine sections, covering such topics as personnel policies and procedures, development of employee potential, wage and salary administration and performance appraisal, fringe benefits, discipline, and others, the cases are presented impartially and provide an opportunity to analyze not only how different organizations operate but also how different organizations have dealt with a similar problem. Sug-

gested supplementary readings are given at the beginning of each section of the book. An index of cases and a general index are also included.

Retirement Preparation Programs: A Study of Company Responsibilities. Michael T. Wermel and Geraldine M. Beideman. Benefits and Insurance Research Center, Industrial Relations Section, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California, 1961. x, 194 pp. \$10.00.

As the title indicates, this publication deals with the results of a study undertaken for the purpose of determining what management's responsibilities are in helping employees prepare for retirement. The retirement plans and policies of some 500 participating companies are represented in this study, with the focus on the extent to which they included preretirement planning as a management function. Part I discusses the roles of organized groups, such as voluntary community organizations, educational institutions, and labor organizations; Part II reports the background and findings of the survey; Part III consists of an evaluation of the survey findings and the conclusions that were drawn from them. Two appendixes, one containing a reproduction of the questionnaire used in the survey and the other reviewing the central problems involved when individuals retire, are included. A list of selected references completes the publication.

Shaping a New Concept of Administrative Management. American Management Association, 1515 Broadway, Times Square, New York 36, N. Y., 1961. 112 pp. \$3.00/AMA Members: \$2.00. (AMA Management Report No. 56.)

The eleven papers included in this report were first given at AMA's Special Administrative Services Conference in New York, October, 1960. They represent the experiences of various administrative executives who explain how such specialized functions as data processing, systems management, office administration, management engineering, etc., can be effectively utilized to cut down paperwork and overhead costs and increase overall efficiency of the organization. The public service is represented in this collection by a paper on "Administrative Management in the Veterans Administration," by the VA Administrator, Sumner G. Whittier.

Graduate Study in Public Administration: A Guide to Graduate Programs. Ward Stewart. Office of Education, U. S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, 1961. Available from Superintendent of Documents, Government Printing Office, Washington 25, D. C. xi, 158 pp. \$1.25.

This report, prepared at the request of, and in cooperation with, the American Society for Public Administration, describes the 145 graduate programs in public administration being conducted by 83 institutions of higher learning in the U. S. and Puerto Rico. Part One of the report presents an overview of graduate preparation for public administration as well as a discussion of some distinctive new and developing programs of the post-World War II era. Part Two consists of the individual descriptions of the graduate programs in public administration at each of the 83 institutions participating in the survey undertaken by the Division of Higher Education of the U. S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. A map showing location of the graduate programs, four tables, and an index to program descriptions are included.

Basic Issues in Public Administration. Donald C. Rowat (Ed.). The Macmillan Company, 60 Fifth Ave., New York 11, N. Y., 1961. xv, 500 pp. \$5.95.

A collection of forty readings on a variety of subjects in the field of public administration. Designed primarily for supplementary reading and class discussion in introductory courses, this volume should be equally useful to practitioners and teachers since it "represents an attempt to present contending points of view on controversial issues in all the major areas of the subject." Chapter V, dealing with personnel administration, includes pro and con discussions of such questions as: Should civil service commissions be abolished? Should classification disregard the employee? Should there be a senior civil service? Should public employees have the right to strike? Sources of the readings are given at the end of the book.

- Administrative Surveys
- Organization Analysis
- Systems and Procedures
- Salary and Classification
- Manpower and Staffing
- Office Mechanization
- Performance Budgeting
- Records Administration

BARRINGTON AND COMPANY, INC.

230 Park Avenue—New York 17

Member, Association of Consulting Management Engineers

Brochure on Request

J. L. JACOBS & COMPANY

*Counselors in Personnel Administration
Since 1915*

POSITION CLASSIFICATION—SALARY PLANS
RECRUITING AND EXAMINATION
STANDARDS
EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE RATINGS
PERSONNEL RECORDS SIMPLIFICATION
RULES AND REGULATIONS
PERSONNEL MANUALS

53 West Jackson Blvd. Chicago 4, Ill.

LEE ASSOCIATES INC.

Public Administration Consultants

An experienced staff of public personnel specialists available for surveys and installations.

JOHNSTON BLDG., CHARLOTTE
CANDLER BLDG., ATLANTA

JAMES O. YARGER AND ASSOCIATES

PERSONNEL AND MANAGEMENT SERVICES

Services for all units of government:
Position Classification and Salary Plans
Retirement Systems
Personnel Ordinances and Regulations
Employee Selection and Evaluation
Administrative and Fiscal Surveys

An experienced senior staff for your use

309 Walnut St., Falls Church, Virginia

EDWARD N. HAY & ASSOCIATES

Management Consultants

121 S. Broad St., Phila. 7, Pa.

Write for Brochure:

**ORGANIZING
and MANAGING
for RESULTS**

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION SERVICE

A Unique Service to Governments

- A record of more than three hundred successful personnel surveys and installations at all levels of government.
- Consulting services in all areas of governmental management.
- Pertinent publications in many branches of public administration.

1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois

Can Appraisal Interviews Be Made Effective?

Robert K. Stolz. *Personnel*. March-April, 1961.

Why is it that the appraisal interview continues to present a gigantic headache to just about everyone concerned? The theory behind the interview is clear enough: the line manager, after appraising the performance of a subordinate, discusses the results with him to help him see his strengths and weaknesses more clearly and thus motivate the employee to build on his strengths and eliminate his weaknesses. Why is it that these interviews often do not bring about the desired results? The basic fault seems to be a lack of effective communication.

How then can a franker and more honest discussion be stimulated? First there must be a solid foundation for the appraisal discussion. The superior must have nurtured an atmosphere of understanding and trust. The superior must have put enough time and effort into his appraisal to have confidence in it. It must be understood that appraisal and the communication of appraisal results are part of the basic management job.

The superior and subordinate at the outset should agree on the critical requirements of the job, and on the elements of performance that should be examined continuously as evidence of how well the requirements are being met. The appraisal discussion should center on results achieved on the job and not the subordinate's personality. Subordinates distrust evasive techniques.

After a sound foundation for the appraisal discussion has been established, the superior should strive for frankness and candor, rather than worrying whether he is being sufficiently tactful. If these points are followed, effective communication of appraisal results can be achieved.—JOAN M. COLE.

Ground Rules for Appraisal Interviewers.

Robert Hoppock. *Personnel*. May-June, 1961.

Any manager with a reasonable degree of sensitivity for the feelings of others and a

genuine desire to help his subordinates develop can conduct an appraisal interview by following a few simple and straightforward principles.

First, make sure both you and the man agree about the exact nature of his responsibilities. Then ask what he thinks he has done well and what he would like to do better. Listen attentively. Try to detect and understand the feeling behind what he is saying. If he rates himself more favorably than you do, ask him the basis of his self-appraisal. Restate the points on which you agree. Then discuss the differences. In appraising his mistakes, consider them in relation to the number of decisions made and the relative difficulty of tasks assigned; consider his performance over a long period of time.

Don't be unduly influenced by personal traits which do not affect his value to the organization, even though they are not agreeable to you. Criticize performance, not the man himself. If you are at fault, admit it. Never discuss another employee with him. Avoid scheduling an appraisal interview too soon after a disciplinary interview. Do not discuss salary or promotion; it may be construed as a commitment. Be sure you understand one another, even though you may disagree on some points.

Be yourself. Relax and encourage him to relax. Don't try to do too much. An unfavorable appraisal can never be a happy experience, and you cannot hope to change a suspicious, belligerent, or defensive attitude. Tell an unsatisfactory employee exactly where he stands and how he can improve. Offer to help him. Show your appreciation of your good men. Learn how each one wants to develop himself and how you can help.

Your job is to discover talent and develop it. That is more important than striving for perfection. Successful enterprises are not run by little paragons, but by well-balanced teams of able men, each with his own weaknesses.—LEW FAY.

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

A Hard Look at Testing. Saul W. Gellerman.
Personnel. May-June, 1961.

Although underdeveloped and its value not yet proved, personnel testing continues to be accepted and used by management in this form. So long as it is judged in its present immature stage, its usefulness may never be definitely judged.

Some of the criticisms of personnel testing are irresponsible, but some are substantial. Tests have been criticized for their lack of correlation with actual job performance and their tendency to acquire an aura of finality at the expense of individual's achievement records.

Advocates attribute evils of tests as not being inherent in tests themselves but to the unscrupulousness or naivete of those who use them. Arguments which should not be ignored are that tests can screen out job applicants and consequently save management a fruitless training expense, and they provide the only available element of objectivity of evaluating people.

Much of what is currently wrong with tests is due to their relatively immature stage of development. Tests must be skillfully constructed and carefully selected and administered to consistently correlate with job performance. Follow-up studies of the performance of tested employees should be more widespread than they are now. Conclusive validations of tests are seldom feasible, but inertia rather than technical difficulties has prevented checks to be made of test scores against performance.

Psychologists, many of whom look upon business as being hopelessly addicted to primitive testing methods, have impeded the development of personnel testing through indifference and omission. Industrial psychologists have contributed substantially to testing, but before they can further improve it, they must sell management on the need for research to develop valid personnel tests. Test revamping based on research represents as good a risk as many of the other business risks accepted every day.

Testing promises considerable economy by enabling us to place people in work where they can best function. However, before human resources can be fully utilized, we need to learn what elements of an individual affect his capacity to be more productive and how these may be measured.

If business is to take any strides to make work more productive and rewarding, it must be constantly critical of tests, dissatisfied with current testing programs, and receptive

to new tests. The ultimate value of tests may be achieved only through an active demand for more valid and sophisticated testing methods and a stronger research orientation.
—LORETTA K. FUKUDA.

How Supervise?—1943-1960. Ned A. Rosen. *Personnel Psychology.* Spring, 1961.

How Supervise?, an instrument to measure knowledge of human relations attitudes, was published in the early 1940's. It has been used extensively, primarily for training purposes.

Numerous studies made of *How Supervise?* can be classified in the following manner:

1. Reviews of the test
2. Validity studies
3. Use of *How Supervise?* with training programs
4. Correlation of *How Supervise?* scores with intelligence, education and reading ability
5. Industrial studies.

Under each classification, the findings of the various researchers are described. As related to supervisory success, more statistically significant positive data was reported on *How Supervise?* scores than negative results. It is possible that unfavorable results were reported because of unreliable criterion data.

"The really important question that none of the researchers answered is, does *How Supervise?* add anything to the prediction of a success criterion beyond the contribution of intelligence test scores and biographical data on educational background? It can be argued that, even if it adds nothing, the instrument's high face validity makes it more desirable to use than some others. This assumes, of course, that it will predict as well as other possible variables.

"It cannot be argued that a significant increase in score on *How Supervise?* as a result of a formal training program will necessarily lead to improved supervision on the job. However, if the supervisor lacks the knowledge of human relations attitudes, techniques, and principles included in this inventory, it seems highly unlikely that it would be possible for him to apply them."

In essence, the studies indicate that *How Supervise?* is a valuable aid to implement training programs. (The article contains a bibliography.)—BABETTE G. GOLDSMITH.

The University and the Public Service. Rev. H. F. Légaré. *Professional Public Service*. March, 1961.

Basic and underlying principles tend to have universal application. Hence, a study of errors of business management can be relevant in regulating personal and national activities.

We should avoid:

1. An over reliance on current success. There is today a very close link between personal and public affairs in a modern state such as Canada which is no longer on the periphery of world affairs. We must not be content with present success but plan for the future, especially in the realm of education, where the harvest ripens slowly.
2. The error of stifling ideas. The realization, which comes with personal maturity, that fresh ideas are the keys which solve problems, is applicable to matters of public interest. The role of education is to re-examine critically basic ideas and values and to introduce the necessary new ideas for national development. To achieve excellent standards, our educational system must be strengthened and expanded—a matter of vital concern to all citizens.
3. Being a poor listener. Discrimination is necessary in choosing those messages which provide the substance for intelligent listening. There is also a need to develop an analytical and critical judgment concerning not only what is said but also what is left unsaid.
4. The error of not saying what you mean. Bad writing is common in business and government, and among university students. Remedial action has been undertaken within the civil service and universities.

The first step in aiding Canadian universities is a public understanding of their function. National survival warrants national and public support. Canada can only continue as a free and leading nation in the world if we insist on *excellence*. At both vertical and horizontal educational levels, our university students are entitled to a chance to aim at excellence.—J. FRED DAWE.

Puzzle and Perplexity in Executive Development. Chris Argyris. *Personnel Journal*. April, 1961.

A "future-directions" meeting with twenty directors of management development, ad-

mittedly top rate and untypical, led to some provoking findings. Over 85 per cent indicated there was high acceptance of executive development in their firms, by both top management and participating executives, an ideal work situation. Yet the views emanating from these top training executives were perplexing. They are shared with the hope of shedding constructive light on important issues.

Executive trainers generally advocate that line executives should be responsible for their own development. But do they really mean self-controlled, self-defined, self-responsible development? In describing an "ideal program," they seemed to mean development according to the views and control of the management developer.

Training executives also emphasize awareness of self and impact upon others as the central focus for management development. The majority of learning experience offered by trainers, however, seldom leave an effective impression on the inner being of managers.

Further, trainers readily recognize the need for acceptance by the line, yet they frequently place executives in training situations that devalue them. Any one training fad is condemned, but many of the "ideal" programs defined by top trainers are simply a combination of fads. Many trainers maintain they have no time to be creative because they are too busy administering. Yet they deplore the busyness of line managers as a major inhibitor to progress.

Top managers are asking: Do training people really understand and desire self-improvement? Are they aware of the latest findings? Are they able to put them into action? Training directors should consider these questions, if for no other reason than to be able to debunk them.—HERBERT L. HOMAN.

The Mismanagement of Supervisory Training. Warren J. Bowles. *Personnel*. March-April, 1961.

As an instrument of management, supervisory training has fallen far short of expectations. The administrative and conceptual errors committed in the management of supervisory training sharply limit the effectiveness of such a program. The erroneous approaches and attitudes toward supervisory training include:

1. The acceptance of supervisory training as a matter of management etiquette—without the genuine conviction that it

is needed—results in a training program with no true sense of direction.

2. The supervisory training program often operates relatively isolated from the primary system of management's administrative and planning activities.
3. There are no rigorous quality control and inspection techniques for the training function and the training man has been given the unique privilege of being the major appraiser of his work.
4. Programs have become intensely occupied with the mechanics and methods of training, becoming ends rather than means.
5. There is an uncritical acceptance of psychological techniques of training.
6. Management holds the belief that training will serve as a "cure-all" for basic flaws in company policy or an ineffectual organizational structure.

A return to the fundamental concepts that first gave rise to formal supervisory training can help re-establish meaning and restore lost purpose. The supervisor's job requires leadership that will inspire high morale and tap the vast resources present in the workforce. He must have skill in human relations that will inspire in the employee a mood and spirit conducive to willing and dependable performance, faith in the cause or program and in the leadership, and a spirit of whole-hearted cooperation.

It is in the human relations, the interactions and motivation generated in the supervisor-subordinate relationship, that the destiny of every company and the national standard of living is worked out. Supervisory training has suffered in the eyes of many management people because of its repeated failure to enhance the supervisor's skill in human relations.

The basic contribution of a sound training program is the orientation of the learning process toward the satisfaction of the company's immediate and long-range needs; it has a sense of direction and purpose; it avoids hasty, patchwork, isolated training ventures; it integrates the various aspects of training into a meaningful whole.

A check list that may serve to point the way to constructive action includes:

1. Is the supervisory training program a line responsibility and an integral part of an over-all management development program?
2. Are there specific channels of communication between supervisory

trainers and management including a feedback from the training program participants?

3. Is company policy communicable and is full advantage being taken of the opportunity afforded by the training program to clarify company policy?
4. How carefully are training methods and techniques examined before they are introduced into the program?—
GENEVIEVE M. LIND.

The Public Official—Parliament, the Public and the Press. S. H. S. Hughes. *Canadian Public Administration*. December, 1960.

There is a salutary tradition of long standing in Parliament that civil servants are not to be called to account individually and by name for the actions which they perform under the authority of a minister of the Crown. Only that minister can be assailed when things go wrong and acclaimed when things go right. But it should be the abiding concern of civil servants to communicate with Parliament as fully and frankly as it is in their power to do. Then members of all parties may discharge their duties to the people whom they represent with the aid of the most complete information and the most disinterested advice required.

During the present century there has been a tendency for the press to give less prominence to proceedings in Parliament and to adopt a less objective attitude towards Parliamentary reporting. Even answers to questions raised in the House are often not given much exposure in the press. Civil servants are not to be blamed if they have increasing recourse to direct communication with the public through all available media, when the constitutional channels cease to be effective. We may expect an increasing reliance upon experts in public relations not only to deal directly with the press, but to conduct costly and continuous advertising campaigns to attract public attention to departmental problems. This will result in the taxpayer having to pay to have his own elbow jogged.

In the public interest certain simple rules can be laid down governing the direct relationships with the public. A civil servant should be accessible, available, and not given to making members of the public wait. All letters from the public should at least be acknowledged promptly even if they cannot be answered immediately. Secondly, it is seldom possible to give too much information, provided that it is lawful to give it.

There is a prevalent tendency among public employees to avoid candour which gets departments of government described as inert and unenterprising. Information should be volunteered without hesitation, not only to establish good faith, but also as a test of its accuracy and to separate rumour from fact. Thirdly, there must be consistency in dealing with members of the public, without which there can be no real justice.

The public official lives in a world where precision of thought and speech is valued for its own sake. The journalist naturally distrusts carefully worded press releases and tries to instill some life into it with "background material." The result is often a perfunctory reference to the subject matter, if not complete distortion, and it is certain that the official will protect himself in the future by saying less, or perhaps nothing at all. If public officials had some experience in journalism, and journalists in the public service, it is probable that the former would be more forthcoming and lucid and the latter more judicious in the provision and use of information, respectively.

As the independence and security of the service becomes more strongly rooted in the traditions of impartiality and loyalty to the state, free from partisan bias, the facelessness and namelessness of the civil servant becomes more alarming to the press and public alike. With the increased regulation of private activities by the state, civil servants as a class tend to be blamed for its disagreeable aspects. Nevertheless the trend will continue. There is a very real danger that the tendencies which now seem to divide the public from its servants will become more marked and excite more feeling. All the resources of democracy will be deployed against the advance of bureaucracy in the invidious sense of that hard-worked word. We can only hope that the best traditions of public service will not be compromised in the struggle and that a fully and fairly informed public will steadily survey the scene.

—J. STUART STEPHEN.

Position Classification and the Political Executive—A Study in Value Conflict. Carl D. McMurray. *Personnel Administration*. May-June, 1961.

Students of personnel administration are beginning to realize that the commitment by personnel administration to the logic of the scientific management movement and the search for neutral, or mechanistic control devices may create open conflict with re-

formers who seek to assure the primacy of the elected chief executive.

Rather than persist in the claim of "neutrality" for personnel management devices, we should examine the value orientation of these techniques and the limits imposed upon them as they impede public policy commitments of the elected chief executive.

A basic premise is this: The classification system is not an isolated administrative control; rather, it is part of a political complex composed of legislative, administrative, and judicial activity carried on by people with diverse interests; and standardized treatment of public employees is not a value held in common by these interests.

A classification system provides a rational basis for describing jobs but its techniques are designed to maximize dependence on standardized, or uniform, treatment of classes of employees. It is inevitable that conflicts should arise because the political complex embraces many values which are minimized by standardization. The advocates of those political values may be expected to exert pressures to limit uniform application of the technique when preferential treatment is essential to the attainment of their values.

A problem that must be faced by personnel administrators in a public jurisdiction: What is the role of the personnel management technique in the political complex?—HARRIS SKIDDELL.

Management Looks at Consultants. Charles L. Quittmeyer. *Management Review*. March, 1961.

Are management consultants worth their salt? Many executives would answer with a resounding "Yes!"—but others aren't so sure, and some are convinced that a consultant's services are less than worthless.

There are between 30,000 and 40,000 practitioners in the management consultant field. Services available include the following: general problems; financial problems; production problems; marketing problems; office management problems; personnel problems. And if you don't have a problem, they'll be glad to come around and try to find one for you.

The American Management Association sponsored a survey of companies throughout the nation to ascertain from the managers their opinion of services provided by consultants. Respondents to a survey question-

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

naire listed the following as primary reasons for hiring consultants:

1. Desire for an outside viewpoint
2. Lack of skills or experience among regular employees
3. Lack of time for regular employees to handle the job
4. Need to do jobs that occurred too infrequently to justify hiring additional specialists.

Clients report a rather high degree of satisfaction with services of consultants and with prices paid in relation to results. Although management generally is convinced as to the capability of consultants, about a quarter of the respondents indicate the belief that "a substantial number" of consultants are fakes. This emphasizes the need for improvement in the management consultant field and for careful selection, wise utilization, and adequate training of consultants.

A vote of confidence in consultants is indicated by the fact that 88% of respondents indicated that they would hire the same consultant again if confronted with the same circumstances and problems. (Cartoon presentations of the complaints executives and consultants level at each other are included.)

—DOROTHY E. EVERETT.

The Personnel Paradox: People Seek Jobs While Jobs Seek People. Robert M. Smith. *Office Management and American Business*. April, 1961.

"Office automation can be expected to reduce clerical job openings by another four million within the next five years." "Automation will automatically create more clerical jobs." With growing sophistication in the use of computers and electronic data processing equipment, the controversy continues over the impact of automation on the clerical job market in the sixties. Personnel administrators should not permit themselves to be stampeded in either direction by wild scares on one hand, or by assurances that all will be more or less as it always has been, on the other.

The elimination of four million clerical jobs in the next decade is a very remote possibility. The chance that there will be far more applicants for office jobs than there will be jobs to fill, and that the individual qualities needed for office workers will be entirely different and much more difficult to secure is not. Computers do create jobs to

replace the ones they eliminate. But here is where the paradox occurs.

The jobs created are so very different in content from the ones eliminated that it is doubtful whether the same people can do them. A more specialized, highly trained office staff will be required at every level in tomorrow's concern. Jobs will be less monotonous and routine, but employees will be required to have a higher degree of judgment, intelligence, and specialized knowledge. The present shortage of trained programmers reflects the inadequate training in mathematical and language skills today.

If an electronic data processing installation is planned, training, testing, and selection procedures should be promptly and carefully reviewed to ensure the building of a cadre of the type of workers that the office will need for an effective operation.—GEORGE R. McDONALD.

Profits in Prose. Langley Carleton Keyes. *Harvard Business Review*. January-February, 1961.

"The biggest untapped source of net profits for American business lies in the sprawling, edgeless area of written communication where waste cries out for management action." Though management has tried one panacea after another, executives must face up to their own responsibility for the written-communications hole in the corporate moneybag.

Examples of "how not to write" are common among business communications. Though a vice president made clearer, easier, and quicker a vacation memo he edited, his real trouble was that "he had never trained his subordinate to write clearly, vigorously, and concisely." Contrasted to the executive who *can* write but who has not trained his subordinates in the art of communication are the chief executives who themselves "start changing words when they haven't the dimmest idea of what they're doing." Copy "that wooed the public like a love song" suffered a superior's blue-pencilitis. A utility president was responsible for copy as "dead as a boiled duck." Ten top-echelon employees of a giant utility company at 10 P.M. wearily agreed unanimously upon a press release, patterned in the heavy, formalized-but-trying-to-be-folksy company style crystallized and immortalized by the company's late president.

Common among all situations cited is that in each instance there is someone

present with the ability to write, or edit, with clearness, force, and freshness. But because management men who judge any written communication by intuition or personal preference instead of with real, trained knowledge or understanding outnumber, outrank, or circumvent those with writing abilities, the result is wasteful and disastrous. A solution of the communications problem may depend "on how aware our executives can and will become of the differences in the language they hear and read every day of their lives."

To be aware of how something is expressed in writing is achieved only by training in reading. Intelligent and appreciative readers are constantly in training to appraise communications. Those who join such a group do what they can to overcome the written communication problems of business. Their "intelligently determined, trained, individual effort is the only solution."

The challenge to become an alert reader in order to become a competent editor and a better writer may be approached by reading with awareness and alertness a "one-foot shelf of books." The subject matter of three deals with English usage and prose style. The remaining ten "offer models of simple, clear prose styles that are directly transferable to business communication uses." So, if you seek the "pot of gold," you have heard one way to reach it. "Now it's up to you!" (Article includes listing of books and several humorous illustrations.)—HELEN THOMPSON.

Abstracters for 1961

The following members of the Public Personnel Association have accepted the editor's

invitation to serve as abstracters of articles for the "Personnel Literature" section of *Public Personnel Review* during 1961:

Joan M. Cole, City of Chicago Civil Service Commission.

J. Fred Dawe, Civil Service Commission of Canada, Ottawa.

Dorothy E. Everett, University of California, Berkeley.

Lew Fay, Personnel Director, San Diego, California, City Civil Service Commission.

Loretta K. Fukuda, Recruiting and Examining Supervisor, Hawaii Department of Civil Service, Honolulu.

Babette G. Goldsmith, Civil Service Examiner, San Francisco City and County Civil Service Commission.

Herbert L. Homan, Recruitment Officer, Career Service Authority, Denver.

Genevieve M. Lind, Training Officer, Oregon State Civil Service Commission, Salem.

George R. McDonald, Portland (Oregon) Civil Service Board.

George D. McGuinness, Chief Fiscal and Personnel Officer, New Jersey Department of Labor and Industry, Trenton.

Ruth L. Olson, Bureau Personnel Officer, Bureau of Aeronautics, Department of the Navy, Washington, D. C.

Harris Skiddell, Philadelphia Personnel Department.

J. Stuart Stephen, Director of Personnel, Province of Ontario Civil Service Commission, Toronto.

Helen Thompson, Assistant Personnel Director, City of Atlanta, Georgia.

GRIFFENHAGEN-KROEGER, INC.

The merger of two long-established firms offers
60 years of combined experience

Personnel policy and methods • Job classification
Compensation plans • Training • Evaluation • Executive
Selection • Testing • Group insurance

64 Pine Street
San Francisco, Cal.

Other Offices: Los Angeles, Chicago,
New York, Philadelphia, Washington, D. C.

Public Personnel Review Index

VOLUME 22, 1961

THE FOLLOWING index contains authors and subject matter references combined in one alphabet. The numerals at the end of each entry give the page on which that entry appears. Page numbers of the four issues in Volume 22 are as follows:

Volume 22—1961

| <i>Issue</i> | <i>Month</i> | <i>Pages</i> |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| No. 1 | January | 1-80 |
| No. 2 | April | 81-144 |
| No. 3 | July | 145-204 |
| No. 4 | October | 205-296 |

A

Abstracts of Personnel Articles, 74-79, 139-144, 191-198, 284-290

Applications

"Stemming the Tide of Personnel Paper Work," Bernice Fry Mitchel, 160

See also Personnel Opinions, 117

Around the Personnel World, 50-54, 265-268

Ashman, Ward. See Personnel Opinions

Ault, Orvill E. See Personnel Opinions

Award for Merit, PPA, 44-47

B

Batson, Eleanor R. See Batson, Robert J.

Batson, Robert J., and Batson, Eleanor R.—"Making the Most of Campus Recruiting," 249

Bell, James R.—"Putting Perspective into Suggestion Systems," 214

Bibliographies

"Recruitment for the Public Service," 64

"Administration of Personnel Programs in Underdeveloped Countries," 134

"Terminology of Personnel," 188

"A Basic Bibliography in Public Personnel Administration," 232

Biren, Robert. See Personnel Opinions

Blum, Harvey O.—"Democratic Ratings in Civil Service Selection," 109

Bodnar, Ernest B. See Personnel Opinions

Book and Pamphlet Notes, 63-64, 132-134, 186-188, 281-282

Book Reviews

Adams, Walter, and Garraty, John A.—"Is the World Our Campus?" Review by James R. Bell, 124

Beaumont, Richard A., and Tower, James W.—"Executive Retirement and Effective Management." Review by E. B. Shultz, 280

Cleveland, Harlan; Mangone, Gerard J., and Adams, John Clarke—"The Overseas Americans." Review by Ellsworth Wolf-sperger, 123

Famularo, J. J.—"Supervisors in Action." Review by Frank P. Sherwood, 278

Hegarty, Edward J.—"How To Build Job Enthusiasm." Review by Donald S. Mac-rae, 129

Henry, Laurin L.—"Presidential Transi-tions." Review by Lynton K. Caldwell, 180

Hodgetts, J. E., and Corbett, D. C. (Eds.)—"Canadian Public Administration: A Book of Readings." Review by H. M. Morri-son, 125

International City Managers' Association—"Municipal Personnel Administration" (6th ed.). Review by Foster B. Roser, 126

Jucius, Michael J., and Schlender, William E.—"Elements of Managerial Action." Review by Charles H. Bentley, 278

Lindveit, Earl W.—"Scientists in Govern-ment." Review by Edward McCrensky, 183

Merrihue, Willard V.—"Managing by Com-munication." Review by James D. Keyes, 129

Page, Thomas—"State Personnel Reorgani-zation in Illinois." Review by Frederick C. Mosher, 182

Slichter, Sumner H., Healy, James J., and Livernash, E. Robert—"The Impact of Collective Bargaining on Management." Review by E. A. Shelley, 184

Spates, Thomas G.—"Human Values Where People Work." Review by Miller Lee Martin, 130

Strauss, George, and Sayles, Leonard B.—"Personnel: The Human Problems of Management." Review by Paul M. Camp, 127

Zapoleon, Marguerite Wykoff—"Occupational Planning for Women." Review by Agnes A. Milhoan, 185

C

Canada

"The Federal Civil Service in Canada," Samuel H. S. Hughes, 5

"Canadian Provincial Developments," Hugh M. Morrison, 10

"The Challenge of a Career in the Public Service," Brian MacBride, 224

"Labour Relations in Canadian Municipalities," George W. Noble, 255

City Government

"Unions in City Government: The Cincinnati Story," W. D. Heisel and J. P. Santa-Emma, 35

"Labour Relations in Canadian Municipalities," George W. Noble, 255

Civil Service

"The Federal Civil Service in Canada," Samuel H. S. Hughes, 5

"U. S. Civil Service Looks Ahead," Roger W. Jones, 13

See also Personnel Administration

Clague, Ewan—"U. S. Manpower in the 1960's," 162

Clinton, James M.—"Personnel Administration in Turkey," 265

Consultants, Personnel

"The Public Personnel Consultant Abroad: Lessons From Experience," Felix A. Ni-gro, 99

See also Bibliographies, 134

Corson, John J.—"What the Personnel Man Should Know About Organization," 209

D

DeWald, Franklin K.—"A Personnel Man Crosses the Potomac," 154

E

Editorials, 2, 82, 146, 206

Engel, H. M.—"Administrative Adjudication in New York State," 262

Evaluation

"Democratic Ratings in Civil Service Selection," Harvey O. Blum, 109

F

Fay, Lew—"A Manpower Utilization Quiz," 172. See also Personnel Opinions

Fee Requirements, Filing

See Personnel Opinions, 117

Ferguson, Howard—"Nation-wide Competition and Professional Pay," 168

Flanagan, John C.—"Use and Abuse of Intelligence Tests," 24

G

Gable, Richard W.—"The Public Service in Iran," 29. See also Our Readers Write, 200-201

H

Haines, Eleanor—"Getting Dividends From an Employee Suggestion System," 112

Health Programs

"The Federal Civil Service in Canada," Samuel H. S. Hughes, 5

"Canadian Provincial Developments," Hugh M. Morrison, 10

"U. S. Federal Personnel Management," O. Glenn Stahl, 17

Healy, Patrick, Jr. See Personnel Opinions

Heisel, W. D., and Santa-Emma, J. P.—"Unions in City Government; The Cincinnati Story," 35

Hughes, Samuel H. S.—"The Federal Civil Service in Canada," 5

Human Relations

"The Effect of Tests," Forbes E. McCann, 93

I

Interchange of Personnel

See Personnel Opinions, 269

Iran, Public Service

"The Public Service in Iran," Richard W. Gable, 29

See also Our Readers Write, 199-201

J

Jones, Roger W.—"U. S. Civil Service Looks Ahead," 13

K

Kroeger, Louis J.—"Two Case Studies in Salary Setting," 39. See also Personnel Opinions

L

Legislation

See "Personnel Panorama—1960," 5-23

Levitt, Arthur—"Putting Purpose Into Personnel," 105

Litchfield, Edward H.—"Apostasy of a Merit Man," 85

Literature, Public Personnel

Editorial, 206

"Public Personnel Literature: The Last Decade," Paul P. Van Riper, 226

"A Basic Bibliography in Public Personnel Administration," 232

See also Bibliographies

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

- Long, Lillian D.** See *Personnel Opinions*
Lowe, Winfield. See *Our Readers Write*, 199-200

M

- MacBride, Brian**—"The Challenge of a Career in the Public Service," 224
McCann, Forbes E.—"The Effect of Tests," 93
Macy, John W., Jr.—"Public Service and Understanding," 221. See also *Personnel Opinions*
Management and Personnel
"U. S. Federal Personnel Management," O. Glenn Stahl, 17
"Apostasy of a Merit Man," Edward H. Litchfield, 85
"Putting Purpose Into Personnel," Arthur Levitt, 105
"U. S. Manpower in the 1960's," Ewan Clague, 162
Manpower Needs
"U. S. Manpower in the 1960's," Ewan Clague, 162
"Making the Most of Campus Recruiting," Robert J. Batson and Eleanor R. Batson, 249
Mitchel, Bernice Fry—"Stemming the Tide of Personnel Paper Work," 160
Mitchell, James M. See *Personnel Opinions*
Morrison, Hugh M.—"Canadian Provincial Developments," 10
Muñoz-Marín, Luis—"Democracy and Revolution in Puerto Rico," 218
Murray, William J. See *Personnel Opinions*

N

- Nigro, Felix A.**—"The Public Personnel Consultant Abroad: Lessons From Experience," 99
Noble, George W.—"Labour Relations in Canadian Municipalities," 255
Notes and Quotes, 202

O

- Ocheltree, Keith**—"State and Local Developments," 20
Organization
"What the Personnel Man Should Know About Organization," John J. Corson, 209
Our Readers Write, 199-201
Overseas Personnel Administration
"The Public Personnel Consultant Abroad: Lessons From Experience," Felix A. Nigro, 99
See also *Bibliographies*, 134-138

P

- Palm, Roy A.** See *Personnel Opinions*
Patterson, C. R. See *Personnel Opinions*
Personnel Administration
"Personnel Panorama—1960," 5-23
"The Public Service in Iran," Richard W. Gable, 29
"Apostasy of a Merit Man," Edward H. Litchfield, 85
"The Public Personnel Consultant Abroad: Lessons From Experience," Felix A. Nigro, 99
"Putting Purpose Into Personnel," Arthur Levitt, 105
Editorial, 146
"Appraising Personnel Administration," Austin J. Tobin, 149
"A Personnel Man Crosses the Potomac," Franklin K. DeWald, 154
"Personnel Administration in Turkey," James M. Clinton, 265

Personnel Opinions

- "Is it desirable as a matter of broad public policy to facilitate mobility in the public service by enabling employees to transfer retirement credits from one retirement system to another?" Comments by A. A. Weinberg; Ward Ashman; Patrick Healy, Jr.; and Evelyn Sholund, 55
"In your opinion, what are the relative advantages and disadvantages of charging applicants a fee when they file applications for civil service examinations?" Comments by John B. Wentz; Roy A. Palm; William J. Murray; Lew Fay; and Ernest B. Bodnar, 117
"What are the tangible earmarks of being a 'professional' in the public personnel field and how can they be evaluated?" Comments by David M. Wilkison; Lillian D. Long; Louis J. Kroeger; James M. Mitchell; and C. R. Patterson, 174
"Is it desirable, as a matter of policy, to enable public employees to work for other governmental jurisdictions for a limited period of time on a leave of absence basis?" Comments by John W. Macy, Jr.; Orvill E. Ault; Ralph D. Tive; Robert Biren; and William J. Ronan, 269
Personnel Panorama—1960
Parts I-V, 5-23
Professionalization of Personnel
Editorial, 2
See also *Personnel Opinions*, 174-179
Public Personnel Association
"Public Personnel Association Business—1960," Kenneth O. Warner, 44
"Public Service and Understanding," John W. Macy, Jr., 221

Puerto Rico

- "Democracy and Revolution in Puerto Rico," Luis Muñoz-Marín, 218
 "Public Service and Understanding," John W. Macy, Jr., 221

R**Ratings**

- "Democratic Ratings in Civil Service Selection," Harvey O. Blum, 109

Recruitment

- "Making the Most of Campus Recruiting," Robert J. Batson and Eleanor R. Batson, 249

See also Bibliographies, 64-73

Retirement, Transfer of

See Personnel Opinions, 55-62

Ronan, William J. See Personnel Opinions

S**Salaries**

- "Two Case Studies in Salary Setting," Louis J. Kroeger, 39

"Nation-wide Competition and Professional Pay," Howard Ferguson, 168

Santa-Emma, J. P. See Heisel, W. D.

Selection

- "Use and Abuse of Intelligence Tests," John C. Flanagan, 24

"The Effect of Tests," Forbes E. McCann, 93

"Democratic Ratings in Civil Service Selection," Harvey O. Blum, 109

Editorial, 146

Sholund, Evelyn. See Personnel Opinions

Stahl, O. Glenn—"U. S. Federal Personnel Management," 17

State Personnel Programs

- "State and Local Developments," Keith Ocheltree, 20

"Putting Purpose Into Personnel," Arthur Levitt, 105

"Administrative Adjudication in New York State," H. M. Engel, 262

State vs. Federal Administration

- "A Personnel Man Crosses the Potomac," Franklin K. DeWald, 154

Stockard, James G.—"Two Decades of Federal Training Experience," 90

Suggestion Systems

- "Getting Dividends From an Employee Suggestion System," Eleanor Haines, 112
 "Putting Perspective into Suggestion Systems," James R. Bell, 214

T**Terminology, Personnel**

See Bibliographies, 188-190

Testing

- "Use and Abuse of Intelligence Tests," John C. Flanagan, 24

"The Effect of Tests," Forbes E. McCann, 93

Tive, Ralph D. See Personnel Opinions

Tobin, Austin J.—"Appraising Personnel Administration," 149

Training

- "Two Decades of Federal Training Experience," James G. Stockard, 90

"Administrative Adjudication in New York State," H. M. Engel, 262

Transition

- "U. S. Federal Personnel Management," O. Glenn Stahl, 17

Editorial, 82

Turkey, Public Service

- "Personnel Administration in Turkey," James M. Clinton, 265

U**Unions**

- "Unions in City Government: The Cincinnati Story," W. D. Heisel and J. P. Santa-Emma, 35

"Labour Relations in Canadian Municipalities," George W. Noble, 255

V

- Van Riper, Paul P.—"Public Personnel Literature: The Last Decade," 226

W

- Warner, Kenneth O.—"Making Personnel a Profession," 2. "Public Personnel Association Business—1960," 44. "A New Personnel Frontier," 82. "Pursuit of Excellence in Personnel Administration," 146

Weinberg, A. A. See Personnel Opinions

Wentz, John B. See Personnel Opinions

Wilkison, David M. See Personnel Opinions

Where, Oh Where Is "April, 1960" ? ? ?

Your back copies of **Public Personnel Review** contain a wealth of valuable reference material for future use. Put them in a permanent loose-leaf binder so that you can find each issue quickly when you want it!

Now you can get handsome custom-made binders for your back copies, stamped "Public Personnel Review" in gold on the cover and backbone. **Each binder holds four issues.** Prices are as follows:

| | |
|-----------------------|-------------|
| Single binder | \$3.50 each |
| Two binders..... | \$3.00 each |
| Three or more binders | \$2.75 each |

Save by ordering two or more binders now for back issues and current use. If you send a check with your order, deduct 10%.

Public Personnel Association

1313 East 60th Street

Chicago 37, Illinois

17

PPA Publications Can Help You If You Have Them When You Need Them!

The following are only a few of the many PPA publications that can help you to do a better job, build sound personnel practices, and avoid costly mistakes. The new PPA publications catalog lists more than 35 publications of value to personnel people.

The Public Personnel Agency and the Chief Executive—A Symposium.
Thomas Page, Editor (\$2.50)*

Tips Worth Tapping. Lempi Matthews, Editor (\$3.00)*

Improving Multiple-Choice Test Items—A Manual for Examiners.
Ollie A. Jensen. (\$3.00)*

Recruiting Ideas That Get Results. Bernice Fry Mitchel. (\$2.50)*

The Essay Test in Public Personnel Selection.
Bernard Berger, James McCormack, Harry Reiner, and Charles J. Setzer. (\$2.50)*

Pricing Management Jobs in Government. Richard M. Paget. (\$2.50)*

Employee Performance Appraisal Re-examined.
Clifford E. Jurgensen, Felix M. Lopez, Jr., and Kenneth E. Richards. (\$2.50)*

Building a Management Development Program Through Planning and Controls. Preston P. Le Breton. (\$2.50)*

* Prices shown above are list prices. PPA member prices, quoted in the publications catalog, are lower.

|| Send for the new PPA publications catalog contain- ||
|| ing full list of all publications on Testing, Selection, ||
|| Pay and Classification, Employee Relations, and ||
|| Topics of General Interest. ||

PUBLIC PERSONNEL ASSOCIATION

1313 East 60th Street

Chicago 37, Illinois

